

**2011
HAWAI‘I COUNTY
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION**

5th Session

Thursday, August 11, 2011

County Council Chambers
25 Aupuni Street
Hilo, Hawai‘i 96720

CALL TO ORDER:

CHR. SIRACUSA: We do have quorum even though Bo Kahui hasn't arrived yet, so I'm calling the meeting to order. This is the 5th session of the Hawai‘i County Redistricting Commission and we are meeting here in Hilo today. I will start out by taking the roll call.

ATTENDANCE:

Present: Mr. Joseph Carvalho, Commissioner
Mr. Patrick Kahawaiolaa, Commissioner
Mr. Craig "Bo" Kahui, Commissioner
Mr. Dru Mamo Kanuha, Commissioner
Mr. Jeffrey Melrose, Commissioner
Mr. Mike Middlesworth, Commissioner
Ms. René Siracusa, Chair
Ms. Valerie Poindexter, Commissioner
Ms. Linda Ugalde, Commissioner

Also Present: Michael Udovic, Deputy Corporation Counsel
Jamae K. K. Kawauchi, County Clerk
Pat Nakamoto, Elections Program Administrator
Cori Saiki, Elections Assistant
Shyla, Senior Elections Clerk
Nora Avenue, Administrative Assistant to Clerk
Maile David, Legislative Specialist
Manu Hanano, Council Aide in Waimea
Leslie "Lali" Robinson, Council Aide in Kona
Karen Eoff, Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

CHR. SIRACUSA: Do I have a motion to approve the minutes?

Mr. Middlesworth moved to approve the minutes of the July 28, 2011 Hawai'i County Redistricting Commission meeting. Seconded by Mr. Kanuha and carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiola'a, Kahui, Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth, Poindexter, Ugalde, and Chair Siracusa.
Noes: None.
Absent: None.

STATEMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON AGENDA ITEMS

CHR. SIRACUSA: The first person who signed up to speak is Patrice McDonald representing Fern Forest, Eden Rock, Hawaiian Acres, Kapoho and Kapua Farm Lots. You are representing all of these community associations? You live in all of them? Okay and you're going to be talking about the maps. Go ahead please. State your name, and please speak into the mic so we can all hear you clearly.

PATRICE McDONALD

(At this time Patrice McDonald came forward to address members of the Commission.)

PATRICE McDONALD: Very simple question. All these communities have gotten in touch with me because they're not able to access the website, or the maps, in those particular communities, and they asked me to come down to find out what was going on, because they cannot read on their computers any of this information. That's it.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Did you notice that there's a handout up on the table there that gives a step-by-step?

PATRICE McDONALD: And I've sat here right in the room trying to do it and we still can't log in. That's it. Thank you.

MR. MELROSE: Can I ask you a question? I'm just interested to know---

MR. UDOVICH: This is only statements from the public.

MR. MELROSE: I'm sorry.

CHR. SIRACUSA: If you will be around until we get to the Maps part of the agenda then Commissioner Melrose can call you up to ask a question. It's not this part. No you can leave it on; somebody else will be coming up to talk anyway. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Okay, the next person I have is Arthur Varady representing himself; you did not put down what agenda item you are going to be addressing. That is a requirement.

ARTHUR VARADY

(At this time Arthur Varady came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. VARADY: That's not what she said. She said I can speak on (inaudible).

CHR. SIRACUSA: Go on. It's on now. Please speak into the mic.

MR. VARADY: Okay, my name is Arthur Varady. I like to write lists of things, and what I do is I write lists of some of the things that I see going on, some of the things that I do best, and I'm referring to my list from last time. What I do best actually is be a citizen, I'm also a patriot, I'm also an RN, have been for thirty-eight (38) years. Writing is probably the best thing I do. I can teach, I can communicate, I'm a student, I can coordinate things and I can see something funny in virtually anything. I keep wondering though what's going on in Kapoho with the recent downing of thousands and thousands of papaya trees. I wonder what's going on with the map, I'm wonder what you guys are going to be doing with the map. I keep wondering why this island is one county and not two. To me, it seems that there should be an east Hawai'i and a west Hawai'i. This is comments right? I can comment.

CHR. SIRACUSA: That's not an agenda item.

MR. VARADY: Okay, but apparently I can comment---

CHR. SIRACUSA: And that's not our purview either.

MR. VARADY: But I can comment on anything is what I was told.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We have no say about the island being two parts; two districts or two counties or one, because that was decided by a vote of the people of this island.

MR. VARADY: The people of this island, it seems to me, keep getting screwed by the politicians of this island who keep screwing them. I am a member of this community as much as you are, as much as anybody else here is a member of this community, okay. And I keep wondering what is going on as far as redistricting goes; and I realize that I'm running out of time. As far as redistricting goes, I would like to see Mr. Yagong's district combined into Mr. Yoshimotos's district

CHR. SIRACUSA: Are you aware that they are not contiguous, there are two districts separating them?

MR. VARADY: I am.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Just clarifying.

MR. VARADY: I am. I would like to see my district stay as it is. I would like to see agriculture stay agriculture; I would like to see urban--if you can call Pāhoa urban--then I would like to see Pāhoa stay pretty much as it is. I have got a lot of ideas, and I'm running out of time at this particular meeting, but I just don't want to see the people of this island keep getting screwed. That is it.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you, and your time is up. Our next speaker is Richard Bidleman, speaking on behalf of Friends of Puna's future. The subject matter is agenda item, Communication 30.

RICHARD BIDLEMAN

(At this time Richard Bidleman came forward to address members of the Commission.)

RICHARD BIDLEMAN: I think Karen gave you copies of the testimony that I am about to make today, but I want to read it publically, and I also want to make a correction. I sent it in to Karen, but then realized that Kurtistown is misspelled in the document, and I corrected that.

My name is Richard Bidleman. I am submitting testimony today on behalf of Friends of Puna's Future, based on the response to the plans prepared and made available to the public by the Elections Board prior to this meeting. We have reviewed all nine of the publicly available plans, and as residents of the district of Puna and members of the public, we offer the following comments:

Puna is and has been for many years a very distinct community, bound by many common needs and objectives, both political and cultural. Many residents of Puna are bound together by a similar agricultural/rural way of life. Our residents either live in one of the many agriculturally zoned subdivisions created prior to statehood, or in small villages like Pahoa, Kea'au and Volcano. Our needs and concerns differ greatly from those residents who live in the city of Hilo. Likewise, our needs and concerns differ greatly from those residents who live south of Hawai'i Volcanoes National Park, in Ka'u, where geography and climate are so drastically different from our own, creating a very different way of life.

For these reasons, in our opinion, the various communities of Puna deserve to be represented as a single entity. This committee has already suggested that the notion of splitting communities between districts runs counter to their mandate, and they have expressed a willingness to reject any plan that does so. Indeed, much of the public dismay in Puna that resulted from the 2000 redistricting effort arose due to the inclusion of a part of upper Puna in the South Hilo District 3, and much of the Highway 11 corridor in the Ka'u District 6. Many residents in those communities felt that their voices were not heard and their concerns deemed secondary. We in Puna would like to avoid such an outcome this time around, especially given the vast influx of new residents to Puna which has created a deviation in the current District 5 that is well above 20%. Puna is coming into its own and we wish to be represented fairly.

As stated earlier, we have reviewed all of the publicly available plans. We are strenuously opposed to all plans that try to create a district extending from South Hilo into upper Puna. Likewise, we object to Plan 8, as it creates a gerrymandered District 5 that runs counter to the stated guidelines and goals of this committee. We would like to endorse Plan 9 as being the kind of redistricting scheme the people of Puna deserve. Plan 9 creates a District 5 that runs from Hawaiian Paradise Park down Highway 130 to the ocean, including all points east. Also, a District 4 that includes the towns of Kea'au, Pahoa and Volcano, along with Kurtistown and Mountain View on the south side of Highway 11. These are all communities with similar needs and similar lifestyles. We are all a single community, the community of Puna.

Therefore, on behalf of all of the members of "Friend's of Puna's Future," we would urge you to consider and adopt Plan 9 or any plan similar to it, or base your final decision upon the broad strokes outlined by Plan 9, with regard to Puna.

CHR. SIRACUSA: The next testifier is James Weatherford, representing himself speaking on Draft Alternate Plans.

MR. CARVALHO: Excuse me, madam Chair. I think our last testifier went way over the three minute limit. We have a lot of work to do, so could we limit it to three minutes, please.

JAMES WEATHERFORD

(At this time James Weatherford came forward to address members of the Commission.)

JAMES WEATHERFORD: Good evening Madam Chair and members of the Commission. Thank you for your work on the task on hand. We will be addressing a specific agenda item. I did go on line and create an account and logged on and worked on the software awhile. Being very familiar with Puna, and to a lesser degree with Hilo, I tried a few scenarios using locations in those areas as starting points. One goal I had was to have two complete districts in Puna and I think that needs to happen. As I worked online with the software for awhile, two things became clear to me. The first, which I had already suspected, while the numbers are there, the population distribution and community boundaries make it difficult, but not impossible, to get two reasonable districts in Puna. The second, which I should have suspected, but did not, was my own ignorance about West Hawai'i communities which I would be applying to the district boundaries on the other side of the island, and the equal ignorance that someone over there would be applying to working on Puna and Hilo boundaries. With that said, there are among some of the nine plans, some common problems that exist. They all deal with the community that I'm most familiar with, near where I live. I would encourage all of you to really take that concept on board.

Plans number 1, number 2, number 3, number 7, and number 9 all violate the principal of not dividing communities of interest. The others may also, but I know that those five plans do. With Plans 1, 2, and 3, they just chop Hawaiian Paradise Park in half or a big piece out of it. But Plans number 7 and number 9 use Highway 130 as the principal district boundary. This is an unacceptable division of communities because part of both Hawaiian Paradise Park and part of Maku'u Hawaiian Homelands are on the mauka side of Highway 130, as well as on the makai

side. Particularly the HPP division; many people do not realize, but they are part up there. Certainly, that is a community of interest, particularly considering many issues that the County and that association are going through right now. Plan number 8, although it may have some other problems that I did not yet dig up, does not split Hawaiian Paradise Park, nor does it split the Maku‘u Hawaiian Homelands, as do numbers 7 and 9. I just ask you to take these points into consideration, and I look forward to looking at other plans put on the web site. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. We have a fifth testifier, on Communication 29. It looks like J. Tanimoto.

JO JO TANIMOTO

(At this time Jo Jo Tanimoto came forward to address members of the Commission.)

JO JO TANIMOTO: Actually it’s Jo Jo, so I just put J. Tanimoto. I come from Kawaihae Hawaiian Homelands, and I just wanted to say that I’m one of those that read this on the computer, all of the directions on how to view a map. But I cannot talk about anything else, because I no can view the map. So I would like some help with that. In Kawaihae, our closest office is the Waimea office, but that is away from us. We are kind of isolated where we are, so if I can pass this so I can see what you guys are doing, it would help a lot.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Are there any other people who would like to testify before we go on to the rest of the agenda?

