

**2011  
HAWAI‘I COUNTY  
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION**

10<sup>th</sup> Session  
Thursday, November 3, 2011

County Council Chambers  
25 Aupuni Street  
Hilo, Hawai‘i 96720

**CALL TO ORDER:**

CHR. SIRACUSA: Good morning, the Hawai‘i County Redistricting Commission will now come to order. This is our tenth session, and today is Thursday, November 3, 2011.

**ATTENDANCE:**

Present: Mr. Joseph Carvalho, Commissioner  
Mr. Patrick Kahawaiola‘a, Commissioner (*11:50 a.m.*)  
Mr. Craig “Bo” Kahui, Commissioner (*Kona*)  
Mr. Dru Mamo Kanuha, Commissioner  
Mr. Jeffrey Melrose, Commissioner  
Mr. Mike Middlesworth, Commissioner  
Ms. René Siracusa, Chair  
Ms. Valerie Poindexter, Commissioner  
Ms. Linda Ugalde, Commissioner

Absent: None

Also Present: Mike Udovic, Deputy Corporation Counsel  
Pat Nakamoto, Elections Program Administrator  
Bobby Jean Leithead Todd, Planning Director  
Steve “Kawena” Lopez, Deputy County Clerk  
Cori Saiki, Elections Assistant  
Shyla Ayau, Senior Elections Clerk  
Jeanette Aiello, Committees Supervisor  
Stephanie Tsunezumi, Committees Services Staff  
Arlene Boteilho, Committees Services Staff  
Maile David, Legislative Specialist in Kona  
David Hirt, Legislative Assistant in Waimea  
Leinani Wessel, Council Aide in Kona  
Barbara Lively, Legislative Assistant in Pāhoa  
Karen Eoff, Secretary

## **STATEMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON AGENDA ITEMS**

**CHR. SIRACUSA:** The next item on our agenda is Statements from the Public on Agenda Items. I want to make a few comments before we launch into that. First is, to avoid any confusion, this is three minutes. At the public hearings we allowed five, but this is three and we don't want anyone to get mixed messages and get confused about that. We have received 77 written testimonies between the last meeting and this meeting. The Commissioners have read all of those testimonies; they are part of the public record. I just want you to rest assured that your comments have been taken into consideration. We have 25 testifiers today, at this point, and this is a lot of testimony and will take up a lot of time. So, what I am going to do is ask your kokua, if you can get your point across in less than three minutes, please try and do so. I am also going to tell you that we went around the island and we heard from every community; and we have a pretty good handle now on what people want and what they don't want.

We are going to be working, at this meeting and the next meeting, to try to create a win-win solution on the maps. So, none of these maps are cast in stone. At this point they are all works in progress, so there is no need to get panicked. What would help us more is rather than saying, "Oh, I like this plan, or that plan," is to tell us what particular things you want to see in a plan, or not see in a plan. That would be a lot more helpful because Plan\_A and Plan\_40 are still being changed, and will continue to be changed, until we do our final plan. And so it won't tell us anything substantive if you just say you like this plan or that plan. So please, I'm not telling you how to testify, I'm just offering some hints to make your testimony more pertinent and more cogent. And with that, I will call up the first testifier, who is Pete Hoffmann.

**PETE HOFFMANN**

(At this time Pete Hoffmann came forward to address members of the Commission.)

**MR. HOFFMANN:** Good morning, Madam Chairman and Members of the Commission. It is so nice to be on this side of the table after eleven hours yesterday sitting where you are, it is always nice to be on the other side of the room. Madam Chairman, thank you for those opening comments, because my testimony today is not going to be directed at the pros and cons of any of the two plans that are on the table. I would, however, like to give some general comments, if I could, on where I think we need to be in this particular effort. And I would like your latitude to listen to the members of the community; particularly, of course, our community in Waikōloa, regarding some of those particular aspects and how they will affect any redistricting effort that you happen to have.

Members of the Commission; I know, perhaps better than most, how hard and how difficult it is to try to balance the different efforts that you are faced with. And, I am very much aware, as you well know, by having the latitude of the videoconferencing in my office, that I have really participated in many more of these meetings than you may believe. So, I, for one, clearly understand the difficulties you are faced with. Let me leave you with these

comments, if I could, in general. First of all, the idea of fairness to as many members of the various communities of this island, I think should be paramount in any effort that you, or we, as councilmembers currently, have to undertake. It is the idea of making sure that we provide for the best interests of as many people as we can. We are never going to solve the problem for everybody. I think we all have to recognize that. And while I may try subjectively to convince you that my efforts, or my ideas and concepts are better, I also have to be cognizant as a member of the Council, if not as a member or resident of Waikōloa Village; that it is, how can we possibly do the best for the most people. I ask you to consider that.

Number two, I understand that for many of you, or particularly for some of you, the idea of the Community Development Plan process is something new and perhaps you weren't involved as many members of the island community have been. For us, over the past eight years, the Community Development Plan has been one of the most paramount issues that we face in our land use issues, in our development, in our regional aspects of how we address issues. I ask that you consider this, but give it the credence that members of the administration and the council have given it throughout eight years. It is a program in progress. It is a dynamic effort; and to short circuit that effort in any way, shape or form, is not in the best interest of the people of this island. Please make certain that when you do consider the boundaries that you are facing, it is very important to remember where we have gone over the past years; the progress that we have made, and the issues for development that we are going to face in the future. Do not diminish, and do not try to eliminate the idea that it is extremely important to accept the idea of the Community Development Plan process. I direct that attention specifically to any effort that would divide Hāmākua, who is working right now on a Community Development Plan process; and the efforts between Waikōloa and Waimea that have characterized our efforts over the past six years.

Members of the Commission, you will hear today, testimony from many members of the Waikōloa community, to try and reflect and demonstrate their interest in making certain that the traditional and age old efforts and connectivity between Waikōloa and Waimea should remain; politically, economically, as well as in any number of different areas. They will explain to you, better than I will, those particular areas of interest. Please recognize that this is how we view our progress now, and how we see the development that we need to have in the future.

Finally, ladies and gentlemen, I must tell you that I accept and understand that a redistricting effort is a political process. But, there is a very important portion of that process that must be recognized. If the perception in the public mind is that there are political machinations going on, if in the mind of the people throughout the island, that something is not quite fair with how we are addressing this, your responsibility as appointed members and County officials, and my effort as a community elected official, is to reduce or eliminate that perception to the best degree possible. Please remember that. Under any circumstances--I understand that is my time limit--I want to thank you very much for the efforts you have put forward; sincerely, I recognize how difficult it must be and I do appreciate that both as a resident of Waikōloa, and as a County Council

representative. And Jerry, I didn't think anyone could be as young as sixty years old; Happy Birthday in any case.

MR. MELROSE: Did you mean Jeff? I'm not sixty; it is not my birthday yet.

MR. HOFFMANN: There is a cake back there.

MR. MELROSE: I understand, but it is not my birthday. I'll eat it anyways.

CHR. SIRACUSA: You blew the surprise.

MR. HOFFMANN: You didn't tell me it was a surprise.

MR. MELROSE: Pete, just a quick question. I understand this CDP comment coming up periodically. My sense is that because we adopt CDP's by Ordinance, and they are therefore, the law. They are an Ordinance, not an individual responsibility for a particular councilperson to make; they are everybody's responsibility, as all Ordinances are. I am looking for some examples, where you think that having two representatives involved in an area that has a CDP is a detriment to that circumstance, as opposed to an asset, if both are responsible for fulfilling that Ordinance to constituents that they live with and were elected by, is that not actually an advantage to this circumstance as opposed to a disadvantage? Can you explain what your thoughts are on that?

MR. HOFFMANN: Thank you, Jeff, I will. And you have hit the exact point that worries me about trying to split areas, as far as Community Development Plan process is concerned; because it is a law. If you sat here, as I do, day in and day out, as a member of the County Council, and you try to work with even who you think might be your best friend and supporter; we don't agree 50% of the time. If indeed, for instance, and I'll take the example that you are posing; I don't know who will replace me as the County Council representative for whatever district, the ninth district, wherever that might be. But, if I sat here for another two years; I had Angel Pilago as my partner in Council District 8, who I strongly supported in any number of prior political efforts, to include his run for Mayor, we would not agree on 50% of the issues. If, indeed, we disagree on a very fundamental issue regarding either the Kona CDP, for which he is much more intimately involved, or worse, the Waikōloa, Waimea, South Kohala Community Development Plan, we can set that process back. I'm not saying it has to happen, but I am saying that even the closest colleagues and political allies on the council, have not been able to agree repeatedly over the period of time that I have spent in this last seven years on the Council. I submit to you that in the process in which development and regional aspects of the issues are being discussed, in which commonality of interest and the integrity of the process are important, one spokesperson is really what you need to have. To have more than that, development plan by committee, I think is a potential for failure. And we can't afford that type of failure in the next ten years.

MS. POINDEXTER: Madam Chair, I have a question.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yes.

MS. POINDEXTER: On the Community Development Plan for Waimea, does that include the Lakeland Community, or are you not including Lakeland in your planning? Are they part of the planning in your CDP?

MR. HOFFMANN: I was pointing to Joe, and that's not right. They are; there is that effort. And indeed, the idea of the Waimea, Waikōloa, South Kohala Community is there. I think it goes back to the exact point again, that I was making before. It is difficult to see that we can include everybody all the time. But, I submit to you, by trying to fix one problem in Lakeland for a couple of thousand people, to the exclusion of an eight thousand member community in Waikōloa, is not solving the problem at all; in fact, it is straining for duality in order to see the success of that effort in the future.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: How were the CDP boundaries determined?

MR. HOFFMANN: Difficult to describe, Mike; mostly through the Department of Planning. The Planning Department was the one who initially established those. There were a couple of people; this was done mostly during the time of Mayor Kim's Administration with Chris Yuen as the Planning Director. It was formulated, in general, through a resolution of the County Council in concert with the Administration at the time.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: They were not drawn to match the Council boundaries, is that correct?

MR. HOFFMANN: There were one or two instances in which they weren't. The Kona one, for instance, spans two boundaries; and we argued vociferously against that. We fought; there was some good debate that there should be two Community Development Plans as far as that is concerned. But for the other areas, Puna aside, the North Kohala, the South Kohala, those were basically drawn as part of the political boundaries; the district boundaries, and done with, if you will, forethought, in understanding that planning for the future would include that type of effort because of the relationships that communities had drawn with themselves over a period of time. Don't forget, Waimea has been in existence since the late '60's, if you will. Their orientation has always been towards Waimea. In almost every aspect, that has been true.

MR. CARVALHO: Regarding the CDP, I want to say that I want to thank Pete for his efforts in getting the CDP pushed. Right now, Kohala has a pretty good Community Plan. We are fortunate that we don't have other communities, except for one that is on the south side. Now, South Kohala has about three communities and I have to get back to see if Waimea is really included in the CDP of their entire community, even though part of it is in another district. Pete, can you answer that?

MR. HOFFMANN: Margaret Wille, who is here, and I'm sure will be testifying on a whole other aspect, was, of course, a member of the Action Committee of the South Kohala Community Development Plan. She will be able to explain that in detail. I'm not quite

certain where the extent of the eastern boundary is from Waimea. I do know, where my district line is, but there has been inclusion beyond the district boundary to the east in the Community Development Plan. Again, my only argument, Joe, as I made mention to you; you don't solve one problem for a small community by divorcing a much larger community from that same problem, or from that same issue. I just ask, again, as you look ahead, please remember we are trying to do the best job for the most people. We will never succeed in solving the problem for everyone in the same way.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you, Pete. I am going to ask the Commissioners not to ask any more questions because we have 28 testifiers here, 20 more between Waimea and Pāhoa; and that is 48 testifiers.

MR. HOFFMANN: I tried to get away before René.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I know you did.

MS. POINDEXTER: I just want to say thank you for your leadership. I just want to say thank you because we really need to set the tone here. I really respect your leadership qualities and spirit of working together. You have done very well without any personal attacks or name calling and I really respect that of you, and that is a true leader; so thank you.

MR. HOFFMANN: Thanks Val, I appreciate it. Thank you again.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Now, we will go to Kona.

MS. WESSEL: Good morning. We have only one testifier this morning. Our testifier is Cheryl King, she opposed Plan\_A, and she would like to make a comment on Communications 48, 48.1, 48.2 and 48.8, and she is representing herself.

CHERYL KING

(At this time Cheryl King came forward via videoconference from Kona to address members of the Commission.)

MS. KING: Good morning Commissioners, I will try to make this short. Ten years ago, a great wrong was done to Puna when it was parceled out into several Council districts by the previous Commission. This Commission, in considering the various maps that have been submitted, has been trying to make up for that injustice by listening to the public testimony from Puna, and providing for a mauka/makai Puna that also included Volcano. I, myself, having either attended all the Commission meetings, or at least having read the minutes when I was off island, was in agreement with this principle, and looked for an intact Puna when I examined the various maps that were on display. Unfortunately, the genesis of what is now Plan\_A, was not introduced until after the public hearings. Although Volcano was kept in a Puna district in Plan\_A, I watched with disbelief as Waikōloa was separated from Waimea, Honoka'a was divorced from Hāmākua, and the rest of Hāmākua was married to a part of urban Hilo. Closer to home, a chunk of Keauhou, not far from where I

live, including the subdivisions of Keauhou Estates, and Bay View Estates, was thrown in with an area to the south that has nothing to do with the every day life of its citizens. That area, in the triangle formed by Kamehameha III, and Kuakini, has been separated from its community. For those reasons, I have had to rethink whether Volcano should remain in a strictly Puna district, if making up for an injustice that happened ten years ago causes equal injustice now. I now believe that hybrid Plan\_40, just introduced by Margaret Wille stands the best chance of providing fair and balanced County Council redistricting for Hawai'i island. With the exception of retaining Volcano in District 6, the redistricting concerns I have heard most citizens express, have been dealt with in Plan\_40. Please give as much consideration and time to examining the latest version of the adjusted or hybrid Plan\_40 in detail as you did to Plan\_A at the last meeting. I don't believe a final map can be ready today, and hope you will work on it next week as well.

An apathetic public is finally waking up now that you have more solid plans to display, and it would be advisable to allow them to testify next week as well before a final plan is pronounced ready to take out to the public hearings. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: It is Waimea that has 18 testifiers, is that correct?

MR. HIRT: That is correct, we currently have about 18 testifiers.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Okay, let's take two.

MR. HIRT: Our first testifier this morning is Karen Clarkson, representing herself to speak on the redistricting plan.

KAREN CLARKSON

(At this time Karen Clarkson came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MS. CLARKSON: Good morning. I am here to express my strong disapproval of the Plan\_A that has been put forward for redistricting our island. I appreciate the Commission's efforts, and I know it is very difficult to try to balance the number of voters. But to sever Honoka'a and Ahualoa and Kukuahaile from the rest of Hāmākua, is an artifice which is simply unacceptable. As a 25 year resident of Hāmākua, and a member of the steering committee of the Hāmākua Agriculture Plan, I have learned a great deal about the area's unique history, people, values and resources. Our geography has shaped who we are, and our needs are different from residents on the west side. Our focus is on promoting diversified agriculture and sustaining the rural character of Hāmākua. We cannot achieve our vision if we are separated when it comes to voting on matters pertaining to the entire island. As Hāmākua's biggest town, Honoka'a is its hub. People would essentially be disenfranchised by Plan\_A as the interest of the much greater west side population would overwhelm ours. Our issues are different; I believe that the west side has a lot of issues with coastal development, which are quite different from the Hāmākua issues.

The physical barriers between these two areas are a significant obstacle to having a true representation by a council member that is trying to serve this great diverse area. No one

from Honoka‘a is going to drive to Kohala to attend a district meeting, nor would a council member from say North Kohala, want to drive to Honoka‘a I believe the best plan put forward so far is the Community Plan\_40, and I hope that you will really take a close look at that and try and make it work and be workable for our island because we really want to keep Hāmākua well represented on the Council. Thank you very much.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you for your testimony. The next person from Waimea, please.

MR. HIRT: Our next testifier is Matilda Keith and she is here to speak opposing Plan\_A.

MATILDA KEITH

(At this time Matilda Keith came forward via videoconference from Waimea to address members of the Commission.)

MS. KEITH: Aloha, my name is Matilda Keith, and I have been a resident of Waikōloa for twenty one years. I’m here to speak against Plan\_A that you are considering. My wishes are to have Waikōloa remain in the South Kohala district, and to remain whole and not go over to Kona and not be split up. It saddens me to know that even Waimea was split up, I don’t know how many years ago. We are homogenized with Waimea; always have been. We shop here, we do a lot of activities here. We consider ourselves a part of this community. I would like the Commission to really take a look at Plan\_40 and consider it. I think in Plan\_40, there is still that separation with Lakeland, and if it somehow can be looked at again. I think Margaret Wille did a phenomenal job in presenting that plan. That’s all I have to say, thank you very much.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Let’s now move to Pāhoa. We have some testifiers in Pāhoa.

MS. LIVELY: Yes, good morning and thank you Madam Chair. We do have testifiers here; we have four, and our first testifier is Roxanne Lawson. She is commenting on Plan\_40 and Plan\_A.

ROXANNE LAWSON

(At this time Roxanne Lawson came forward via videoconference from Pāhoa to address members of the Commission.)

MS. LAWSON: Good morning. I am a taxpayer, a homeowner; I was raised in Hawai‘i. My mom directed Timberline Camp. I step up to civic responsibility on a regular basis. I choose my issues well; 2%, I voted for our children’s children and worked on that campaign. I would like to submit that Plan\_A would create a third district in Hilo, while Puna has the same population in what was one of the largest population growths on the Big Island. So Puna could say, we need a third seat. I would rather keep North Kohala, North Kohala, South Kohala, Hāmākua, the way it is proposed in Plan\_40. I am testifying against Plan\_A, and for Plan\_40.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. We now come back to Hilo. Robert Green.

ROBERT GREEN

(At this time Robert Green came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. GREEN: Good morning. What I want to do is first thing is give you some perspective. My grandfather was born in Laupahoehoe in 1890, that is in Hāmākua. My mother was born in Waimea in 1907, in Kohala. I was born in Hilo in 1935 and that puts me in the Hilo district. I was raised in Pāhoa, and in Mountain View; that puts me in the Puna district. So, my personal idea has been all over the island and I would like to speak to all over the island. Now, you all know that in the Saddle between Hualalai and Mauna Loa is a place called Ahu O Umi. In Ahu O Umi there are six piles of rock; each rock representing a homogeneous district or moku in Hawaiian. Those rocks are supposed to be the census at that time, of Umi. Now, 500 years later, because of the census, we are dividing Hawai‘i again. Now, I testified in Waimea on those plans; and now, as I see it, we have two plans to work with. As I see Plan\_40, I see that plan as nearly meeting the needs of the districts and homogeneity of Hawai‘i as represented 500 years ago as it is today. We are all different. Now, I think we really need to work on Puna, in Plan\_40. I think criteria eleven should be re-looked at when you decide to divide Puna. I look back at Plan\_A, and I really don’t see anything good about Plan\_A. First of all, it takes the heart of Hāmākua and moves it into Kohala. It takes the heart of Kohala and moves it into Kona. I think that is something we should not be doing. But, since my time has run out, the last thing I can say to you is please, please do not cut down the coconut trees of Hāmākua. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Our next testifier in Hilo is Nonaina Makahi.

NONAINA MAKAHI

(At this time Nonaina Makahi came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. MAKAHI: My name is Nonaina Makahi. I am for Plan\_40 for Waikōloa. I have been in Waikōloa for almost 35 years, and I know that Waikōloa has that potential for improvement, and it has been improving every year. I see the Council; I don’t see any Hawaiians up there. I know the Hawaiians will rise up, and I say I support Plan\_40. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Let’s go back to Waimea.