COMMUNICATIONS

COMM. 28: PUBLIC HEARING DATES AND VENUES

Memo from Commission Chair, René Siracusa, dated August 4, 2011, regarding discussion of public hearing dates and venues.

Ms. Poindexter moved to close file on
COMM. 28. Seconded by Ms. Ugalde.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We have been presented with a list that Karen put together; a calendar. I believe it is also up there on the table. It shows each district, and their councilmember, the district name and the commissioner representing that district, the locations that Karen has found for us to have our meetings and the dates and hearing times. I noticed that for Districts 3 and 4, they are going to be on the same day, from 2:00 to 4:00 p.m. in Keaau, and from 9:00 to 11:00 am in Hilo. That will work; it gives us all time for lunch too. What is a little problematic, and maybe Valerie and Joe can provide some input on it, is whether October 21st, if we have a meeting at Papaaloe Gym from 9:00 a.m. to 11:00 a.m., can we get up to Waimea Community Center and still have lunch, by 1:30?

MS. POINDEXTER: On the 21st or do you mean the 1st? That is pretty tight.

MR. CARVALHO: I agree, that is pretty tight. If we can push it maybe to 2:00 p.m. or 2:30 p.m.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Karen, do you think there is a possibility that we can push the Kohala meeting up by an hour?

MS. POINDEXTER: I think 2:00 p.m. would suffice.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Let the record show that Bo Kahui has arrived. This is a proposed schedule, I understand that; that is why I am asking if on those days that we are doubling up, if those times are feasible.

MR. MELROSE: Can I ask a question? As it relates to those double days, is the County providing a lunch for us? Who can answer that question? What I'm looking for is that if we simply had Bentos and we move, then we don't all have to sit around a table and order food. That's probably not even good for us to do as a group. But if we were simply provided lunch as we go, then we can eat something and move on. It may not take us as much time. In that past how was that handled?

MS. NAKAMOTO: In the past the Commissioners got lunch on their own, and brought back the receipts and got reimbursed for their meals. We can do as you say. We can order Bentos and have lunch available for you folks after the Papaaloa Gym meeting.

MR. MELROSE: My suggestion would be to do that, simply because it is easier and then we could sit wherever. It's just an easier way to do it than to go find a restaurant, sit down, and get a receipt and all that. So if that is possible to do from procurement perspective, I think it would ease the process.

MS. NAKAMOTO: Yes, it is possible

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Get Bentos from someplace, and we will eat either after or before.

MS. POINDEXTER: I would suggest doing it in Waimea because 11:00 a.m. is pretty early. Give us time to get up to Waimea, get there early and we can have our Bentos or whatever.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We also have to look at these dates. How do these dates fit in with everybody's schedules? I would like to give everyone a few minutes to look at their calendars with relation to this proposed public hearing dates and venues.

MS. POINDEXTER: I know I wouldn't be able to make three of them; the 6th, the 11th and the 12th, because I'll be out of State for those two weeks.

MR. MELROSE: There is not much we can do about that.

MS. POINDEXTER: Yes, I just wanted to let you know I won't be able to do those three.

MR. MELROSE: Are we going to meet other than this during that period in time? Are there other meetings that we are going to have?

CHR. SIRACUSA: I think we are going to have our regular meetings.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: We have to have our regular meetings because these are hearings. We can't do anything, we are just listening to people.

MR. MELROSE: Do we want to wait until we are done with these hearings before we start with our next meeting? Let's hear some thoughts. This is a lot of time on our hands, and if you are putting in other ones---And I want to disclose to Commissioners that starting the 21st of this month, I teach a class on Tuesdays and Thursdays at the University from 2:00 to 3:30 p.m. So I'm not going to make the next meeting and I probably won't make other ones if we stay on the Thursday schedule. This doesn't bother me because I can do it in the evening time. It's okay. But unless it's really critical, I will try not to miss the class. Just so you know my schedule, Tuesdays and Thursdays at this time.

MS. POINDEXTER: Is there an option to look at changing our meeting day to Wednesdays? I feel that Jeff has a lot of input that is very valuable so I would like to see him in attendance as much as possible.

MR. KANUHA: I have no problems with Wednesdays.

MR. KAHUI: It's not a problem for me either.

MR. CARVALHO: Fine with me.

MS. UGALDE: Or me.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We can deal with that when we get to the end of our meeting. But that's good to know that it's okay with everybody to make that move. So let's get back to this proposed public hearing dates and venues. Does anybody have any major problems here?

MR. CARVALHO: I have a question, maybe directed to Patrick. From the previous talk story meetings, did you guys get a big turn out for each? I'm checking about the venue now. Waimea Center is a nice center, but we may have to use the gym.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: The venues were pretty well prepared by the Elections Committee last year. I think the Kona one was at Hale Halawai, and that was probably our most well attended. We had a lot of people in Kohala by the statue somewhere at the Senior Citizens. We had a lot of people there. But everywhere else, was, as expected, those that have something to say will be there. I think that's basically all we can do as Commissioners, is to take the input of the people. That is why the public hearings are just that. We have it, listen, come back, and make the deliberations after. So I think it's important. The way I'm looking at it is that we have seven days planned out for hearings. A couple of them are double, but it's a seven day period. So, I think it's important that we allow the public to make their input. They can always come to

another one. I think it's important that we get out there to these districts, have it. But Kona and Kohala was probably our biggest input, there.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Was it 10 people, or 50 people?

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: In Kohala there were in excess of 15 people, maybe 20. In Kona it was in the evening so there was, I'd say, maybe 20 or 25 people there.

MR. CARVALHO: I expected maybe 100 people.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: Well, if we get 100 people, I'm willing to accommodate them somewhere, but I haven't seen that. Maybe over the 10 years, things may have changed, so people may be a little bit more interested in doing that. I would suspect that when we get to Pahoehoe Neighborhood Center, we would have a lot of people there. But that's just my spin on what has been happening.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I suspect also, that in a lot of cases you have one person coming to represent an organization instead of everyone from that organization coming. So that might account for some of those lower numbers. It might not be because there is a lack of interest. I don't think there is a lack of interest this time.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: I sure hope not. It wasn't a lack of interest that prevented them from doing it last time. It's just things happen; people have meetings scheduled during the day, people work. The ones that maybe wanted to can't or are not able to. But, I think the technology has helped; how it's easier to pretend where your district is going to go. It will peak a lot of people's interest in what is going around this time; this is a ten year cycle.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Anybody else?

MR. KANUHA: I had something to bring up. About the Yano Hall meeting; on the front page it says 6:00 p.m. and on the back page it says 6:00 a.m. That definitely has to be fixed.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Those of you who took the calendar from the front table, please make that correction on your copies.

MR. MELROSE: I understand the difficulty of a morning meeting during the workday, so there is a vehicle for people to submit testimony to us. People can write in a testimony to us in conjunction with those public hearings. I'm making that assumption.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Jamae, will you come up please.

MR. MELROSE: My question was that for each of these public hearings there is a vehicle for people to submit a written testimony if they can't get there in person. There is a vehicle for each of these testimonies; they can send it to the Election's Office or to the Clerk's Office and it will be delivered to us for each of these public hearings.

MS. KAWAUCHI: Jamae Kawauchi, County Clerk. You may invite members of the public to submit written testimony, but the purpose of the public hearing is to have a time for persons in each of your communities to provide their personal testimony in person and not just what's on paper. So if you have morning meetings and I note that for some of the districts it's Hāmākua, October 1, 2011, 9:00 to 11:00 a.m. The other district that you have a morning meeting is South Hilo, October 15, 2011, 9:00 to 11:00 a.m. You also have a morning meeting listed, actually a late afternoon meeting, but still during normal working hours; North and South Kohala, October 1, 2011, 1:30 to 3:30 p.m. I note that South Hilo, Puna is also during working hours and that is October 15, 2011, 2:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m. All the others are at the same time, which are evening times, which are 6:00 to 8:00 p.m. At those meetings you may want to consider the fact that most working people are going to be working during those hours and you will not get a lot of testifiers at that time. Not being consistent with the other meeting times---However, having said that, your morning times, I think October 1st is a Saturday; so is October 15th. So if that's a weekend, that is mornings, you won't have the work hour issue presumably; the Monday through Friday work hour time. Just to answer your question, can you submit written testimony? You may invite people to do that.

CHR. SIRACUSA: If there is no further discussion, we can vote on this proposed public hearing date and venue schedule.

Mr. Middlesworth moved to accept the public hearing date and venue schedule. Seconded by Mr. Carvalho and carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiola'a, Kahui, Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth, Poindexter, Ugalde, and Chair Siracusa.
Noes: None.
Absent: None.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We had a motion to close file, we need to vote on that now.

The motion to close file on COMM. 28 was carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiola'a, Kahui, Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth, Poindexter, Ugalde, and Chair Siracusa.
Noes: None.
Absent: None.

COMM. 29: HELP RESOURCES FOR PUBLIC'S USE OF ESRI SOFTWARE

Memo from Commission Chair René Siracusa, dated August 4, 2011, requesting follow up discussion on help resources for the public's use of Esri online software.

Mr. Middlesworth moved to close file on
COMM. 29. Seconded by Ms. Poindexter.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Just to remind everybody, the question had been whether we should look into making an agreement with Esri whether they should give us additional help and we decided that we may not need it right now, but we should keep it as an open agenda item so that we would be able to discuss it if the need arose. Does anyone want to say anything about that.

MR. MELROSE: My recollection was that the bid that we got was for general support, and our conversation at the last meeting was could we, in fact, provide community support for people who didn't know how to get on to the system, and a place that they could call, like our two testifiers have asked for. I think we had asked Pat to have a conversation or Michael to have a conversation with Esri to see whether or not there is some solution. I think there is one. I think there is a number to call. That was the question we were looking for an answer to.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We were talking about something metered by the number of calls.

MR. MELROSE: But I think there is a place. Do you have an answer?

MR. UDOVIC: Michael Udovic. As far as I know, there is a telephone number to get some general information. We have not been able to meet with Royce to discuss these things in detail, quite frankly, we are still working on that trying to figure out a way to work out the details of the particular system. I was out of State on some County business and just got back, and we haven't been able to touch base. Pat and I met yesterday morning and still attempted to talk to him and we weren't able to do so. We are trying to clarify that specific proposal, quite frankly. At this point in time, we have nothing new to report.

MR. MELROSE: I want to respect Jo Jo's request here today and concern for getting on; and the woman from the Puna community, I honor that. I'm wondering if there is someone in the Clerk's office right now. I don't think these are location issues, I don't think there is a question about Kawaihae, no can get on, or Puna no can. I don't think that is the issue. I think it is how to get on it and I'd like to help those folks who made the effort to come here to get some guidance from somebody who can help them do that. If they could actually do that with the Clerk's office right now, while they are still here, that would be a good thing. I'd like you to walk away with a sense of success about that. If you would; if that is okay with Elections office.

MS. KAWAUCHI: Jamae Kawauchi, County Clerk. To follow up with that question, we do have staff here who could help to do that. It is not on your agenda, but you could take it up right now if you wanted to, to show the public how to get on to the site, since you have---You don't have the description of doing it, but you could potentially do it under this agenda item; Help Resources for Use of Esri Software.

MR. MELROSE: Madam Clerk, my recommendation is not to do anything in this session, but simply to invite them to go to the Clerk's office and be shown how to use the system so they can go home and help other people know how to do it.

MS. KAWAUCHI: So I think then, at the break, if they wanted to stay. I'm not sure how long your meeting is going to last, but we do have a laptop here where we can show people how to use the software. So if they wanted to stay until that time, we could do that. Otherwise, we could schedule an appointment and we can have staff available. Does that satisfy?

CHR. SIRACUSA: Did you hear that, Patrice? You are saying there are dead spots?

PATRICE McDONALD: Puna is really different, and the mauka subdivisions are heavy native forest. They don't have accessibility to wi fi. We are lucky if we get 3G. Having to use the iPad or the 3G wireless stuff does not let us access your documents. We went through this for seven years with the CDP, of not being able to access documents. I don't understand what it is. It is so simple to print out hard copies for the districts that are not available to the software.

MR. KAHUI: Could she state her name for the record?

PATRICE McDONALD: I'm Patrice McDonald, I was asked to represent communities in upper Puna.

JO JO TANIMOTO: I'm Jo Jo Tanimoto. My problem was I got all the way down to "Choose Plan," then I had all these Plans and they wouldn't open for me. So I guess that's where I am. And since I'm doing it from home, and home is on the other side of the island, and you are saying the Clerk is over here and she doesn't know what time you are going to be done. I was wondering if there is some way I can go find out now, so that the rest of your meeting, I really cannot participate in because I can't figure this part out.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Jamae is coming up.

MS. KAWAUCHI: Jamae Kawauchi, County Clerk. We do have an Office of Elections in Kona. It is located at the West Hawai'i Civic Center, and we are happy to give you the address. I understand that our staff person there has been trained on the software. Our staff person located at that office has been trained on the software and we can set an appointment up for you to show you the system.

JO JO TANIMOTO: So if I make the appointment by telephone, because it's 40 miles one way, so I'm trying to save \$4.44 a gallon for gas.

MR. CARVALHO: Excuse me. If it's okay, I can make a house call.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. What I have found, also, is that sometimes it will jam up on me in the middle of something. Then I go out, and when I come back in again it is okay. So I don't know if you have tried that, but sometimes that works.

MR. CARVALHO: You know, this is not only Jo Jo's problem. This is the whole island, plus we have only three weeks; September 1, 2011 is the deadline. So we need to somehow publicize it that commissioners can help if necessary.

MR. MELROSE: I appreciate that you are willing to do that. I would also like to suggest that hard copies of these---I realize this is difficult because the hard copies of this, in small maps, it's hard to see exact details of the boundaries. We ought to have some copies available at the Clerk's office for the things we have up so people can at least pick up that much. That would be my suggestion.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: It seems to me that we have two separate problems here. One is simply being able to use the software and get in. The other one is the communication problem that is not of our making and we have no way to resolve. If you are out of range, if you don't have cable TV and you don't have high speed internet access, this is virtually impossible. It is also virtually impossible if you have an old computer. What we need to find out, I think, for these people, is a place where they can go that is reasonably close to their homes and access a publically owned computer. Now, we have some computers here at the County building that we have said that people can get to. What about in the libraries? I don't know because I don't use those.

MS. UGALDE: May I offer a suggestion? My name is Linda Ugalde. I am also the President over at Cooper Center Council. We have high speed internet access at Cooper Center. It is on from 7:00 a.m. to 7:00 or 8:00 p.m. Anybody is welcome to come up. There is no password. You can just sign in and use our system to access these web pages.

CHR. SIRACUSA: That might help Patrice, because she is in that area. For Jo Jo it's a different problem. Is there any more discussion? I would like to call for the question.

The motion to file COMM. 29, regarding Help Resources for the Public's use of Esri Software was carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiola'a, Kahui, Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth, Poindexter, Ugalde, and Chair Siracusa.
Noes: None.
Absent: None.

RECESS: At 2:30 p.m. the Chair called for a short recess.

RECONVENE: The meeting was reconvened at 2:40 p.m.

COMM. 30: DISCUSSION ON GEOGRAPHICAL STARTING POINTS AND "COMMUNITIES OF INTEREST"

Memo from Commission Chair René Siracusa, dated August 4, 2011 requesting a discussion regarding Geographical Starting Points and "Community of Interest."

CHR. SIRACUSA: Just to clarify what the intent was, it was that each one of us is from a different district, and some of us have specific issues that we would like to share with the others

and bring to the table. This is the agenda item where we can do it. So I will accept a motion to close file.

Ms. Poindexter moved to close file on
COMM. 30. Seconded by Mr. Melrose.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Does anybody want to start with what their issues are for their district, that they would like to see addressed in the ideal plan?

MS. UGALDE: Yes. In regards the written testimony that came in about Volcano Village, including the Golf Course Subdivision; I happen to agree with Mr. Bidleman that the similarities with the Puna area are greater than those going south. I happen to think our district is way too big, geographically. Your original idea of starting up there around or just below the Volcano Golf and Country Club area and putting our area in the Puna district, is my preference.

MS. POINDEXTER: I don't have anything at this time.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: I don't have any particular issues about the district that I represent, but I do have some observations having done some of this mapping stuff. I think it is virtually impossible for us to tell anybody where to start given the way the software works. I can start at any place, and then tell you that I started it in Kona. That really doesn't work. I think if there are these accommodations, we will have to talk about them when we start looking at maps.

MR. MELROSE: I would agree; and I think Mr. Bidleman's comments earlier on are very apropos, just realizing how difficult it is wherever you start the process. You may solve your particular problem, but it creates other problems. So, it is true that we are going to split some communities, somewhere in this process. I can't imagine us not doing that. I think that, as Mike says, that the issue of starting points to me is less important than the communities of interest. I find that when I do these maps, wherever you start, so be it, but you come back and you adjust them, and you try to find a way to make it. All lines kind of have to move as you go about doing it. And I think, just speaking as a Commissioner from District 2, I realize that Hāmākua has to grow as a district, because it hasn't grown in population. So it has to pick up another 4,000 votes, and that interface right between District 1 and 2 is a point of expansion for Hāmākua. Just as the other point of expansion is really into the Waimea community; so you have two different ways to push and you can do all one, or you can do half of one and half of the other. But ultimately, one side has to move to pick up the additional size for the region. So from District 2 perspective, I look at the Wailuku River as a really important boundary because it kind of defines the nature of old downtown, and keeps the kind of ahupua'a mauka/makai of Kaumana, Pi'ihonua intact. Some of these plans start to move across that and then you get more and more weight in the Hāmākua District and the vote that is in the Hilo District and not in the Hāmākua District. So I realize how hard it is, but I think that Wailuku River boundary is one that I think is important from this district's perspective anyway.

MR. CARVALHO: Working with that community of interest, I am having the hardest time in my area; mainly because Hāmākua is such a huge geographical area, and the only way you can grow is mostly to my side. My side means Waimea. But Waimea usually associates with

Kohala. So, I'm wrestling with that kind of problem. Waikōloa is down more to the hotel side; and Waikōloa, I could move them to North Kona, but---It's difficult, like everybody I think, is having a very difficult time. Splitting communities; it's going to be very, very hard not to. But, we have got to work on it using the numbers that we have.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: Ten years ago, I raised the same concern that Mr. Melrose raised. From a historical, from a genealogical, cultural side, the Wailuku was the separation on this island. There are different districts; we have probably five different districts. It's saddens me to hear when this term "community of interest," nobody seems to be interested in Ka'ū. However, when I looked at the numbers, somebody is going to be interested in Ka'ū, because you are going to go there; or Ka'ū is going to go to you. There are 9,000 people that are missing out of Ka'ū. You have got to put, for equality, everybody gets 20,000 people. For me it has always been, not about community of interest. Because if I was going to take that literally, for me, a community of interest would be Jo Jo, myself, Maku'u, Hawaiian Homesteads; those are communities of interest. So, it's not something that we area prepared to do, but we have a district. I come out of District 4, and in that District, we will continue to---We have got to grow by a couple of thousand people, because we are short. So we are going to move somewhere. It may end up like, for instance we go on one side of the street and the other district is on the other side of the street; it happens. It happens because the lines are there. I think, this year, the exercise with the census department, the bureau of census, has been just that. You've got to take a whole census block. You cannot take half of a census block. When I tried, I got a color that went way off somewhere else, and that's not where I wanted to go. I'm quite sure all of you experienced that.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank God, there is an undo button.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: Absolutely. So, as I said in the beginning, and it's not because I was here ten years ago, it is still something where we have got to be--and I'm just hoping that the public understands--we've got to take nine holes and fill them each with 20,000 people. It was easy for me to just click here, and then Puna went from 25,000 down to 20,000, but that's it. That's were you were. So I say, we do have our task cut out for us, however, I think the public hearing will make it. That's where we have got to explain. Mike mentioned that we are going to listen, but there has got to be some kind of feedback; and if possible I'd like to have that feedback during the public hearing. Not to make decisions, but just to tell them, "Look, brother, I cannot go on this side of the road; it's here." So that's how I look at it, and I think the public hearing is important because that's when the public has the opportunity to make some kind of impact that will impact where we are going to go in the next ten years, and how the district lines are drawn. But, ultimately, it's our decision, and it will be our decision alone. Thank you.

MR. KAHUI: I think, philosophically, you know, people that live in these old districts, they just no like move. They like go back to the same voting place. Once you start changing their voting area they begin to question why. But, by that time, it's too late. We hope that the public is engaged; and I agree with Mr. Kahawaiola'a that we ought to engage with the public so that we are clear, at least in our minds, about what we are talking about. If we are drawing these new political lines and geographical lines, then it makes a lot of sense for everybody. So then in the end, we all go home happy. We feel that we've done our job, our duty, to create a new political boundary; new boundaries for the County, new election boundaries to which our people can be

satisfied with. Nobody going be happy. We are going to get some angry guys; cannot help. I agree with Mr. Melrose, we tried moving that boundary over the river when we were playing with the map last week. It just didn't make any sense. My kupuna, yesterday, in a design charrette, Aunty Elizabeth Lee; her boundary is her ahupua'a. Her boundary is where she comes from; her kuleana. It doesn't have these district lines that create this sense of equality. Because that is what we would really want; a sense of equality under which everyone has a fair shake to elect their officials so we get fair representation. And that's the bottom line; but our kupuna no think like that. I agree that there comes a point, like the Wailua River, you can't do it; maybe just out of custom, it might be prohibitive. We do the best we can, and I hope that with that said, the community understands. The dialogue helps us create that understanding. If I can just put at ease my reality, then I think people will grasp our job to which I think we end up with a result that is not going to please everybody, but it is one that we have been tasked to do. Thank you.