MR. HIRT: Good morning, our next testifier is Scott Carter to speak in support of Plan\_40.

SCOTT CARTER

(At this time Scott Carter came forward via videoconference from Waimea to address members of the Commission.)

MR. CARTER: Good afternoon. My name is Scott Carter, and I reviewed Plan\_A. I think it is not a very beneficial plan for the community or the island because it does break up too

many communities as has been spoken of before. I really like Plan\_40. I appreciate it and I think it keeps a lot of things intact. There are still problems associated with it, but it is just a difficult task for the Redistricting Commission in any regard. But I'll just keep it short and say that I prefer Plan\_40, I think it does a better job of keeping the island and the communities in homogeneous nature. Keep working at it, you are getting very close. Thank you so much.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. We now move to Pāhoa.

MS. LIVELY: Thank you, we now have Pete Altomare, and he is speaking on Plan\_40 and on Plan\_A.

PETE ALTOMARE

(At this time Pete Altomare came forward via videoconference from Pāhoa to address members of the Commission.)

MR. ALTOMARE: I would like to say good morning to the Commission. Thank you for your time and trouble and your efforts over the last few months. Pretty much what I would like to say is that since we are down to Plan\_40 in its most recent iterations and Plan\_A, I have to strongly support Plan\_40, with some reservations regarding Volcano. I believe due to their participation in the Puna Community Development Plan, and the feelings there that they belong to Puna, should remain in Puna; but that is something for further discussion on the part of the Commission. I have serious problems with Plan\_A in terms of what it does to Hāmākua. I do not want Hilo to have three districts, since Puna and Central South Hilo have 45,000 residents and are essentially entitled to the same representation. Attempts to expand representation on the part of either Puna or South Hilo are not acceptable. I think that Hāmākua should be pretty much retained as is. I think Waikōloa should remain as a part of North Kohala. I would add, parenthetically, the request to the Redistricting Commission to please recognize the possibility, that since there has been so much discussion, that it is so difficult to properly redistrict, and take everybody's interests into account, that it might be worthwhile to request, or ask, or put on the table, as I certainly am to the Redistricting Commission at this point, an expansion in the number of districts as allotted in this County to allow for proper representation of all the people here. I am thinking along the lines of instead of nine districts, we would have at least 15 or 17 districts to properly allow for representation that everybody seems to be requesting. I think that smaller districts, and more face to face contact between the elected representatives and their constituents is important. I understand that may be, or can, but I am requesting that you make that recommendation. Whether you want to or not, that is up to the Commission.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. That would be a change in the County Charter, and we couldn't do it this time around. Our next testifier is here in Hilo, and that is Billie Whitney.

BILLIE WHITNEY

(At this time Billie Whitney came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MS. WHITNEY: I am a resident of Waikōloa, and I have been for 18 years. I find that in comparing Plan\_40 and Plan\_A, that Plan\_A is divisive and entirely too much so. Plan\_40 is the most equitable plan for all the residents of the Big Island. That is my feeling.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you very much, and thank you for your succinctness. Next is Lemona Whitney.

LEMONA WHITNEY

(At this time Lemona Whitney came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. WHITNEY: Good morning. I am from Waikōloa and I've got a lot to say; but I'm not going to say it. A lot of the people already testified and have spoken out for me, so what I am going to say is that I am all for Plan\_40. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Our next testifier in Hilo is Norma Edelman.

NORMA EDELMAN

(At this time Norma Edelman came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MS. EDELMAN: Good morning, my name is Norma Edelman. I have lived in Waikōloa for seven years and I support Plan\_40. It keeps us as a community, close to other areas that provide services that we don't have. I spend at least three days a week in Waimea at Tutu's House, going to Waimea Education Center classes, other classes, and shopping. I am also a volunteer at the North Hawai'i Community Hospital Family Birthing Unit. My husband is on the board of North Hawai'i Hospice, which also serves Waikōloa and Waimea. Both Waikōloa and Waimea need to be represented in the same district with the same representative. I also believe that Plan\_40 recognizes communities of interest for all areas of the Big Island, including South Kohala, Hāmākua, Ka'ū and Puna, and the other districts. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. We will now have a testifier from Waimea.

MR. HIRT: Good morning, our next testifier is Mike Price, representing himself, to speak in support of Plan\_40, to oppose Plan\_A, and make comment.

MIKE PRICE

(At this time Mike Price came forward via videoconference from Waimea to address members of the Commission.)

MR. PRICE: I am Mike Price, I live in Waikōloa. I believe that Plan\_40 is probably the fairest plan in that all the districts are fairly represented. It maintains the six traditional districts, it represents urban areas without the exclusion of rural areas. A good example of unfairness in Plan\_17, that you now call Plan\_A, is that you break up rural Hāmākua, you move Waikōloa into a Kona district that it has no real interest in. Like the rest of West Hawai'i, we use Costco and the airport, but all of our other shopping is probably done in Waimea. The hospital is in Waimea. It is a rural community; we have a shared vision with

the Community Development Plan. Earlier there were remarks about whether Lakeland was represented. I have spent a great deal of time in the South Kohala Traffic Safety Committee. We have had people from North Kohala, because of the shared connectivity of roads, appear at our committee and have problems that need solving; same thing with Lakeland. But to move us into Kona, makes no sense. We are roughly 8,000 people. My feeling is that in 20,000 people, most likely the representative will come out of the urban area of Kona and it makes sense for a politician to satisfy those 12,000 at the expense of the 8,000. Kona is mostly an urban center and a sprawling urban center. Waikōloa is just a small village near the coast, trying to protect the reefs, trying to protect the mountain. It is a traditional district, the people think that way, they should be allowed to stay that way. I think it is time that you stop pushing Commissioners Plan\_A, which was Plan\_17, which was Plan\_46; you keep going back to it, there is more and more testimony opposed to it. I think it is time you move to what the community wants; and I would appreciate you doing that. Focus on fairness instead of politics. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Do we have another testifier in Waimea?

MR. HIRT: Yes, our next testifier is Alexandra Bernstein, representing herself, and she also wishes to represent Fran Taber who signed up to testify but had to leave.

ALEXANDRA BERNSTEIN

(At this time Alexandra Bernstein came forward via videoconference from Waimea to address members of the Commission.)

MS. BERNSTEIN: Waikōloa is more tied to Waimea than to any other area on the island. We share infrastructure, and really important things like water and medical care, and the South Kohala Community Development Plan, that basically keeps us moving forward, and remain intact. Most of my life is lived in Waimea and Waikōloa, equally, in terms of socially and shopping that I do. I only go to Kona maybe six times a year to get my car fixed or run some errands, and I feel that a representative that is representing mostly Kona wouldn't be that interested in the concerns that we have as much as the representative who represents an area like Waimea because we are both communities in the middle of big ag lands, and in the middle of big undeveloped areas and we have different concerns than the city that is very, very dependent on tourism.

Fran wanted to say that she feels that we have common goals with Waimea and a very strong relationship, and she is a resident of Waimea. She said it would be to everyone's advantage right now to keep Waikōloa with the rest of South Kohala because a number of important pending projects will be coming up in the next decade. For example, the South Kohala corridors where major infrastructure and inter-island facility issues will be confronted, such as the design and construction of the proposed bypass from Kawaihae Harbor across South Kohala. Keep up the good work.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. We now move to Pāhoa.

MS. LIVELY: Thank you. Next we have Joyce Folena, and she is commenting on Plan\_40 and Plan\_A.

JOYCE FOLENA

(At this time Joyce Folena came forward via videoconference from Pāhoa to address members of the Commission.)

MS. FOLENA: Good bye Plan\_A and thank you Plan\_40. I have comments concerning Plan\_40, and I wish I was more educated into exactly where these boundary lines are in relationship to Kea'au and parts of Hilo. I am assuming in that Plan\_40, Council District 3 is comprised of Hilo. I hope I am right. My concern, being a resident of Puna for nearly 28 years, to the day; 28 years this month; it is the only district in which I have resided in Hawai'i. My concern is that Puna, being able to have two districts, contains two Puna districts, and that we do not, at any time, become absorbed into a Hilo district, with the voting block being in Hilo. Our needs are vastly different from Hilo's. So what I have to say to you in a concentrated amount of time is with all of your considerations and tweaking and changes and amendments to the map--and I am assuming map 40 will be your number one priority here--that you definitely give geographical Puna two voting districts, two Puna voting districts, with two Puna residents as our representatives on the Council. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We now come back to Hilo. Our next testifier is Ruth A. Smith of Waikōloa.

RUTH SMITH

(At this time Ruth Smith came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MS. SMITH: Good morning, I am Ruth Smith and I am here today as an individual citizen. I am also the Vice Principal of Waikōloa Elementary and Middle School, a school of 800 students. I served on the Steering Committee of the South Kohala Community Development Plan, a plan that we worked on for almost a seven year period. There has been some question about how that map falls. I brought a copy of our plan and all of Waimea is included in the South Kohala Community Development Plan. So it is Puakō, Kawaihae, Waikōloa, and Waimea that are included in those plans. I have lived in three of those places in my quarter of a century on the Big Island. I appreciate the points that have been made here. The real critical things about how we have very strong ties to the South Kohala district. Even with Waikōloa Middle Schoolers feeding to Kealakehe High School as our High School. A geographical line will not create community. The community exists within the South Kohala area. The CDP process we went through was by far the most democratic process I've ever participated in. We had hundreds of little meetings with people, we collected a lot of data, we worked really hard. I had the privilege of serving with Margaret Wille and Dr. Billy Bergen, and other people in coming together with a well thought out plan. My deep concern is if we were pulled off into the Kona area. Kona has a CDP that gives no consideration to Waikōloa whatsoever. If we are not represented there and we are not represented with Waimea and the others, we really don't have a master plan for Waikōloa; and there is huge development plans there. So, I know how much time and effort it took for me to understand just what we did, and to ask for a councilman to get

expertise in both the Kona area and the Waikōloa area is above and beyond the call of duty, and not very realistic. So for historical, cultural reasons, I would request respectfully that Waikōloa be included in the South Kohala area. I have sympathy for the areas in Lakeland, and I have sympathy for the question about Volcano. I look at my former neighbor, Linda. She was my neighbor in Waikōloa and now she is over in Volcano. Unfortunately, population hasn't developed nicely and neatly, so it makes your job easy; and you do have the constraints of your numbers to look at. So, I commend you in going forward with this difficult job, and would appreciate you taking every consideration.