MR. KANUHA: I agree with everything Mr. Kahui just said. Looking at communities of interest, actually we spoke about this a few weeks ago when we had a community up at Yano Hall, and one of the persons that testified said he came from Nāpō'opo'o down in Kealakekua, and this past redistricting, in 2001, they split the community right in half. One side of the road is District 6 and one side of the road is District 7. He said a lot of the people down there didn't understand why their neighbor had to go to a whole different place to vote, somewhere else. Nobody really understood. His advice was, especially in that community because it is such a close knit community, everybody knows each other, it is a whole ahupua'a down there, to keep that community intact, as one. That's one of the recommendations he gave for communities of interest. I totally agree with him, so I'm going to recommend to the Commission for that specific area, if you are looking at maps that do split up that area, to keep that in mind, that the people down there don't want that area to be split. That's just from one person. I really want to see what the rest of the people, when we do have these community meetings have to say, if they do show up to these meetings. I like to keep communities of interest together and hopefully we can.

CHR. SIRACUSA: And that's the sort of thing that I had in mind, because I'm in Puna; what do I know about what is happening in Waikōloa? And visa versa. So we need to hear from each other what the issues are that are especially dear to our hearts regarding this. Now, we've been working with the software, we see there are some areas like Hāmākua and Ka'ū that are very sparsely populated. This creates one kind of a challenge when we are making the maps because we have to pull those numbers from somewhere else. And then there are other areas, like Paradise Park, which, no matter what community you put it into, what district you put it into, it's suddenly goes way over the numbers; because it's one community with so many people. It's the same thing for Waikōloa. So we've go our work cut out for us. I, personally, would very much like to see Volcano down to about Keaau as one Puna district and from Kalapana, going in the same direction towards Kea'au, as a second Puna district. But it's really hard to work it up with the numbers; especially sometimes when the software is not very cooperative. Does anybody have any thing else that they would like to add on this agenda item?

MR. MELROSE: Just a quick comment. I was trying to figure out what other challenges we face trying to create these communities of interest. One of the things that struck me was that the DOE does this around schools. Where do people go to school? They struggle with that. You

think about Waimea not attaching to Hāmākua, but attaching to Kohala. But all their kids go to school in Honokaa; that's part of the districting. It just struck me that it kind of depends how we are looking at that. But they all share the same math teachers in their high school. So we can get really embedded about what we think those communities are, but in fact we really do share a much broader community than the kind of simply defined communities. So there is a blending of those lines in different ways; so I just wanted to add that as a comment.

CHR. SIRACUSA: If there are no other comments on this topic, we can vote on closing file.

The motion to close file on COMM 30, Geographical Starting Points and Communities of Interest was carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiolaa, Kahui, Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth, Poindexter, Ugalde, and Chair Siracusa.

Noes: None.

Absent: None.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mr. Kanuha moved to convene an Executive Session regarding Review and Discussion of Draft Alternate Plan/Maps pursuant to Section 92-5(a)(4) for the purpose of consulting with Commission's attorney on questions and issues pertaining to the Commission's powers, duties, privileges, immunities and liabilities. A two thirds vote pursuant to HRS Section 92-4 is necessary to hold an Executive Meeting. Seconded by Mr. Carvalho and carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiolaa, Kahui, Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth, Poindexter, Ugalde, and Chair Siracusa.

Noes: None.

Absent: None.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We are in Executive Session

RECONVENE: The meeting was reconvened at 3:50 p.m.

ORDER OF THE DAY

REVIEW AND DISCUSSION OF DRAFT ALTERNATE PLAN MAPS

Electronic versions of maps are available for viewing at the Redistricting Commission meeting and on County of Hawai'i Redistricting Commission web page.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Communication 31 is part of the Review and Discussion of the Draft Alternate Plan Maps. I would like to have a motion to close file on Communication 31, so we can discuss it briefly.

Ms. Poindexter moved to close file on COMM. 31, letter from David Rosenbrock, Reapportionment Project Manger, regarding date that software will be updated with extracted numbers. Seconded by Mr. Kanuha and carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiolaa, Kahui, Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth, Poindexter, Ugalde, and Chair Siracusa.
Noes: None.
Absent: None.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Communication 31 is a letter from David Rosenbrock, Reapportionment Project Manager, informing Jamae Kawauchi, our County Clerk, that the numbers for the extractions will be completed, hopefully, on August 29, 2011. Our deadline for the Alternate Plan submission is September 1, 2011. So, we are having a little timeline problem here. I have been informed that although we did set the date for submission of Alternate Plans, although we did set that date, we can change it also. That is not precluded. Is that correct?

MR. UDOVIC: Yes, the statute just says that it has to be set; but based upon the circumstances, not having the correct numbers, I think it is perfectly reasonable for the Commission to move the date; if you so choose.

Mr. Middlesworth moved to change the date for the submission of Alternate Plans to September 15, 2011.
Seconded by Ms. Poindexter.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Is there any discussion?

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: Madam Chair, I can agree with September 15th, but I would sure like to put some onus burden on the State by having something in that date change saying that somebody didn't give us the numbers until the 29th. It continues to look like this Commission has been the one that is stonewalling everything; that we just can't do anything. That is the appearance. But I would tend to agree with Mike that we should move the date to the 15th.

MR. MELROSE: Just to integrate that thought, then I would just ask for a friendly amendment to the motion that says, “Based on the lack of receipt of new numbers from State Office of Elections---” Is that your intention?

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: Yes.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Is that the motion then? And it is agreed by the second?

The motion to change the date for the submission of Alternate Plans to September 15, 2011, due to the lack of receipt of new numbers from the State Office of Elections was carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiolaa, Kahui, Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth, Poindexter, Ugalde, and Chair Siracusa.

Noes: None.

Absent: None.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We are on Review and Discussion of Draft Alternate Plans. We will be looking at the Alternate Plans submitted by members of the public. We will not be looking at the five plans submitted by the Office of Elections as requested by the Commission, because it was not agendized that way. So, we have before us, Plans six through eleven. I suppose we can take them one at a time, unless someone has something they want to discuss about them as a lump. Okay, does anyone have any comments they want to make about Plan 6.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Can you remove the labels from the map. Go up to the top where it says, “Display Labels” and take those off, “Labels and Names.” One of the problems that I have--if you go up to the Puna area--there is a lot Puna into District 6, down into Kaū and that way. And I think if you zoom in further, it cuts Paradise Park into two different districts.

CHR. SIRACUSA: That Pohaku Circle area is part of Paradise Park, even though it is mauka of Highway 130.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: This goes even further to the East.

MR. MELROSE: This is one of the tricky parts about that. I think that Shower Drive has houses on both sides of it. Is that not true? So that’s the district, there are actually streets that go to the north of that. And it happens in several other communities where you have little dead ends that are part of another thing. It’s just how the census tracts were drawn.

CHR. SIRACUSA: You can see the houses now. Those white dots there.

MR. MELROSE: Oddly, not part of the census tract.

CHR. SIRACUSA: That's part of the problem with Hawaiian Paradise Park; it is so densely populated.

MR. MELROSE: A portion of Wainaku is in the Puna district, but you have to go out of the district and then back up Kawailani Street in order to get into portions of that. So you have a road disconnect that I think we'll see. What does the Kona side look like?

MR. KANUHA: I think on the Waimea side, it splits Waimea right in half.

MR. MELROSE: But it splits it farther in than it does now. It splits the Hawaiian Homes community.

MR. KANUHA: That's what I had a problem with; that's what I wrote down on my notes.

MR. MELROSE: It's a good try. Now go to Kona.

MR. KANUHA: Let's try to look at Kona.

MR. MELROSE: I think it splits the Kaloko Mauka subdivision in half. That should be all part of one. It also splits Nani Kailua down the middle.

CHR. SIRACUSA: What I'm hearing from all different parts of the island is that this map splits a lot of communities. It's an equal opportunity splitter all around the island. Do we make decisions at this point? No, we are just looking at them.

MR. MELROSE: One of the things this one does is in the Nani Kailua area, unless you include the bigger census tract that goes up Hualalai Road, you end of splitting Nani Kailua subdivision because those are cul-de-sacs that are part of the subsequent census tracts. So if you are going to keep that one together, you have to include the next piece up.

MR. KANUHA: The old map comes down Hoene Street and includes this whole section right here. But it still splits the homes on this side.

MR. MELROSE: So right now, one side is in one district and the other in another.

MR. KANUHA: So what we are looking at still splits that community in half. And I, personally, don't like it.

MR. MELROSE: So you might want to include the next bigger census tract below that up to Hualalai Road.

MR. KANUHA: If you want to keep that line right there, yes.

MR. MELROSE: If that's where it is going to go you would want to include what's on the next side.

MR. KANUHA: You would want to include that neighborhood.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: The problem that I have had trying to draw over on the Kona side is that the way the census blocks are on that side, every time you make a change down on this end, then you go up to the top and you have got to try and figure out how to make a change up there, and they don't work either. Somebody is going to be unhappy over there just as people are going to be unhappy in the Hilo side because the concentrations of populations are such that it gets real hard to move those lines.

MR. KANUHA: Yeah, just look at how weird these census blocks are; it's crazy.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We are all running into those problems; either areas that don't have enough population, or areas that have too much.

MR. MELROSE: Can I suggest that we just keep moving on?

CHR. SIRACUSA: Let's move on to Plan 7.

MR. MELROSE: I think that was a good effort, but it's got some issues.

MR. MELROSE: One of the things I noticed about this one was that the two Hilo districts are both high by population, which might actually adjust to be right once we fix those numbers out of the University. So it looks like there are about 900 additional votes in those two districts that will get removed when you pull out the 1,000 or so University votes. So the are a little high and the faster growing districts of lower Puna, the two Puna districts, are low to accommodate a growth potential. Districts 4 and 5 are both low. There are two Hilo districts, two Puna districts, two Kona districts; and the two Puna districts are a little low and the Hilo districts are a little high based on the fact that they will loose some votes from the University. Districts 7 and 8 are also faster growing districts, and are low to accommodate that growth. So it's built into the piece, and I thought it was interesting.

MR. KANUHA: I did too. I've noticed in few of these plans submitted, they took that into account and I liked it.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I would like to see the details of that Volcano area.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: This one does even more splitting of Paradise Park.