MR. CARVALHO: Can I see that plan please?

MS. SMITH: The best picture here that shows---I was looking at the overview, because there are different plans for each of the four communities. If you look here, this is what the CDP addressed here. So, it does go all the way to Lakeland; the four areas were the primary focus, and it did include all of Waimea, moving towards Lakeland and the more rural part of Waimea.

MR. CARVALHO: Can I look at it closer? You can drop it off up here, and I'll take a look.

MS. SMITH: Happily, this is an extra copy.

MR. MELROSE: I have a quick question. I just want to understand, from a school perspective, what is the basin for Waikōloa Elementary School, the collection basin for kids? You just have an Elementary School, right?

MS. SMITH: No, we have an Elementary School and a full Middle School; sixth, seventh and eighth.

MR. MELROSE: And the collection basin for that includes Kawaihae, or---

MS. SMITH: No, Kawaihae students, the few students that live in Kawaihae Village, attend Waimea School. The Puakō students attend Waikōloa School, and all of Puakō and Waikōloa go to Kealakehe High School.

MR. MELROSE: So all of the kids who go to your school are from either Puakō or Waikōloa.

MS. SMITH: They are from Waikōloa. We have a very few number of students who are from the resort area; we don't have a lot. Contrary to popular belief, Waikōloa is not just a wealthy haole community. Actually half of our school is on free or reduced lunch. Thank you very much, and good luck.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Our next testifier in Hilo is James Willock, representing the Waikōloa Village Association.

JAMES WILLOCK

(At this time James Willock came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. WILLOCK Good morning, thank you. I certainly have a lot of respect and compassion for what you are trying to do today. I'll tell you. My name is Jim Willock, and I am the General Manager of Waikōloa Village Association. I am also a home owner in Waikōloa Village. The Waikōloa Village Association represents about 96% of roughly 8,000 people in the village. So, we go a little bit beyond just a normal association. We need Plan\_40. We need it for a variety of reasons. Most of them were already addressed to you both verbally and in the written testimony. What I find interesting is that I have not been able to find one written testimony or I haven't heard one verbal testimony that is supporting Plan\_A, yet Plan\_A remains on the table. Please don't tweak Plan\_A to try and make it work for the politicians; make it work for the folks; make it work for the voters, the people who put the politicians in place. I have lived, worked, and been actively involved in both Waikōloa and Kona for a large number of years now, so I know both communities very, very well. I think that we, in Waikōloa, share significant common interests and a sense of community with Waimea. Waimea is our community, it's our town; it is where we live away from our homes, where we shop, where we go to the doctor. We think of Waimea as our town. I think somebody said when we go to Kona we only go to the airport and Costco; and I had to laugh, because that is pretty much what we find our way going to Kona. Kona has an entirely different community feel, it has an entirely different set of needs, entirely different set of issues.

The CDP is a huge issue as well, but it is important that we remain part of this community in South Kohala and in Waimea. I think that I have a unique take on it because of my position with the association, besides being just a homeowner. I spend a considerable amount of my time working with our County representative, and I find that working with a representative that knows what our needs are, what our wants are, makes it a lot easier than to try to work with someone who is going to try and put their focus into the larger community. I have been involved in and out of the political arena for many, many years of my life and I have to tell you, that is human nature, you are going to go where the votes are. That is just the way it's going to be. They were talking a little bit about the DOE and the school; you were asking about the schools earlier. The DOE has a plan to build a high school that is going to be the high school for Waimea and for Waikōloa; not for Kona and Waikōloa, but for Waimea and Waikōloa. They recognize that we are a community in Waimea and Waikōloa, and that is the way the high school will be built when it is built, by the department of understanding.

You know, I understand that you have a difficult task, and you have numbers that you have got to reach. I fully understand that, but this is not a numbers issue to us who live in the homes. This is a people issue, and I think we need to focus on the people here and not on the numbers. We can make the numbers work with Plan\_40; with the hybrid. I fully understand the Lakeland issue, but I support Pete's comments, don't try to help a few people by harming a lot. Let me finish by pointing out that not one testifier, again, written or verbal, has supported Plan\_A, and I find it quite surprising that it is even still on the table and my concern is that you might have a desire to tweak that plan to continue to keep

it alive, and to make that the plan. Please don't do that, work for the people who vote for the politicians. Thank you very much.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. The next testifier in Hilo is Bette Green.

BETTE GREEN

(At this time Betty Green came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MS. GREEN: Good afternoon, my name is Bette Green. I currently live in Waikōloa. I have been here about three years full time, but I have been on and off this island for the past half century because I married someone who was born here. Over that period of time, visiting all of his relatives and friends, and things like that, I learned about the geography and the constraints it had or put upon where people lived and what kinds of people lived together and I think that Plan\_40 most reflects those kinds of issues. I would also like to say that I currently serve as President of the Friends of the Library; Waikōloa Region. I think we have some great plans and I would very much like to see us remain in the South Kohala community development area. I appreciate all the hard work; I hope you guys can help us stay together in South Kohala. Mahalo.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. I would like to go to Waimea now.

MR. HIRT: Our next testifier is Chris Kutler, representing herself, speaking in support of Plan\_40.

CHRIS KUTLER

(At this time Chris Kutler came forward via videoconference from Waimea to address members of the Commission.)

MS. KUTLER: I am a resident and a homeowner in Waikōloa Village. I support Plan\_40 and oppose the Commission Plan\_A. Waikōloa should not be split and must remain in District 9 with similar communitites. We developed our CDP to address our community's needs and culture. The CDP for District 8 does not. I do not believe we will have representation if we are in District 8, thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. We can take another testifier from Waimea since that was short and sweet.

MR. HIRT: Our next testifier is Patricia Cassel, representing herself, speaking in support of Plan\_40.

PATRICIA CASSEL

(At this time Patricia Cassel came forward via videoconference from Waimea to address members of the Commission.)

MS. CASSEL: I am a homeowner in Waikoloa Village. I oppose Commission Plan\_A. I have had an opportunity to review the most recent revision of Plan\_40, and support that plan which

preserves the integrity of Hāmākua district and keeps Waikōloa and Puakō in District 9. As many other testifiers have said, Waikōloa is linked historically, economically, and socially with Waimea. They are both integral parts of the South Kohala Community Development Plan, the North Hawai‘i Community Hospital Service Area, and the South Kohala Traffic Safety Commission. Waikōloa does not belong with Kona, but with Waimea. So I urge you to keep Waikōloa undivided and in District 9 by supporting Plan\_40, which accomplishes this objective. Thank you very much for the opportunity to testify.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Let’s go to Pāhoa.

MS. LIVELY: Thank you Madam Chair our final testifier here this morning is Greg Smith, and he will be commenting on Plan\_40 and Plan\_A.

GREGORY SMITH

(At this time Gregory Smith came forward via videoconference from Pāhoa to address members of the Commission.)

MR. SMITH: Good morning Commissioners, and thank you again for your hard work. Again, I echo the commentary of other people about Plan\_A; I think it is totally unreasonable and should be taken off the table. I think Plan\_40 is, so far, the best that you have come up with. Again, I think that you should revisit Plan\_40 with Plan\_11. I believe this would keep the people of Waikōloa with South Kohala. I also believe too, that it would keep most of Puna in two districts. Under most circumstances, I don’t want to see any of our excess population go to Hilo. I hate to sound vindictive, but the thing is, is that for the 23 years that I have been on this island, we have suffered from Hilo centric politics and policies that have basically hurt the growth of our community. We are the most underrepresented. Just to remind people all across the island, Puna is the fastest growing district in the State of Hawai‘i. We take care of a lot of social problems in our community island wide; i.e. the poor people, the people who can’t afford to live in other parts of the island, this is where they live. The fact is, our infrastructure is some of the poorest, and way behind; 30 to 40 years behind our population growth. Nonetheless, if we need to give up excess population, which apparently we have to do, I would prefer it to be given to at least Ka‘ū, and not give any population to Hilo because I am sick of having Hilo centric politics and policies imposed upon us, the people of Puna. I know Volcano and the Puna mauka communities want to be a part of the two Puna districts; but apparently that’s just not going to happen. At least Ka‘ū and Puna are very much similar as sister communities. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Now we come back to Hilo; Erik Jacobson.

ERIK JACOBSON

(At this time Erik Jacobson came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. JACOBSON: Hello, good morning. I am from Waikōloa Village and I would like to testify that our community does have the connection with Waimea. Our social gatherings on the part of the Rotary Club, it is Rotary Club of North Hawai‘i, we don’t attend the

Kona one. Our church functions, when we get together, it is in that community as well. You have heard it from a lot of people, and I'm throwing in my two cents as well. We would like to stay with South Kohala. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you; Jennifer Lienhart Tsuji.

JENNIFER LIENHART TSUJI

(At this time Jennifer Lienhart Tsuji came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MS. LIENHART TSUJI: Aloha, and thank you for your service and dedication, and you are being open to the people's opinions and concerns. My name is Jennifer Leinhart Tsuji, I am here as an individual and a resident of Waikōloa Village. I am also the District 7 Democratic Party Chair. I am a proud graduate of the Ulu Mau Leadership Program and I am also a substitute teacher. But most of all I am a mother. I have been a resident of Waikōloa for thirteen years. I have to sit here and I have to ask the basic question that I am sure you have asked yourself a million times; what is community? For me, community is where you live, work, and interact with other individuals. My family, and every other family that I know in Waikōloa Village, we live Waimea. We don't live in Waimea, but we live Waimea. Our common interests include cultural, our resources for cultural knowledge and education are Waimea. For me, and 50% of Anunciation Catholic Church live in Waikōloa; but we live Waimea. A good number of my young family and young mothers with young children have had their children Waimea, North Community Hospital. A good many of us do our financial obligations, as well as our financial transactions happen Waimea, our children's social activities, educational activities; Waimea. Just recently we finished with the ASYO Soccer League; that is Waimea, Honoka'a, Waikōloa, Puakō, up to Kawaihae, North Kohala area. It is the North Region.

I ask you to please consider our keiki when making your choice. Waikōloa is no longer the village it was twenty years ago. We are a community of young families, hard workers, from many different ethnic groups, income levels, religious beliefs, political beliefs, and age groups. With this said, I would like to request your vote to be for Plan\_40, dated October 26, 2011, and that Plan\_A be removed from consideration based on today's overwhelming support for Plan\_40. Thank you for this opportunity to testify.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you for your testimony. Our next testifier in Hilo is Stephanie Stearns, representing Waikōloa Senior Center.

STEPHANIE STEARNS

(At this time Stephanie Stearns came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MS. STEARNS: Good morning, I am Stephanie Stearns, and I am the President of the Waikōloa Senior Center. I am also on the Leadership Council in Waikōloa and that is chaired by Mike Fisher and Ashan Schultz, who is heavily involved with the South Kohala Community Development Plan. We are linked part and parcel with Waikōloa and Waimea. We have common roads, common interests. We have a whole plan that has been worked on for years together, and I really ask you not to separate us in our representation. On the

Leadership Council, Pete Hoffmann comes and sits with us and I do not believe we are going to get the same type of representation if you move us to Kona. The County of Aging representative that comes down to Waikōloa, lives in Waimea. You have heard it time and time again, I'm not going to reiterate all the common bonds that we share. I ask you to please throw Plan\_A off the table and endorse either Plan\_40, or any plan that does not split the South Kohala representation. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Let's go to Waimea for a testifier.

MR. HIRT: Good morning, our next testifier is Carol Diericks

CAROL DIERICKS

(At this time Carol Diericks came forward via videoconference from Waimea to address members of the Commission.)

MS. DIERICKS: Good morning, Madam Chairman and Council; thank you very much for all your hard work and efforts and I know this is a difficult process. Again, my name is Carol Diericks and I'm representing my husband, who couldn't be here today; Dan Diericks. We are Hawai'i homeowners and voters, we live in Waikōloa Village. We have reviewed the revised plans, and we are hoping you will remove Plan\_A. I have not heard of anybody in support of Plan\_A, and I'm not sure why you are still considering it at all. We support Plan\_40 which is fair and does not split up Waikōloa area or the Hāmākua area. Waikōloa, as you have heard, is very tied to the Waimea area and it needs to stay in District 9. It would be very bad to move us to the Kona district. As you have heard from testifiers from all around the island, from Kona, Honoka'a, Waikōloa, Pāhoa, everyone seems to be for Plan\_40, and against Plan\_A. Margaret Wille went around the whole island talking to the people, and that is how she came up with the Plan\_40. It is obvious that you should consider Plan\_40, so please honor that. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Let's go back to Hilo. Hans Heydorn.

HANS HEYDORN

(At this time Hans Heydorn came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. HEYDORN: Good morning, my name is Hans Heydorn. We do reside in Waikōloa Village, and I am in support of Plan\_40, and I hope you give fair consideration to all the views expressed by my neighbors. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you very much. Our next testifier in Hilo is Lonnie Cole, who is the Waikōloa Village Association President.

LONNIE COLE

(At this time Lonnie Cole came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. COLE: Good morning, aloha. I testified at Waimea, when we had the meeting in Waimea on the redistricting. I only had two days notice to talk to people after I found out

about it, and testified in Waimea. Well, since then, I have held a talk story and talked to several hundred people in the Village and without exception; everybody wants Plan\_40, as it is modified now. Thank came across very strongly, and we want to remain with Waimea and Kohala. I won't go into any more details, because you have heard them all. But, please consider strongly proposal, or Plan\_40. Thank you very much.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Now, in Hilo; Steve Offenbaker.

STEVE OFFENBAKER

(At this time Steve Offenbaker came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. OFFENBAKER: Good morning Commissioners, I will try to be as brief as possible. I am here to speak against the proposals as they currently exist in Plan\_A. I believe that what Plan\_A does in a nutshell is sacrifices the whole of the Hāmākua coast; Waikōloa, Puakō, to ensure that Hilo remains with three council seats. What brings me to that conclusion is the fact that if you look at the boundaries on Plan\_A, the Hilo side of that boundary basically pushes into urban downtown Hilo across the Wailuku River. You are looking at about 6,500 people moving into Council District 1; that constitutes 34% of the district population coming from the Hilo side of the Wailuku River. That pretty much cements that District 1 will be represented by somebody from Hilo. That gives Hilo an unwarranted, unnecessary third seat. In the last 48 hours, I believe that Hāmākua has begun to stand up and ask for help and ask for protection.

So I talk directly now to Ms. Poindexter, our Commissioner. We are trying to give you the support, we are trying to give you the ammunition; we ask you to stand up for us now. We ask you to fight any plan, whether Plan\_40 is modified or Plan\_A, that splits Hāmākua. I know in asking for that to happen, it kind of says to Volcano that you get to stay in Ka'ū. And while someone is going to be told that, they have to do something they don't want to do. What Volcano has is an advantage over anybody else that has been proposed to move, is that moving Volcano, or in fact leaving it in Ka'ū, allows it to demand attention. The size of Volcano, the number of people there, requires the representative from that Council district to pay attention. If Honoka'a goes into Waimea, nobody is going to pay attention. If Hilo moves into Council District 1, nobody is going to pay attention to Laupahoehoe, Paaui, O'okala; nobody will listen because they don't have to as long as Hilo is happy, they are re-elected. This plan, for whatever reason, simply put, is a Hilo plan, for Hilo people. I really hope that today it is killed, and if it's not, I ask you to motion for a public hearing in Honoka'a to address the split of Hāmākua; because that was never discussed at any public hearing. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We now go back to Waimea.

MR. HIRT: Yes, our next testifier is Gary Cassel, here to speak in support of Plan\_40.

GARY CASSEL

(At this time Gary Cassel came forward via videoconference from Waimea to address members of the Commission.)

MR. CASSEL: Very briefly, for all the reasons that have been mentioned today, I strongly urge the Council to support Plan\_40. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Waimea, how many more testifiers do you have?

MR. HIRT: We have seven more.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Okay, let's take one more.

MR. HIRT: Our next testifier is Randy Kutler, speaking in support of Plan\_40.

RANDY KUTLER

(At this time Randy Kutler came forward via videoconference to address members of the Commission.)

MR. KUTLER: Good morning. I am a Waikōloa Village resident and I live in Waikōloa. I support Plan\_40. I feel that separating Waikōloa Village into two different districts would be a mistake. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Okay, we now have Brenda Ford testifying. Do we need some time to put your map up, to arrange that? Brenda has submitted a plan and we are going to look at it on the screen as she testifies so that she can refer to it. Here comes Shyla now. Waimea, let's take one more while they set up over here.

MR. HIRT: Okay, our next testifier is George Robinson, representing Puakō Community Association and he is here to speak in support of Plan\_40.

GEORGE ROBINSON

(At this time George Robinson came forward via videoconference from Waimea to address members of the Commission.)

MR. ROBINSON: Hello folks, you have seen me many times. I just want to thank you for the work you are doing. I really want to acknowledge you for protecting Puakō and keeping us associated with Waimea and North Kohala, which is what we have asked for continuously. I really appreciate that on behalf of the Puakō community. I just ask that you continue to take that stand as you deliberate on the best configuration. We support Plan\_40 over Plan\_A, because it seems to be a better balance of districts, island wide. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. We are coming back to Hilo now to Brenda Ford.

BRENDA FORD

(At this time Brenda Ford came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MS. FORD: Can everyone see the map that is over my shoulder? Okay, thank you. Good morning, Commissioners, and thank you for allowing all of us to testify. I am not happy with Plan\_A or Plan\_40, so I submitted a hybrid. Every plan needs to be tweaked, including this one. This is not about me; this is about getting a fair plan. So I'm not going to read most of my testimony. I would like to say that everybody on this island, in this room, can tell you what district they think they should be in. What some of them are not saying is what district they absolutely do not want to be associated with. And it is coming across loudly and clearly, and with all due respect to the Commissioners from Hilo, anybody who lives outside of Hilo wants nothing to do with the possibility of having a representative from Hilo. It has been unfortunately very clear, I don't need to go into all the details; you have heard it before.

In my plan, which I am calling the hybrid, Hilo has two districts, and Kaumana stays with Hilo. Puna has two complete districts inside of the geographical boundaries of Puna. Almost all Puna residents that need to be assigned to another district are in the Volcano area, which I have assigned with Ka'ū, South Kona, and southern North Kona. Basically, Volcano, upper and lower, will stay in the same district where it has been for at least ten years. Attempting to put Volcano in the Puna district means a third district for Hilo, populated by many Puna residents who will not be able to get a Puna representative elected. And that district will be controlled by Hilo, i.e. you have a third district in Hilo. Volcano could be with Hilo, Puna, or Ka'ū; and we all know where Volcano wants to be, and that is obviously in Puna. However, I chose Ka'ū as the least objectionable of these three alternatives; you must decide where Volcano would hate to be the most, eliminate that possibility, and then decide where the numbers are going to work.

Kailua Village remains in one district, because of the Business Improvement District. It is very important that this urban core of Kona be recognized by a district so that its characteristics and the support and the CDP be adhered to. These particular residents in the Kailua Village area have never had single representation. They have always been split between two districts. District 8 is the northern area of Kona; it is also the access to Saddle Road. In Plan\_A, you have got a thumb sticking up from District 6 up to the South edge of Saddle Road; you cannot get from District 6 to Saddle Road without driving through District 7 and District 8 to get up to Saddle Road. It is an illegality; it needs---Just get rid of that plan completely. It does have some good things; because my plan is a hybrid of both of them. District 9 contains Waikōloa Village and most of Waimea, excluding the Lakeland area. Kohala, like Kona, is too big to fit into just a single district. In fact, what has not been mentioned here is that historically, and currently, South Kona, the district I live in, has been split between Kona and Ka'ū, and nobody raises that as an issue. You have got to consider that somebody is going to get someplace and South Kona has always been split.