MR. MELROSE: Can you pull it out a little bit? If you look at the end of District 4, it looks like it runs about the Puna boundary. So that is a discretely Puna vote. It goes along the boundary of Puna. This one doesn't share Puna and Hilo; but it does share District 6 into Puna.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yes, considerably into Puna. The way Highway 11 goes, there are subdivisions on both sides of it and they all use Highway 11; that is their major corridor to go to Keaau or Hilo. All of those subdivisions are in Ka'ū, they are really Puna, and yet they are put into Kaū; that bothers me. Plus Volcano is in Ka'ū according to this one.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: Can we get back to the Harbor and the Airport? I’m looking at District 4; and 4 is out in Puna now.

MR. MELROSE: One of the things that is tricky is that Puna has too many votes for two. Bottom line; the population in Puna is larger than two, so they have to share it somehow or the other. There is no way to include all of Puna. You either are going to share it with Hilo or you are going to share it with Ka‘ū; and that’s the choice. People didn’t like it when it shared with Hilo; that was a big deal the last time, so either you are going to do it. Volcano is on one side of that picture and the Kea‘au area is at the other side. We are going to choose one or the other, but you can’t get both.

CHR. SIRACUSA: But this is the one that divides Hawaiian Paradise Park in half; that whole subdivision. Take a look at that.

MR. MELROSE: You could change that, maybe, by putting ‘Āina Loa up. You might be able to avoid that. But those are both big chunks and we want to hold them together. So you have a choice of---

CHR. SIRACUSA: Do we want to move on to the next Plan, or keep talking about this one?

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: So, all of us are moving to District 3 now? We are in District 4, so now we move to District 3.

MR. MELROSE: What does the Kona side look like?

MR. KANUHA: This one seems better on this side, but when you move north towards Kailua, I think it splits Kailua Village right in half. Can you zoom in a little bit more on that? This one, the line went more North towards the coastline, more in towards Kailua Bay.

MR. MELROSE: Give us a little more shoreline, Shyla, so we can see what it looks like. It goes down the middle of the Pine Trees subdivision on one side and Nani Kailua on the other. That’s a tough place, because there is real density in that. I remember struggling with individual blocks.

CHR. SIRACUSA: For us, from the other side, from the Puna side; I have no idea where the boundaries of one subdivision or another are in Kailua. It makes it really hard to try avoiding splitting subdivisions.

MR. KANUHA: Kailua, personally for me, I don’t like it to be split up.

MR. MELROSE: Where would you say that boundary is though? How far back would you have to go not to split Kailua Kona? Say, if you are going south of the boundary, where would be that boundary that you say is no longer split? It’s all density. It’s all pretty dense.

MR. KANUHA: Keauhou, Kamehameha III Road is where.

MR. KAHUI: Keauhou is really a distinctive community between those that live in Keauhou and those that live north of Keauhou.

MR. KANUHA: Because these census blocks follow roads, specifically too, and there aren't too many roads connecting Ali'i Drive to Kuakini road; or Mamalahoa Highway. So to say you want to put a line in the middle of---It's difficult, especially in this area.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: If you look at the census blocks along the ocean and they are all long, skinny things. Some of them have no people in them, but they get really strange.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Then it ends up looking like you gerrymandered, even though there are no people in the long fingers.

MR. MELROSE: If you look at the two existing maps, both the one existing one and the one before that, this is where the line falls. There is a little bit of variation north and south, but those two lines have been in the existing Council distinction for 20 years. So, can we fix it, I don't know? Those are number issues. But, traditionally, to the extent that 20 years is tradition, we have had that line. It's not that much different than this one. It varies a little bit, a half mile or a quarter mile one way or another.

MR. KAHUI: I think with the growth in our area, we could easily see moving that southern boundary further south, or likewise, for District 7; keeping Kailua collectively in District 8. But again, that is just a thought.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: For the sake of conversation, in Kailua-Kona--I don't know too much about it except the County has a Kailua Design Plan--if you split Kailua-Kona any other way, politically, through whatever line, there is an upset in the planning processing for Kona. Kona, Kailua anyways, became a very special place when they began to have their own CDP, or the Kailua Village Design. So anything you needed to do in that area became a special process in the Planning Department. So that would change if these things are allowed to stand. I would want to go back to it, because Dru and Jeff said something about historical; I would like to go back to 4 and look at 4 because I see where there may be a contiguous cut in some 2,000 acres of Hawaiian Homes land that we have there. What has happened here, I want to get to the Harbor and then to the left, we got Keaukaha, but all the blank stuff; and I am assuming that is the District 3 border of Puna. So Keaukaha is now in District 3 as opposed to District 4. If it's just a matter of changing Councilmen, that may be livable.

MR. MELROSE: But you are still held together as a community. The Hawaiian Homes is together, Panaewa is together.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: I just need to make sure. I'm looking at it in terms of our lease properties. The shopping centers and stuff like that.

MR. MELROSE: That is all in the same district.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: If it stays in the District, then in the next election, we just have to go vote in a different place, that’s all. We just have to go vote in a different place. We will be in District 3 as opposed to District 4. And that is what I am beginning to see here. They have moved it. You’ve kept Wailuku.

MR. MELROSE: On the issue of Kailua town, and the splitting of Kailua town. The last district in Hilo runs through the middle of downtown. We too, have a downtown plan and a collaborative effort to maintain the downtown, which has actually not been a problem at all for us in downtown. What we have done is we have both councilmen working with us. Fresh takes the lead on things because he has the bigger portion of downtown, but Donald has been absolutely right there for everything as well. So, to some degree, it is less of a detractor than it is from our perspective than it is an asset; we have two people who are vested in the downtown area. So, I wouldn’t presuppose that it’s a bad thing. That’s all I wanted to say.

MR. KANUHA: And the same thing would go for Kailua. I’m sure both council persons would take a vested interest in Kailua.

MR. CARVALHO: Can we see Waimea? Can you zoom further in, I want to see what road that is.

MR. MELROSE: That’s Punani, it looks like. I think what this does, is if Hāmākua needs to grow, because it has to. It has to pick up more votes. It picked up votes south; a portion went to the river and the other portion moved up. So, it kind of split the growth going two directions. It took the Wainaku lands which are kind of knitted to downtown, the residential density across the river, which was a part of District 2, and moved it up into Hāmākua in order to help fill part of that. Then it moved a little bit the other way too. It seems to me like that’s what this one does.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Are we ready to move on and look at Plan 8?

MR. KANUHA: I ran the integrity test on this one and it just totally failed.

MR. MELROSE: District 2, 4 and 5; District 4 and 5 are both split.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: Look at District 1.

MR. MELROSE: This one might explode on us; what do you think?

MR. KANUHA: Even Hāmākua went in part of Kailua on this one.

MR. MELROSE: Mauka Kona and Honoka‘a are in the same district.

MR. KAHUI: I’m glad we have numbers to identify this map. We can’t tell if this is my map or not. I would like to comment though that Map 6 and 7, if you look at the deviation, the percentages were much closer; although the boundaries need more clarification as well as compaction for communities, it was probably the best set of plans to work from. So, if we were

to select one today, we haven't gone through them all, but if you quickly look at the deviations, the deviations will help you quickly make that assessment.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Except, there are two conflicting clauses in the Ordinance; one which says, deviation, and one which says you have to take into account growth. I think, from our point of view, growth is the more important consideration.

MR. MELROSE: That, and communities of interest.

MR. KAHUI: I agree with that.

MR. MELROSE: What this shows is that it is very easy, not easy, it is not hard to create a district that is numerically right on it. But I think this is where the Ordinance is going to throw us a curve; if it fails the other test. This is a question we asked of Corporation Counsel before, and he said, "Well, let's wait and see if it's a problem." But, it is going to be a problem, and we are going to have to make some calls on it. That's what the Ordinance says, and that's a problem with the Ordinance.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: After Mike brought up the fact about that there may be ambiguity in the Ordinance, and Jeff; I am trying to think of what I saw in the Ordinance and the new Bill that was written. I've been hearing "community of interest," and this community of interest; is it the same as alternate?

MR. MELROSE: I don't think it's defined in the Ordinance.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: Absolutely, and that's the problem. That's what I'm saying. If we are going to use the Ordinance, then we have to stay with the Ordinance and look at it. Instead of using terms such as "community of interest," I think we need to look at "contiguous," and the language that is there. Once we get ma'a, or used to the terms such as "contiguous," and I can't think of what the other ones are. But, a community of interest could create or throw us a bigger curve than what we are looking at. The language in the Ordinance is quite clear, especially when we are saying we didn't know what "alternate plans" were. I would just want Commissioners to think about contiguous.

MR. KAHUI: I agree that if we are going to plan for growth we need to have an idea of what that looks like. For example, in Kona, we know that we have so many permits for housing developments; we know that Hawaiian Homes got 200 homes, 100 already under construction and another 100 planned for the next year. Somehow, if we are going to plan for growth, there's got to be some kind of statistics somewhere, some kind of information that will allow us to make that kind of choice so that we don't miss that element of this whole redistricting. So, I don't know how we plan for growth except to go and ask for some numbers from the Planning Department about permitting and about how many homes are coming up for construction; even if they were forecasting this some five maybe even the next ten years. We know there is significant growth in Kona. There is a plan for a 2,300 unit affordable housing project for HHFDC; we know that the affordable housing unit up at Hina Lani is for about another 70 or 80 units. So, even though they might not have people there, people are going to move in there. So,

I'm not sure if we are going to plan for that number, then we have to figure out a way to do that in a more educated way, rather than trying to "guesstimate" that. I don't know what the recommendation is, but that would be my thought.

MR. UDOVIC: I can check with Research and Development and with the Planning Department to see; and with Building, perhaps, to see if they have any ideas of what is going on. That's all I can do right now.

MR. KAHUI: Thank you, Mike. I think that would be advantageous as we go through this process of looking at how we measure growth against drawing these lines.

MR. UDOVIC: I'll try all three departments tomorrow to have them start to work on it, if they can.

MR. MELROSE: One of the challenges to that is on the West side you are seeing basically, proposed developments that require new capital and new investments, which is the economy to grow. On the East side, you have got 80,000 lots that were cut up in the '50's anytime for building permit, they can come to home. So the difference on the Puna side---

CHR. SIRACUSA: And in Puna, very often without the permits.

MR. MELROSE: Yes, right. But they will come to density without that type of permitting. So I'm not sure we are going to come up with a mathematical thing; I like the challenge of thinking about that. Ultimately we are going to have to come up with a feel that gives us a sense that we have accommodated it to the extent that we can. All this goes back to the question of variance, and I'm just kind of taking the sense that variance is part of our challenge and we are not aiming to be the most accurate. That is not the point, over the ten year period.

MR. KAHUI: Trust me, I don't want to have to reduce the numbers of members in my district as a voting block for us as to create more numbers for other districts, but on a fair playing field, I think that is what we are looking for.