Lakeland goes with Hāmākua in my plan because it just doesn't fit into the deviations, which are very high in this plan, but because this Commission has chosen to keep communities of interest together, I put in the high deviations. You cannot use Hāmākua to encroach upon Hilo; you cannot do it. They have nothing in common. I will stop here, my

time is up. I will be around if you need to talk about this. I wanted the community and the council to see this plan, thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you Brenda. Are you aware that your map has some major connectivity issues in District 5? For example, Kalapana, Black Sands Subdivision and Kaohe Homesteads, cannot access other parts of their district because of where you put the District 4 boundary.

MS. FORD: You know that district better than me; I said this plan needs to be tweaked; it needs to be tweaked. I still think it eliminates the worst problems of Plan\_40 and Plan\_A, but it still needs to be tweaked. I rely on all of you to do that.

CHR. SIRACUSA: That is our job.

MR. MELROSE: I have a question. Thank you, Brenda. I appreciate your work on this. You know, in the Bill that you crafted to design this process, you have a provision in the Bill that says that places that are growing faster need to be accommodated. The fastest growing districts, in your plan, are actually at the highest level of the variation. So, I think that that concept is a struggle for us; we have always struggled with that. I think we ought to suggest some amendments to your Bill when we get through actually exercising it; because this kind of stuff makes it very hard for us.

MS. FORD: It's correct, I personally don't think the Bill needs to be changed; the Ordinance, now it is an Ordinance. You have an out, as you all know. And the out is that if you choose not to use one of the criteria, all you need to do is put it in your final plan and explain why you didn't use it. You have an out. But, I wanted the Commission to consider the high growth areas and try to get the lowest populations. Unfortunately, what we have heard from communities all around the island is, "Keep the communities of interest together." If that is going to become your top priority, there is no problem with that. Just justify it in your final plan, and you are good to go. Puna has made it very clear that they want two districts, which they certainly deserve, and they want to keep as much of Puna together as they possibly can. My caution, and I put it in my testimony, is don't go over the 10%, don't go over the 4.99%, because that will make your plan voidable on its face at the U.S. Supreme Court. You can do this. I know you can do this. I know where some tweaking needs to happen, and representatives from Puna and wherever, you know where it needs to be tweaked. The problem is you have got to get rid of the worst problems, and that is what this plan is trying to do; get rid of the worst problems. You can justify what you need to do in a court of law, if it's in your final plan. This is what we chose as a more important criteria than criteria x. I don't think the Ordinance needs to be changed, you just need to do your job in your final report, and you can do it.

MR. MELROSE: One more question. Can you just explain where is Puakō in your plan?

MS. FORD: Puakō, in my plan, is not with Kohala. I think it is a problem, and I think that needs to be tweaked. But at this point, I left it out just to get numbers. You need to do something with that. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Our next testifier in Hilo is Yen Chin representing Friends of Puna's Future.

YEN CHIN

(At this time Yen Chin came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. CHIN: Good morning Commissioners. Many years ago I studied to become a school teacher. In the course of those studies, I learned much about holding a job that was under paid and over worked. A job about which everybody in the world thought they were better able to perform than me. Consequently, I have a great deal of empathy for the situation you all find yourselves in right now, and have found yourselves in for the past several months. On behalf of Friends of Puna's Future, I say thank you for your hard work, diligence, and integrity. No doubt, when you have completed that work, some people will be dissatisfied. This cannot be helped given the Gordian knot at your feet. It is my job as President of Friends of Puna's future to do my best to ensure that we in Puna are not among the disgruntled. So once again, I appear before you to urge you to make a final product that gives Puna its fair and just due. Puna, for all of its internal differences, diversity really, has more in common interest with itself than it does with Hilo or Ka'ū. Our population argues for, indeed it demands, that redistricting creates two Puna districts; neither of which should contain parts of South Hilo. Volcano shares more interest with Puna than it shares with Ka'ū, consequently it probably belongs in one of those Puna districts. Hawaiian Paradise Park should not be divided between two districts. I know that you have heard these and other contentions before, so I won't consume your precious time expounding on specifics again. I know today is not a day for voting up or down on any specific plans. This is still a time for works in progress. However, if I had to choose between Plan\_40 and Plan\_A, I would choose Plan\_A. But really, all I want to do now is appeal to your sense of justice and to assure you that we in Puna have not yet begun to gather the feathers or heat the tar.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. I have a question Yen. If we could tweak any of these plans to keep Volcano in Puna, including the Puna mauka subdivisions between Stainback Highway and Highway 11, and to have a Puna makai, and a Puna mauka, rather than an east/west division; would you go for that kind of an addition to say Plan\_40?

MR. CHIN: Yes. In a sense, we have the luxury of advocating for our own interests, and paying less than complete attention to the interests of other communities like Waikōloa. You don't have that luxury. When our folks have worked with plans and tried to create proposals, we have paid some attention to what we believed were the legitimate interests of other communities, but we are really not in a position to know that as thoroughly as people on this Commission. So, we advocate for what we want; we hope for the best, but we also trust.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Let's go to Waimea.

MR. HIRT: Good morning Madam Chair our next testifier is Barbara Funk representing herself to speak in support of Plan\_40.

BARBARA FUNK

(At this time Barbara Funk came forward via videoconference from Waimea to address members of the Commission.)

MS. FUNK: Barbara Funk from Waikōloa. I support Plan\_40 as it fulfills two criteria that I am in favor of. Number one, it keeps Waikōloa intact as a united community. Number two, it keeps the integrity of the South Kohala CDP intact. Thank you for your time.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. We will take another testifier from Waimea.

MR. HIRT: Our next testifier is Chris Gaughen speaking in support of Plan\_40, representing herself.

CHRIS GAUGHEN

(At this time Chris Gaughen came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MS. GAUGHEN: Hello, my name is Chris Gaughen, and I live in Waikōloa. I want to thank you for your previously listening so carefully to the importance of Waikōloa not being split; and that is reflected in Plan\_40. I want to express my support for keeping Waikōloa in the same district as Waimea. They are part of the extensive work that was done on the South Kohala CDP. I also want to express that the Commission has my trust that it will evenly and fairly distribute the number of council persons throughout the various districts and that it will avoid any redistricting that will result in Hilo having three, an unfair number, of council people. I want to thank you for your time in hearing my concerns. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Waimea, how many more testifiers do you have over there?

MR. HIRT: We have three more.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Okay. In Hilo, we will now call up Margaret Wille.

MARGARET WILLE

(At this time Margaret Wille came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MS. WILLE: Good afternoon, Commissioners; Margaret Wille. I want to say that my focus has been to try to come up with what was best for the entire island looking forward over the next ten years, and what would cause the least harm all the way around; or the most pono. I think Plan\_A, as it is now, is unjust. It is just plain unjust to Hāmākua. I think, as Bob Green said, there are really six key districts, regions; each one of those should have at least one independent council member and not---I'm not saying that it is intentional or unintentional, but the way that Plan\_A is done, it is skewed to the advantage of Hilo, when you have a block of urban voters. It's not just the numbers, it's that block tends to vote in their representative. And I think people in Puna should be able to appreciate that. I

want to say something particular about Waikōloa, and why I think you see so many people from Waikōloa. Many of us sort of identify with our towns and I see Waikōloa is South Kohala. Their voice, and the meetings they go to, and how they represent themselves, is the voice, is the heart of South Kohala, Waikōloa and Puakō together. I think that is why this is so important to them. On the CDP--I was on that CDP Steering Committee--Lakeland was right there, I never thought of Lakeland as elsewhere, and I think Lakeland and Volcano straddle two districts. Lakeland, if you see the sign, Hāmākua is right after the turn into Lakeland. It is also where the upper Hāmākua Ditch is. There are some reasons why that area whet with Hāmākua. Volcano, putting it in Puna, is maybe socially good, but it also goes into Ka‘ū. Let me say, Map 40, if you can divorce yourselves from having all of the districts on each of these communities have everyone together and are willing to shave as Waimea is right now, I have put together what I see as an alternative and I will submit it and you can look at it for the next meeting, that basically cuts a little off of each of these communities such that the bulk of Volcano is where it wants to be, the bulk of Waikōloa is where it wants to be, the bulk of Puakō, the bulk of Waimea.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you.

MS. POINDEXTER: Madam Chair, I would just like to say one thing. I just wanted the public to know also, that when the Map 40 was designed, it was with the help of the Commissioners, when we were at the Kona meeting. We were deciding what maps to keep and work on, so what we did was we did a little tweaking on that so that we could save that as Map 40. If I’m not correct say so. So, know that the Commissioners have been working with the spirit of working together. So I’m hoping that we still have that spirit of aloha when we work together and we don’t go out in public to make the public perceive, or name calling, or the personal attacks, because we truly here as Commissioners, are working as a team. We all have our individual opinions, but we truly come together and we are really working together for the betterment of our communities and the entire whole of our island. We love our island. We are not giving up our time because we want to do something political; it’s because we love our people. I just want you guys to know that our heart is in it and we truly care about the people. I understand that some people are not going to be happy, and we don’t have control of that; but just to let you know that we are willing to work with everybody.

MS. WILLE: We could call it Commission Plan\_B at this point.

MS. POINDEXTER: That is another thing that may come up. But I just want to ask that we all work together in the spirit of aloha, and we put away the name calling and that whole personal attack kind of stuff, because then you bring in other pilikia and it’s not good. So if we want to say we want to be pono, we all need to work together with the spirit of aloha. So, thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Let the record show that Patrick Kahawaiola‘a has joined us.