MR. MELROSE: But, reducing it is---

MR. KAHUI: Reducing it to ensure we are making up for growth to some extent.

MR. MELROSE: Right, that's what we should do.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I think we have all decided that Plan 8 leaves a lot to be desired. So, let's move on to look at Plan 9. Can we get rid of the labels so we can see what is happening here?

MR. MELROSE: This one takes another crack at splitting Waimea along the highway, rather than East/West. It splits it North/South. The same is true with Puna in this one. It splits Puna North/South, not Upper and Lower.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: And I'll get a new Councilman again. I move again.

MR. MELROSE: What does it look like in Hilo? One of the tricks with that one is that the Waimea people who are now in District 9, are now in District 8. So there link is now to the Kona base.

MS. POINDEXTER: But I think that is the Pu'uanahulu, Waiki'i area.

MR. MELROSE: No, but everybody on the South side of the Highway going through Waimea is now connected to Kona, not to Waikōloa, Kawaihae.

CHR. SIRACUSA: This seems to have the Wailuku River as a boundary.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: No, it doesn't.

MR. MELROSE: Right, it doesn't. It splits downtown at Waianuini.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: This is downtown, then it comes across; the top comes across to Puainako.

MR. MELROSE: So this is where the boundary would fall if you were just to draw the line at the edge of Waimea town; which is what that does, right? If you start at the edge of Waimea on the East side of Waimea, at Lakeland, just outside, then it pushes across the river and all the way over to Chong Street and Kaumana to make up the difference in votes. If you push it all one way, you end up getting all the way to, past Kaumana, up Kaumana. Now, in the Hilo side, this becomes, in addition, a Hilo vote, not just Hāmākua vote. That's the outcome.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: Then here again, District 4 is in Puna.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Paradise Park is not split, however.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Green is District 3.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: But now, you split Hawaiian Homes; now you take the contiguous Hawaiian Homes and it's coastline, by keeping one part of it, but you take away the farms; the agricultural part.

MR. MELROSE: And you blend the Hilo/Puna vote. You keep Kea'au connected to Hilo.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: I don't have a problem with that, what is here is still here in District 3; but I loose part of--And I'm talking about, "contiguous." The 2,000 acres starts here at the Harbor and it comes around to the Puna coast. That is Hawaiian Homes.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: You could probably put all of that into District 3 and not affect it.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: Well, if that happens. The reason being, that with due respect to the people from Puna, right now there is a move to cut across the bypass, the railroad. If the votes move there, we lose.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: The railroad is not going to happen.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: I saw a memo from the Puna, talking about the Puna Makai access road, so I’m not prepared to do that. However, that is what I am saying. I don’t have a problem moving the Councilman. The Councilman has the problem. He has to go move some place, I’m going to still be in the same place. But, my job, as a Commissioner, is to look out here, to make sure that I keep my community as contiguous as I can.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Can we scroll down a little bit more and look at the rest of Puna?

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: Puna is in three different places now.

MR. MELROSE: There is also a distinction in this one which I think is one of those calls that I would be interested in a Puna inside on. This one drops; it does an East/West instead of an Upper/Lower. There has always been a Lower seat; for the last 20 years, there has been a Lower seat that picks up the Kalapana to Kumakahi and up to Hawaiian Paradise Park somewhere. But this one kind of splits it on the road, so you split Pahoa---

CHR. SIRACUSA: Pahoa Town itself is split.

MR. MELROSE: Maybe that’s the bypass.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yes, that is the bypass.

MR. MELROSE: But, you have Kalapana in with Hawaiian Acres.

CHR. SIRACUSA: My community is just to the left and slightly below where it says Old Cemetery Road. Where I live, I would suddenly be in the same district with Volcano, whereas, the only place that I can get to as a cul-de-sac community is Pahoa. And yet, I am not in the same district as the rest of Pahoa. So this is strange. On the other hand, if you move up towards Volcano, at least Volcano is not in Kaū.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: Nobody wants to go to Kaū.

CHR. SIRACUSA: You know, it is thousands of acres of wilderness separating Volcano from Pahala; and more than an hour drive.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: I would remind the other Commissioners that the thousand of acres just happens to be a National Park. The volcano is in the park. The Volcano National Park sits in Ka‘ū. It now extends all the way to Kahuku. That is way closer to South Point than anywhere else. The vastness of Ka‘ū has got to be because of the National Park. The National Park has been there and there’s no growth going to happen there; I know nothing is going to be planned in

my foreseeable future in the National Park. However, there are pockets within Kaū that have, with due respect to the people of Ka‘ū, they have been able to maintain themselves in those communities. I thought those communities would die out with the plantations, but no, they probably remained the same or gotten bigger.

CHR. SIRACUSA: There is a plan now; I saw it in the paper the other day that they want to build a whole big residential area and some hotels, in Ka‘ū. That would increase the Ka‘ū population for sure; except I don’t know where they are going to get their water from.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: Some of us are probably going to put part of Keaukaha in Ka‘ū.

MR. MELROSE: Can we look at Kona?

MR. KANUHA: This is kind of what we were talking about earlier about going up Keauhou, Kamehameha III Road, and keeping Kailua in one district; because the population on the North side of Kamehameha III Road---I’m sorry, I mean on the South side there is no real population of the road. So that’s where I was saying the split would, potentially--if that were the case--would be an option.

CHR. SIRACUSA: So you are saying that you approve of this?

MR. KANUHA: I’m saying that if we wanted to split it, that’s where Kailua would start, and go North. Plan 9 and Plan 11 are exactly the same, except for District 7.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: And that’s the question that I am asking about; District 7. If you take all that empty space to the East of Kailua-Kona, and throw it in with Ka‘ū, that is what you get. You get a population center for Kailua and you get a population center for Hilo on the other side; two very small districts, geographically, because we have all that open space in the middle of the island.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yes, and a lot of that open space is Hakalau Forest National Wildlife Refuge is expanding.

MR. KANUHA: Above Kailua there is a lot of forest land; in the mauka Kona area. There is Holualoa above there, but above that is a lot of ranch lands.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: This gets into the question of urban and rural districting. How do we want to do it? Do we want to throw the heavily urban districts, condense them as much as possible? Or, do we want to throw a lot of rural land in with the urban districts? I don’t know.

MR. KANUHA: That is a great question.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: One of the things I’m going to do is to put up a map with all of the unpopulated census blocks shown as unassigned districts; so we can see where there are no people at all when we start talking about these districts.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Can we do that?

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Sure, it's real easy to do.

CHR. SIRACUSA: No, I mean if we have it unassigned, like it is now, and click on a census block would it just show white?

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: We can make it just show white. We can make it show unassigned.

MR. MELROSE: Just a thought for you, Dru, that line--although I understand what you are saying in terms of its interface with what is Kailua and what is not Kailua--the idea that people in Honalo--do you think they will identify with Pahala and Nā'ālehu as being part of their community of interest? The other districts have concentrated those two more specifically and tried to keep the mauka Kona, Kealakekua and Captain Cook and downtown in two separate districts; with Ka'ū coming up from behind into South Kona. But this case, all those folks would be in the same district as Nā'ālehu and Pahala.

MR. KANUHA: That would be a good question to ask when we go to those meetings. I don't have an answer for that.

MR. MELROSE: There are some things about this one that I think are useful in conversation. So I think as we go through, there are a couple of these already that I think we would say, "Let's see it again, let's keep coming back to these things and see if there is a way we can adjust them." But, for the purpose of having things ready for a conversation when we go out, whenever that is, it poses a question; it's a clear alternative. It's not necessarily what we are proposing, but it raised some intentional questions.

MR. KANUHA: What do you feel about this, how it looks?

MR. KAHUI: Well, looking at how District 8 meanders up Waimea, that's really hard for me to split Waimea again. Really, I think traditionally, when you look at the ahupua'a districts, the traditional districts, mauka to makai, once again we seem to get away from that cultural kind of context to which we then sort of invade another community. So, suddenly Kona is in Waimea. The old chiefs would never have had that happen, let me tell you right now, they would be waring all day long. I don't like the finger look on that, if I might say that. It just doesn't---

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: What about splitting Waikōloa? The Village?

MS. POINDEXTER: I was just going to say that. Waikōloa is a better fit.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: If you split Waikōloa Village, then you can throw Waimea back in with North Kohala. But you cannot throw Waimea in with North Kohala without splitting Waikōloa Village.

MR. KANUHA: Do you have to split Waikōloa Village?

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: In order to get enough people in the district, you do.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Waikōloa is dense.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Waikōloa is too big.

MR. CARVALHO: Waikōloa is the one that throws my figures off.

MS. POINDEXTER: But if you look at Waikōloa and you look at the different cultures in Waikōloa, you can split Waikōloa. You have that rural community in Waikōloa; that is the hidden community that nobody speaks about.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: The problem is the census blocks.

MS. POINDEXTER: That is where the problem is, the census blocks. There is a rural Waikōloa. There is that area where all of our poor people live; the affordable housing in that area for our hotel workers. If you remember, when the plantations closed, Kohala, and the people from Kohala, now are migrating into Waikōloa. They are having their own little communities there. So, in Waikōloa, you have separate communities.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Where is that on the map?

MS. POINDEXTER: If you look at Waikōloa Village, and you go below, you drive down further past the school all that back area is all our rural community people. That is our rural community of Waikōloa. It is hard to even get grants there because of the census track. They are taking into consideration the Waikōloa Village area. If you go down to the street past the school, from the school, further down; from that area back, you have affordable housing and more affordable housing. There is a huge subdivision coming up too, am I correct? Yes.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Click on “display lines.”

MS. POINDEXTER: So that is what I consider our hidden---

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Where?

MS. POINDEXTER: Here is the school; all of this area from that school and all the way back is all of our affordable housing, mostly, and is separate from the Village. When you go mauka, you get some moderate income. When you come down this way, you have all the low income and you have another huge subdivision that is being developed that is not on this map yet.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: ‘Āina Lea.

MS. POINDEXTER: Yes, and that is all part of Waikōloa. So Waikōloa, to me, can be split.

MR. MELROSE: It can be, but you will run into a problem of those things not being able to be accessed without having to come into Waikōloa and coming back out. So you have a road issue, of connectivity.

MS. POINDEXTER: I thought they were going to do one from the highway to go up to that new subdivision; I'm not sure. I would have to look at the maps.

MR. MELROSE: I see what you are saying, but you end up isolating a piece of it. It will now be in District 9 and you have to come into District 8 to get into 9.

CHR. SIRACUSA: And it won't be contiguous.

MS. POINDEXTER: But the thing is, for those people in Waikōloa, they really have no representation; our rural people there. They are the forgotten few.

MR. MELROSE: I think we will have a hard time splitting Waikōloa.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: I do too.