MR. KAHUI: I do want to state for the record that Margaret has been engaged in this process from the beginning. Plan\_40 did arise out of Margaret's efforts. So, personally, I want to commend her because of all the testimony and all the work that has been done, it's really apparent that she has taken a lot to draft a plan that meets our objectives. And if our objective is to keep communities together, and if our objective is to make sure that one person, one vote, then I think we would have accomplished our task. Having said that, and looking at the record today, by the way, I have been keeping a matrix of testifiers and frankly, I'm sure why we are even having more testimony. It's apparent that Plan\_A doesn't work, and at some point I'd like to motion that we eliminate Plan\_A so we can move on Plan\_40 and the new revision for that plan, so we can get on with our task. Mahalo.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. I would like to point out that we are still in public testimony, so we can't do motions right now. We have to wait until we get to that point in the agenda.

MR. CARVALHO: I would just like to commend Margaret for her hard and diligent work throughout the whole island. Thank you, Margaret.

MS. POINDEXTER: Just one more thing. Margaret, I understand that, but it did take a lot of the people from Puna and all the different areas that gave you that opportunity to create what you created. So it's not just a Margaret Wille thing, it is our entire island. And a lot of our people have contributed a lot to that map, so it made it easy for Margaret Wille to come up with what you came up with. Am I right?

MS. WILLE: I worked on what René said for maybe eight hours.

MS. POINDEXTER: So, I want to make sure the public knows that this came from all of you, and Margaret Wille, thank you for your time for bringing it all together for us to help all of the communities.

MR. MELROSE: I understand that comment and I appreciate the time you put into it. I want to say that you have also been the most divisive person in the conversations thus far. You have chosen to make it political, to claim and assert in you blog and in writings and in emails that we are, in fact somehow disingenuous. I want to say that that is inappropriate, and it actually poisons your well in my view. Your way of doing it is unnecessary, and we are continuing to work on this process. We didn't get to the addition at the last meeting, so that is why we don't have a Plan\_B and we will get on to it today. But the amount of poison in the well that came out of your communications, and your allegations to us personally, is absolutely inappropriate and I think personally, just confusing me and my brother and trying to create perceptions of us as somehow inappropriate people for doing this, is not a way to get the best for the community. So I hope in future conversations, you can avoid that political allegation well before they are necessary, and can move forward in a spirit of cooperation rather than separation.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you, Jeff. I would now like to call up the next testifier in Hilo.

MS. WILLE: I would just like to comment to that. I brought forward the plan that I worked on, and I felt that it was being totally ignored to some extent at the last meeting. So I may, I apologize to the extent that I took a two by four and went around not just to you all, but say to Hāmākua to speak up to this. So, I agree that I've been aggressive about it, and trying to promote it. I haven't said anything as intentional or unintentional. I think it is skewed to Hilo; that is what I said.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I would just like to point out that you left the last meeting an hour early. More happened and you weren't aware of it. But we never took Plan\_40 off the table, which you accused us of doing. At any rate, we have accepted your apology and we have cleared the air, and let's move on, please. Jon Olson is the next testifier.

JON OLSON

(At this time Jon Olson came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. OLSON: Good morning, Jon Olson here. I guess you all know, I chaired the Puna Community Development Plan Steering Committee. The first thing I would like to make clear is that Volcano is socially and economically a part of Puna. They were significant contributors to the CDP, both in time and energy and personal capital. To have them removed from Puna, I think, would be to our detriment, to Puna's detriment. If you need to create a third district, I would suggest to you that that third district needs to be in Puna. Tell me what district on this island has had 40% growth in any of the last 50 years; oh, Puna. What district on this island has had 30% growth in the last 50 years; oh, Puna. What district has 40,000 buildable lots in private hands; oh, Puna. What district has been socially and economically disadvantaged for the last half century; oh, Puna. I don't think I need to go on about this. If there is to be some kind of advantage from this plan--and we wish to talk about fairness--it's about time Puna got maybe above, if you want to talk about just simple fairness. The process itself, you figure that of roughly 40,000 TMK's that are sitting there waiting to be built on, a third of those lots are in the hands of Hawai'i residents, meaning that they could be voters in the Puna district by tearing the page out of the front of the phone book and sending it in. That is all it would take for them to become residents of the district of Puna; they own land. That is not going to change. The numbers, if you go forward with any of the current plans, within five years we will be under represented again. And that is if we only get 20% or 25% of growth, which is highly unlikely given that the baby boomers, those of them that still have wealth, that number in the tens of millions are going to come and live on their land. You know it, and I know it. They are coming to build a dream. So, if you need to find a home for another district; it is in Puna. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you, Jon.

MR. MELROSE: Jon, are you suggesting that because you say you will be under represented in a period of a couple of years, are you suggesting that perhaps the district should be at a lower end of the population, so you grow into your representation? Or, some

plans have Puna at a high end of that trying to get as many people into the district as possible. What is your opinion on being dense or being under?

MR. OLSON: If it creates three districts, yes.

MR. MELROSE: You won't get three districts; there isn't enough population for it. In the two districts that you will get, do you suggest that we be at the low end so that you can grow into your representation, or do you think that we should, as some plans suggest, be at the high end?

MR. OLSON: I don't agree with your first premise there. I am not even putting that on the table because equal representation is an issue of being a property owner in a district, and your right to be equitably represented, is an issue that can be looked at legally. And some numbers, over 10,000 or 12,000 of those lots are already in the hands of people who do reside in the state, although not in the Puna district at the moment. So, they do have some rights, so I don't go with your premise in the beginning.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you, Jon. Earlier we called up Victor Morris, and he wasn't in the room. So I am calling him back again. He is the Treasurer of the Waikōloa Village Association.

VICTOR MORRIS

(At this time Victor Morris came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. MORRIS: Thank you, Commissioners, for listening to my testimony. I very much support Plan\_40, or a slight revision of it as necessary. I feel very strongly that we want to keep our community together, and in fact this goes back into history. If you think of the way the Hawaiians put together the islands when they first settled it, their concept was mountain to sea, and the current Council District 9 very much represents that with Waikōloa, Waimea, Puakō, and Kawaihae. I think that will serve us very well going forward, and that is what I hope you will consider doing as you work out the final plan. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you very much. Let's take a testifier in Waimea.

MR. HIRT: Good afternoon, we are actually down to our last testifier. We had two testifiers sign up to speak in support of Plan\_40, but they had to leave. So, our last testifier is Terri Markovich, representing herself, to speak in support of Plan\_40.

TERRI MARKOVICH

(At this time Terri Markovich came forward via videoconference from Waimea to address members of the Commission.)

MS. MARKOVICH: Thank you, Commissioners. Thank you for your service, it is very important. I, too, serve on a Commission for the Public Access and Open Space and Natural Resource Preservation Commission. It is a big job, and I represent District 1, and I

have been a resident in Hāmākua for 21 years now. I feel that Plan\_A is a disservice to Hāmākua Coast, and thank goodness for our community grapevine, which Margaret---I am a victim of the two by four, because I just found out about this through her folks that she collaborates with. They were concerned that Hāmākua people were not that aware of what was going on, and I admit, that I was unaware. Thanks also to Dominic Yagong, for being so present with the issues and notifying me by email about this issue. Yes, we would like to be kept whole; the Hāmākua Coast, because we have a lot of issues in common and our County has spent so much money for our CDP's that it is really important, especially for Hāmākua, we are just in the middle of putting together our CDP; and Kohala has been very active with their CDP and I think it just makes good economic sense to keep us together and cohesive, so that we can progress with the CDP programs, which are really, really important. Hāmākua has had so many plans, and this is like our final plan to get some control over how we want our area to develop. I really appreciate your giving us this opportunity to testify. It is always an education, and learning all this different information for all the different areas. I think Kohala has a really active community and I really admire that. I am from Honoka'a and I definitely want to remain in Hāmākua, so I think that Plan\_40 is a more workable plan and it services more of our community. Thank you so much for this time.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. We now come back to Hilo. Sharon O'Connell.

SHARON O'CONNELL

(At this time Sharron O'Connell came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MS. O'CONNELL: I am a resident of the Hāmākua Coast; upper Kawiki Road, and I would just like to say that I don't care which plan it is, A, B, 409, WD40, please do not break up the Hāmākua Coast. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. We have now hit the 12:00 noon mark, so I would like to ask the Commissioners if they want to break for lunch now, or if they want to hear the rest of the testimony.

MR. KAHUI: Madam Chair, I propose we move forward through the testimony, and then maybe decide thereafter what to do.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Are there any other opinions?

MR. CARVALHO: I think we should finish it up and then maybe break for lunch.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Does everyone agree to continue on the public testimony now? Okay, let's do it then. Our next testifier is Patrice McDonald. Okay, if she is not here, then we will move on to Lori Beach.

LORI BEACH

(At this time Lori Beach came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MS. BEACH: Good afternoon, my name is Lori Beach. Thank you for listening to all this testimony today. I appreciate all your efforts to date, which is, I am sure, a challenging job. I appreciate your attention to that. I have been a resident of the Big Island for almost 30 years now, and a community activist in Hāmākua for about 15 years. I served on the Steering Committee for the Hāmākua Ag Plan, I worked on the Hāmākua Community Development Plan, and I am now running the Hāmākua Ag Co-op. Over the course of my community services I have talked to many, many residents of Hāmākua, and what I found is that there is a sense of place. There is a strong sense of community. We are anchored by Waipio Valley, which is probably one of the most special places in the State, in my mind. There is a reverence for the land and the area and the community. The current Plan\_A, dividing Hāmākua, serves us a great injustice. We are not similar to either the South Kohala District, or the North Hilo District, and we need to maintain our identity as it has been for the millennium. That is what I would like to say, thank you; and I support Plan\_40 in its current form.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Patrice McDonald just came back in, so I am going to call her up. You filled out two sign in forms, but you are just testifying as one person.