MR. MELROSE: I think it would be very hard to do. They are one of the most contained communities, although there may be variations, to which I don't argue. But I just think it would be a hard one to do.

MS. POINDEXTER: When you look at community organizations there---

CHR. SIRACUSA: Do the kids all go to the same high school?

MS. POINDEXTER: Not necessarily; a lot of them go to Kealakehe, a lot of them go to HPA, and that private school in Kona. So you have a lot of the more wealthy people in the Village area not going to our public schools.

MR. CARVALHO: I don't know how you guys feel. I would keep Puako with Kohala. But, Waikōloa, I was trying to move them down to North Kona, too.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: I tried sixteen ways to move them down that way and you run into that problem; there are too many people in Waikōloa and it throws everything else off.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Does any one want to look at another section on this map? Okay, let's move on to Plan 10.

MR. KANUHA: Do you think we could skip to 11, since it is basically the same map?

MR. MELROSE: Are 10 and 11 the same?

MR. KANUHA: Plan 9 and 11 are basically the same except for Kona. They are exactly the same except for District 7. I would love to have a conversation about this because at first when I

saw this, I thought there is no way that could possibly happen. But then after looking, I thought it was pretty interesting.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: This gives you the two parallel urban districts.

MR. KANUHA: I would want to definitely keep this for conversation later on. I thought it was interesting to see one district as the urban center of Kailua town. I don't know if it's right or if it's wrong; it's interesting.

MS. POINDEXTER: It's the West side Hilo.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: That is going to continue to be the urban center on the West side.

MR. MELROSE: No, what I think is going to happen is that the direction for growth will change. That is the old direction for growth. This is the original Kailua to Keauhou core. But the next core, the real development is all going out Bo's way between the other K to K. The new growth is going to happen in District 8 and north. There is a little in fill going on in here and there are developments here and there, but the push, all the new development is on the other side of Palani Road. Where is Palani on this map? Hina Lani is where that growth is going to happen; between Hina Lani and Kailua town.

MR. KANUHA: And towards the airport.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: If you were going to do an urban Kona side, would you move the southern border north and go up into Hina Lani? If the growth is going to be North of the existing Kailua town center, would you move the northern boundary up farther north and also move the southern boundary up farther north in order to accommodate the growth? If you move one border you are going to have to move the other one too.

MR. MELROSE: And you need to have a smaller number.

MR. KANUHA: That's true, too.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: See, this is 19,000 in this one.

MR. KAHUI: You are not going to get there by moving that border north. If you could pan in a little more on the north boundary of District 7, and pull it down a little. If you are looking at the top you see Kealakehe Parkway. They show the new Ane Keohokālole Highway. They don't show it on here where it runs from Palani. Along that corridor there is going to be massive growth. If we were to move that, the effect on District 7 is going to be dramatic. The numbers are going to jump high. I don't know if that's a solution; maybe going mauka again with 7. Again, I don't like the finger going up to Waimea.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: If you look at 9 and 7; the two maps. The only difference is taking off the unpopulated areas in 7 and throwing them in with District 6. District 7's population doesn't change, and that's the problem you run into.

MR. MELROSE: It changes by about 400 or so.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Yes, not enough to make a difference.

MR. MELROSE: I wouldn't call mauka Kona unpopulated; I don't think they would take that.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: I don't mean unpopulated; less densely populated. We have these areas of population density that we are fighting with all the time.

MR. KAHUI: I don't know. Certainly, I think looking at the 2001 districting, it seems a little bit more in line with the compactness of that district. Otherwise, with some of these it's going to be a major undertaking to shift them around. I don't have a recommendation. The only recommendation is that I don't think we should include Waimea town into the Kailua district. That's my mana'o on that.

MR. KANUHA: I agree; I didn't like that finger going way up there either.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: For the sake of this discussion, I've heard a lot about rural and urban. Can somebody give me an education about rural and urban? Where is urban growth, and where is rural at?

MR. KAHUI: In the Kona CDP we define the urban growth as from Palani, going north, all the way up to Hina Lani and as far up as the airport; in the Kona CDP. They are moving growth programmatically from Palani. There is a lot of infrastructure and a lot of other issues such as water and water development that has really kind of put a lot of stuff on hold. Nobody can find water; water is a huge big issue. For those developments like Hawaiian Homes Village IV, for example; I live right next door. There is 245 home development that is graded, ready to go; but no more water. Had they found the water, had they got infrastructure money, we would have seen more growth in that area. So a lot of other kinds of obstacles, development obstacles, infrastructure and the like, is kind of curbing urbanization. Urban, as far as I can tell is more homes, more schools, condensed, brought in, creating like a real small compacted city. I am from Kalihi, so I'm from an urban area. When I moved to Kona, I told myself, "I never moved to Kona to live in Kalihi." As they tried to plan this growth, I got involved. Now, we are trying to plan that growth. It's going to happen. The County has agreed to move in this direction, they started that infrastructure work; they built the new highway of 1.7 miles. So we can expect that. How fast it will happen, it will really be dictated by what happens with the economy.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: That's what I'm trying to get at. So, would Hāmākua, would they consider themselves urban or rural?

MS. POINDEXTER: Rural, because I consider even Kohala rural. I consider all the areas that are underserved. That's why when I talk about Waikōloa, and there is a rural Waikōloa, there is a part of Waikōloa that is underserved; when you talk about not having water in that subdivision; that's an underserved area. So, anything, to me, that is underserved is considered rural.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: We have very limited, just three places, that is urban. Would you guys agree with that? Kona, Hilo; the two parts of Kona and the two parts of Hilo are urban.

MR. KAHUI: I would personally say that they would be kind of viewed as urban, but the Federal government still considers that rural.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: That is what I was getting to. We are over here discussing urban and rural, and I can tell you that in Keaukaha on the coastline, I can go get money from the Federal Rural Electrification Program, that you couldn’t get in Kona.

MR. KAHUI: That’s correct.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: I just don’t like to get hooked up on the semantics of “urban” and “rural.” We live in Hawai‘i, we have to be able to go put 20,000 people in a hole and get out there and explain why we moved the lines here and there. If I’m going to try capture urban, I’m going to capture rural, because again, I’m going to come back to nobody wants Ka‘ū. Ka‘ū is out there, there is nobody living in Ka‘ū, we got to go put 9,000 people in Ka‘ū. Some of the maps show Hāmākua rural, but then there are some fingers into Kaumana; that’s not rural. You get above the Hospital, that’s not rural.

MR. MELROSE: The only quotable quote coming out of today is, you watch, the press, “Nobody wants Ka‘ū.” So, press, please understand we are having a general conversation and don’t put that kind of stuff in. That is not what we are saying. That is certainly not the character that we are looking for. I’m speaking to the reporter. It is not what he means to say. What he is saying is that it is hard to get---I don’t know what he means to say, but that wasn’t what we want to be quoted as. We don’t want to be seen as a---Just be careful, we are being reported here.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: I speak for myself. She can quote me if she wants to and I’ll deal with the family in Ka‘ū. I’ll deal with my family in Ka‘ū. But for the sake of us moving on with this thing; I like it. I like it because we are getting to the point where we are able to address those concerns of people, right now, in West Hawai‘i. I think that’s where we are going to have to do it. We’ll do that, then move over to East Hawai‘i and resolve that.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Since I brought up the urban and rural business, let me explain how I see it. It has to do with density; the number of houses per square mile. Density is what makes urban as opposed to rural, as far as I see it. I live way up Waiākea Uka. We are rural as far as my neighbors are concerned. We are spread out; some of us don’t have county water and all of that kind of business. That is a rural area. But when you get downtown in Hilo or when you get into Waikōloa Village, those are urban areas because they are dense.

CHR. SIRACUSA: And of course, if you ask somebody from the Planning Department they would go according to the zoning, and the LUPAG maps.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Absolutely. I live in an Agriculture zoned area.

MR. MELROSE: Can we go back to Plan-10?

CHR. SIRACUSA: Let's go to 10.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: Zoom in to 4 please. This is about the closest as I could have come to the map I did. But I couldn't print it, I couldn't do nothing. So I've got 17 maps saved on my computer. I can't get them out. But, I'm watching her, how she's doing it.

CHR. SIRACUSA: There's some of those long coastal strips that end up being fingers jutting out and making it look like gerrymandering, when there is really no one there; there is no population there.

MR. MELROSE: There is no population there.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: What fingers are you talking about?

CHR. SIRACUSA: The District 2; the orange finger pointing towards Keaukaha.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: That's the Gas Company, Gas Pro; but there are people that live on Ocean View Drive so they are going to come up on the census block.

MR. MELROSE: This got to its number; it concentrated the push and pull in Waimea, of the Hāmākua District. It did it by sucking the core of the downtown area and moving it up. There is not a lot of population there, but you get the old portions of downtown. Those areas are all now in the Hāmākua District, instead of bringing it up laterally, like some of the other ones do. As a downtown person, this is a tough one, but it's an option.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: It goes all the way up to the Chinese Cemetery.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Is the breakwater a census block?

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Yes, it is.

MR. MELROSE: Can we go south a little bit here? Although the 4 district goes into Puna, there really is no population in that area except right at the very end where you see Shower Drive. You get the end of that Drive. Although it moves into Puna, it doesn't necessarily draw any population.

CHR. SIRACUSA: That is unpopulated over there.

MR. MELROSE: That's just Shipman and Mauna Loa Mac Nuts.

CHR. SIRACUSA: However, the Paradise Park; that is the Pohaku Circle part of Paradise Park is across the street in District 3.

MR. MELROSE: I don't know if that makes a difference to me. I understand that maybe it would for some, but to me, the road is a distinct barrier whether it was subdivided or not. That's a very logical, natural boundary to me; to use the Highway as the boundary.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Can you take it a little bit more south now? That takes 3 all the way down to the coast.

MR. MELROSE: This east and west, for Volcano, split is interesting to me. For Puna, to me it's one of those fundamental questions that will come up. Is it an East/West split, or is it an Upper/Lower split?

CHR. SIRACUSA: It's really a North/South split, because of the way things move. For example, if you have an event happening in Pahoā, you will find that usually people from HPP will not go back down that way to Pahoā. They tend to gravitate more towards Kea'au. 'Āina Loa does go a little more towards Pahoā, but not Orchid Land necessarily. Yet, Leilani has very little to do with Paradise Park. North/South is more the way people move and the way people access things.

MR. MELROSE: Black Sand Subdivision; what is the subdivision above Kalapana? So Kalapana is now connected to Kurtistown.

CHR. SIRACUSA: No, not at all. People from Kalapana and along the Red Road go up to Pahoā. That's where their mailboxes are. That's where all the services are. That's where all the shopping is, that's where the gas station is; there is nothing down here, it's all up in Pahoā and yet they would be in a totally different district. As a matter of fact the way the precincts are right now, they closed the precinct at the Pahoā High School, so now it's only the precinct at the Pahoā Community Center.

MR. MELROSE: The testimony we got from the public today about liking Plan number 9, which does the same thing. It splits East/West rather than Upper/Lower. I'm not sure if their intention was more about having the two seats in Puna, which is, I think, their ultimate issue was, or whether they liked 9 because of the way it splits the town.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I think it was partly the two seats, but it was also the part that Volcano was back in Puna again.

MR. MELROSE: And that split, from the West side, Dru or Bo---It's not that much different from what it is today, it moves a little north. District 6 moves a little north. It holds the Hina Lani growth core as a unit.

MR. KANUHA: Can you zoom in on the southern border, towards the ocean?

MR. MELROSE: It preserves Nāpō'opo'o .

MR. KANUHA: At that line there is very little population.

MR. MELROSE: That's the Hokulia lands, right?

MR. MELROSE: So you have pretty much, a South Kona seat. It picks up South Kona, because the South Kona boundary comes right inside there, right? It is right about Kealakekua.

MR. KANUHA: Yes, the normal boundary for North and South Kona is somewhere around there.

MR. MELROSE: When you go north from there you can see you have two clear kind of central seats in Kona. Kailua kind of gets double representation is the way I look at that. You split north and south of that at Kailua Bay. What is at the north boundary of 8? It gets up to the side of Waikōloa. Up on the shoreline from there you get Puako. Puako then goes into 8 and from Puako, north, Hapuna, is in 9. Wailea Beach is in 8; that's a change. Then go to Waimea. So, Districts 9, 8, and 7, are not really problematic to anybody here, when you get to 6, then Volcano is still kind of struggling with where it fits in that upper Puna. There are two clear Puna seats, and there are two Hilo seats. You could argue their boundary, but---

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: District 3 is part of Hilo.

MR. MELROSE: Hilo is a Puna seat in this one. You could adjust that so that 3 was 4 and 4 was 3. You can change the numbers there. The numbers aren't relevant, but you could just switch the numbers.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: District 3 always represented a part of Puna anyway.

MR. MELROSE: Didn't 4?

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: District 2 was the only one that was totally Hilo.

MR. MELROSE: I had my problem with the downtown split. Look at the numbers. Hāmākua is actually a slow growing district and it is well above by count. The University area is in 2, I believe, or maybe it is in 4. Look closely, because it is right around Kawili. Is the University in 4? Yes, it is in 4, so that population is in 4 now, so that number would have to go higher, rather than lower. You could pull some back out of Hāmākua, and reduce that.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: Go back to the river, then, you get that split and take all of Hilo town back into 4.

MS. POINDEXTER: It would bring that number back up.

MR. MELROSE: This one has some promise.

MR. KAHUI: I agree.

MR. MELROSE: Is it appropriate to ask Elections to make some revision? Or maybe we do it? How does the Commission want to do it, do we want to have Elections make some adjustments and see if we can---

MR. KAHUI: I think we can play with the map. Can we play with the map? That was the idea, right?

CHR. SIRACUSA: We get to another issue then.

MR. UDOVIC: As members of the public, I suggest you play with the numbers and play with the map. If you want Elections to do it you have to give them specific directions, because they are not going to---You know what I'm saying?

MR. KAHUI: Madam Chair, of all the maps that we have viewed this is the one that has the most promise. Having said that, maybe, as the bewitching hour approaches, we maybe take a few minutes to just kind of make some minor adjustments, and then maybe save the map, so we can get onto it personally, and go over it and do our own crunching and moving of boundaries and such.

MS. POINDEXTER: Can we go it right now?

MR. KAHUI: I believe so, yes. She can do it right there; she is doing it right now.

MS. POINDEXTER: It's moving that small piece, that small finger right there; that. If you put it into 4, what would the count be? Can we see what the numbers are for the District statistics? That may work.

MR. CARVALHO: What about pulling Puako back to Kohala?

MR. KAHUI: I think we should take a look at that and see how that looks.

MR. KANUHA: It's already at a -4.99% deviation. I think if we take away Puako, to Kohala, it's going to be even worse. Do you think Puako should be in District 9?

MR. CARVALHO: I can live with this and adjust somewhere else.

MR. KANUHA: If you think it should, then we can adjust elsewhere.

MR. KAHUI: Yeah, because we can go south.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Let's look at 5. We still have Volcano in Ka'ū.

MS. POINDEXTER: If Joe was saying put Puako back and then if you move it down in the Volcano area---

MS. UGALDE: Where District 3 stops along Highway 11, I would like to see it go up to and include Volcano, through the golf course subdivision. District 6 is high, and 3 is low.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: You are going to get that whole big space.

MS. UGALDE: That is empty land up there.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: That is the entrance to the National Park.

MS. UGALDE: We haven’t taken into consideration the other side of the highway yet. It’s all part of the same community. Otherwise you are going to have the Village in Ka‘ū. That’s the Village right there. Also, we haven’t gotten to the Golf Course yet.

MR. KANUHA: You are totally splitting the north part and the south part; it is not contiguous.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Everyone seems very excited about this map. It seems to be the most acceptable one so far.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

MR. MELROSE: Because it’s coming on to 5:30 p.m. and we’ve been here for 4 hours now; can I suggest that we kind of think about what we are going to do next, and take some time to play with our options now. We could all play with this a little bit and understand the realities of it. I would like to visit the next meeting date, if that is something people are still willing to reconsider.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We should do that; and there is another thing that I want to do. After David Rosenbrock does the extractions, people who have submitted maps, I would want a motion to direct Elections, or Karen, or somebody, to notify them that they should plan to revisit their maps to see if they want to do any amending based on the change in the numbers. Does somebody want to make a motion to that effect?

Mr. Melrose moved that when the Commission gets new numbers, to have staff inform people that the numbers have been adjusted to reflect the non residents; and suggest that they revisit their previously submitted maps. Seconded by Ms. Poindexter and carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiola’a, Kahui, Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth, Poindexter, Ugalde, and Chair Siracusa.

Noes: None.

Absent: None.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Now we look at the next meeting date. We were talking about switching the date. Karen informed us that she has not officially noticed the next meeting yet, so we can make that change.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: We had one scheduled for August 25, 2011.

CHR. SIRACUSA: So we would change it to the day before.

MR. MELROSE: All I’m saying is that I won’t be able to attend on that Thursday, the 25th. If it’s the 24th, I can get there. You guys are doing well; I don’t need to be here. But I think the question is Karen needs to confirm the place.

MR. KANUHA: Is it still problematic to have it in the Kona Council Chambers?

CHR. SIRACUSA: I don’t know. You mean the technical problems?

MR. MELROSE: I think we should keep the conversation at this level; at this level of depth.

MS. POINDEXTER: I would like to have it in Kona.

MR. KANUHA: I just wonder about the technical difficulties they were having.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I think it is a teleconferencing problem.

MR. KAHUI: In any case, either the 24th or the 25th, I won’t be able to make it. I’m gone that whole week to a conference; apologies.

MS. EOFF: I will have to call to check that no one has the room reserved. It is possible; just how we have Council meetings there. It would cost us some money. We would have to hire Out of the Sea Media, who works for the Council, to set up our equipment there. It is not functioning completely as it should.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Would we run into those technical problems that we were told to hold off on having meetings there?

MS. EOFF: Is this for the very next meeting, you are asking?

MR. KANUHA: I’m just asking if we can have any meetings in the Kona Council Chambers.

MS. EOFF: We can. If you wanted it to be the next meeting, I would have to ask the Clerk, but she isn’t here right now.

MR. MELROSE: Do you know if we can move this meeting to the 24th; from the 25th to the 24th? Is the room available?

MS. EOFF: This room is available on the 24th.

MR. KANUHA: I have no problem coming here for the next meeting.

MR. MELROSE: Let's do that, but let's keep looking for a time to meet in Kona. It would be good to get more Kona people showing up.

MR. KAHUI: I don't mind coming here; it's just that the next meeting I can't make it. I don't mind the travel and being together. This exercise was more important because we were having a technical problem to view or see what is going on. I've been on the site, and I've done some maps, I'm familiar, now, with that process. Having to be here collectively has helped us to better understand where we have to go from here.

MS. POINDEXTER: It's been very productive

CHR. SIRACUSA: Speaking for me personally, I feel real good about us all being here in the same room and interacting. We are all in this together, and I feel that it cements us better as a group.

MS. POINDEXTER: I want to know what Joe is looking at on his computer, why he has such a huge smile on his face.

MR. CARVALHO: It's no problem for me to come to Hilo. Kona is good too.

MS. EOFF: I'll check on the costs to hold a meeting in Kona, and I'll look on the calendar and I'll be ready to give some information to you at the next meeting. But I would suggest we schedule the next meeting in Hilo

CHR. SIRACUSA: On the 24th. Okay, someone make a motion.

Mr. Middlesworth moved to change the next meeting date to August 24, 2011. Seconded by Mr. Kahui and carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiolaa, Kahui, Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth, Poindexter, Ugalde, and Chair Siracusa.

Noes: None.

Absent: None.

CHR. SIRACUSA: There is no Unfinished Business, no Reports, and no Referrals for Executive Session.

MR. MELROSE: I want to make sure we understand; are we going to be doing this same kind of thing at our next meeting? Are we going to continue the conversation? I don't want to get into

another agenda that has the wrong word on it. We need to keep doing what we are doing. Are there other things we need to do?

MR. UDOVIC: I think that has been resolved.

MR. MELROSE: So we are going to be able to see the ones the staff did?

MR. UDOVIC: Yes, and any new ones that come in.

MR. MELROSE: That discipline then, we need to get any update we do on the numbers. We need a general conversation of numbers. So we have already extended the deadline, right? Karen is going to change that on the ad. She is actually going to cross it out and say date changed for the next run of the ad.

MR. UDOVIC: I would suggest we just say, "Review of Draft Plans"

CHR. SIRACUSA: And leave it open.

MR. MELROSE: So that's the essence of our next meeting, Review of Draft Plans. Do we need to review Communication 31? Did we take care of that officially?

MR. UDOVIC: We did. It was included in the discussion of the Draft Plans. It was sufficiently related and was satisfactorily handled.

MR. MELROSE: The other issue that we didn't touch today, that we started on is whether there is some kind of contract with Esri.

MR. UDOVIC: We will get information for you for the next meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

CHR. SIRACUSA: I will now accept a motion to adjourn.

There being no further business, at 5:30 p.m.,
Ms. Ugalde moved to adjourn the meeting.
Seconded by Ms. Poindexter and carried
by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiolaa,
Kahui, Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth,
Poindexter, Ugalde, and Chair Siracusa.

Noes: None.

Absent: None.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Motion carries, we are adjourned.

Respectfully Submitted,

Karen Eoff, Secretary

Approved on August 11, 2011:

Ms. René Siracusa, Chair
Hawai'i County Redistricting Commission