PATRICE McDONALD

(At this time Patrice McDonald came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MS. McDONALD: I had a theory that since no body was representing upper district Puna, maybe I could have all day. That was a joke. My first problem, as usual, is there is not one landmark on any map, including Brenda Ford's, on what the boundaries and where the subdivisions actually lie within these districts. We spent all night, we bought the software that you had asked us to do; I can't tell, on Draft\_A if Hawaiian Acres is with Hawaiian Paradise Park, or not. Secondly, we had invited certain Commissioners to attend meetings in upper Puna, which is considered most of District 3, and parts of District 6. I really admire Margaret Wille, who I had never met, who really reached out to all communities to try and get an idea of what their feelings were. I think the biggest misconception in this entire planning, is that HPP is not Puna, and Volcano is not Puna. It is comprised of all the communities, all the subdivisions, between those two areas. It is not just HPP and Volcano. Map after map after map represents their interests only. This lobbyist group, Friends of Paho'a's Future; we invited them to Hawaiian Acres, Fern Acres and Orchidland. They also did not show up. I have their testimony from a meeting in District 3 that apparently the only reason they want us as part of District 5 is to drive our roads. It had no other justification, period. So, the commonality here is that District 5 is tiny, very small, urban lots. Most of upper Puna, which is really District 3---

CHR. SIRACUSA: Excuse me, which map are you looking at?

MS. McDONALD: Friends of Puna's Future was, I believe, Plan\_40. The other one submitted, Draft Plan\_A, I would really like to be able to see these landmarks and boundaries; otherwise nobody in upper Puna really has any idea of what you guys are doing. It is not on the website, you cannot overlay these maps with any districts or boundaries at all. So, our idea is I think closer to Draft\_A, at least the Puna district seems

to be mauka and makai of Highway 11. The first plan, Plan\_40, has all of our villages in common, which is Kea'au, Kurtistown, Mountain View and Glenwood, divided with Hilo. So, we would favor the one that includes our villages with our community, which is District 6. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: By the way, when you go to the software, there is a little thing that looks almost like a thermometer on the far left; that is where you zoom in to see the details. But, if you stay around for when we start working on the maps, you will see that on the big screen. So I do urge you to come back after lunch and see that. Now, Bill Beach.

**BILL BEACH**

(At this time Bill Beach came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. BEACH: Aloha, I'm really glad that we committed to coming here today, rain or shine; we were going to do it. I have to be honest with you I haven't really studied the depth of what you need to do. When I walked in the room I saw some familiar faces. It is almost as going to court; I saw a lot of people I know. Anyways, looking at the people sitting up there, I know some of them, and I know they have a lot of brain power and a lot of integrity. I guess, after listening to all the great testimony and all the people from Waikōloa and Puna, doing a great job of representing what they need, the thing that I hear is that these lines that you have to draw, based on whatever criteria you are forced to use, could be destructive to communities. And I think the pleas that I'm hearing today, and really it kind of coalesced, that's really why I am here. I always speak out no matter what, and Jeff knows this from a long time ago. I told him, and Bob Lindsey, even though I love Kamehameha Schools, you can't do anything that destroys communities. You have to honor Hāmākua, so, that is why we came, in honor of Hāmākua and to not let it be gutted. And I'm so glad that we are all civilized and we can all do this with aloha, because in another time, it would have been an act of war and either outcome would have been destructive. So I don't think it is going to happen to Hāmākua, I don't know how you are going to do what you need to do for it to be pono, but I trust that you will do it. I plead to you, because I think the reason I am here and not on Oahu, or anywhere else, is because of that great sense of community. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you very much. Richard Bidleman, front and center.

**RICHARD BIDLEMAN**

(At this time Richard Bidleman came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. BIDLEMAN: As most of you Commissioners know, I have attended a lot of the meetings and it's interesting to see a lot of other people coming out of the woodwork here today. I trust that you know that a group of us in Puna have worked very hard at drawing up maps; drawing them up multiple times, and getting advice from the members of this committee, as to how we might coalesce something. I think that has been a great relationship. I honestly believe you are doing the best job that you can, and it's not an easy one. I notice that there is the Waikōloa, Waimea contingency here today advocating one thing, without a great deal of thought to what is happening to some of the other districts.

That is one of the things that we have to try to avoid. It's like René has pointed out, no matter what the committee does, somebody is not going to be happy. The other thing that René has made very clear is that the two plans that are currently on the table are a work in progress. You folks have not made a final decision yet. I think you will recall, that when we talked, from day one, at least with regard to Puna, that Puna consists of three communities; Pāhoa, Kea'au, and Volcano. I will just mention the fact that Dan Taylor, who is the President of the Action Committee, happens to be a Volcano resident. So I don't want people to think that Volcano could just as easily go into another district. Anyways, thank you for all your good work, and hopefully, we continue to work together.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. That is the Puna Community Development Plan Action Committee, for those of you who don't know what he was referring to. But it has another Volcano member on it also, and that is Tim Tunneison. Okay, we now have Lucille Chung, the Hilo Community Council.

LUCILLE CHUNG

(At this time Lucille Chung came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MS. CHUNG: Aloha, I know I know most of you up here and you know me. I chased out to Pāpa'aloa to testify; don't divide North Hilo, because there was a gulch somewhere that you looked at in your offices. By the same token, don't divide Hāmākua, because we are a community. I am a born and raised person from Laupahoehoe, and I can't see Hāmākua going to Hilo; and I told you folks that in Pāpa'aloa. We could have been, maybe as a whole unit, moved up to Waimea, but to divide us, it's not pono. Thank you, Val, for stopping to talk to me. I will work with you; I have always worked with our government to make things pono. So, I am available any time. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you, Lucille; maybe next time around you will sign up to serve on the Commission.

MS. CHUNG: I'm not crazy.

MS. POINDEXTER: Thank you for all your work.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Our next testifier is Carol Porter.

CAROL PORTER

(At this time Carol Porter came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MS. PORTER: Good afternoon, thanks for giving me the opportunity to testify. I am Carol Porter, I live in Kawaihae. I have been on the Big Island since 1999. I think that I respect the work of the Commission, and that you are trying to do what you are Chartered to do, which is challenging; and to be fair to all of the people of the island of Hawai'i. I think, in fairness to all the people of the Big Island, it is essential that you preserve the integrity of the traditional districts. I say absolutely no to Plan\_A and yes to Plan\_40, perhaps modified. Please preserve communities of interest. Keep Hāmākua together;

splitting it dilutes and weakens its concerns and representations no matter how dedicated the elected representatives might be. Their loyalties will be to Hilo and Waimea primarily. Please keep South Kohala together. We are a really close community with common interests, shared resources; we have a development plan that everyone has worked on. All of our resources are together. The people feel as one, and please preserve that district. And also, please respect Puna's needs and desires. I am not familiar with them because I am not from that part of the island, but clearly, they have been overlooked in the past. All of our citizens deserve dedicated voice to represent each traditional district. Please don't enact Plan\_A. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Our next testifier is Peter Grossman of Kamuela.

PETER GROSSMAN

(At this time Peter Grossman came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MS. GROSSMAN: I certainly support the last testifier, believe me, she is a tough act to follow. I support Plan\_40 as well, because it seems clear that it best maintains communities of interest, which I think is what you all are trying to do. I would also hope that the Commission seriously considers today's public support which is so decidedly one sided. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Kim Pinkerton.

KIM PINKERTON

(At this time Kim Pinkerton came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. PINKERTON: Thank you. Kim Pinkerton, not the detectives. I have got to say, so far so good, I am going for Plan\_40. I think you have heard plenty of testimony. Too bad we can't just go okay, Plan\_40; shut the book, is anybody having fun yet. I hear a lot of talk about we are going to do something for the future, I had an interesting opportunity. I moved into Las Vegas Nevada in 1992, and I left there in 2003, in which I came here. During that period I saw Las Vegas grow incredibly fast. We were having 5,000 new people applying for a driver's license every single month. The growing pains were incredible. At the same time we have to look at the bust cycle. Vegas is in trouble. We are getting ready to have that cycle. These people on the mainland are in trouble. There is something going on there.

We went through desegregation back in the '60's and '70's. My parents went through white flight. All of the astute people moved to the suburbs. Now the people that are astute that are in the suburbs are looking for somewhere to go. Everybody in Texas has pollution in their water to the point that they are closing their wells because they have radioactivity in their water. All of the sun belt is in trouble. Everybody is in trouble. We are going through a huge political transition at the Federal level. We have a 17 trillion dollar deficit. As soon as the interest rate creeps up to 5% we will have no money. It will take every penny of tax receipts just to pay the interest on the note. We are going to have a landslide of people coming here; a landslide of people. They are going to come to Puna, because

they are broke and that is where it is cheap. Puna is fixing to explode. There are a lot more people there than you think. I'm telling you, this Bill 270, we are bringing them out, people I never saw; they are coming out of the woodwork. We didn't get counted in the census. Nobody came to my house. They hung a little thing on the chain and left; and I don't blame them. If I was a census counter, and I showed up at some of these cats houses down there in Hawaiian Acres, and there was a skull hanging on the fence, I don't think I would go knocking on their door. The Federal government tells us we have 9% unemployment, we got about 16% to 20%. We got 9 million homes in foreclosure. Get ready folks, the future is going to bring some people here. We are going to have a lot of people here, fast. I hope, do the best, good luck. One thing I did learn in Vegas; I'll take luck over skill any day. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Our next to last testifier is Dwight Vicente.

DWIGHT VICENTE

(At this time Dwight Vicente came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. VICENTE: My name is Dwight Vicente and I'm representing the Hawaiian Kingdom. I hear people call themselves residents, or they are usually referred to as the people of the State of Hawai'i, but if you look at the Kingdom's history, there were only Native Hawaiians, foreign businessmen, and the rest were contract slaves that were brought over. After the January 7, 1893 protest against the overthrow, there still remains Native Hawaiians, no contract slaves, but there are slaves, and businessmen. On top of that they have the military occupation. So, if one thinks that slavery ended, it didn't; they call them employees today. Look up the definition of the work employee. Well, the voter registration requires you to be first a citizen of the United States, plural. Second, you need to be a legal resident of the State of Hawai'i. I don't say State of Hawai'i, because there is no such place. Hawaiian islands exist. In fact, if you look at the 1898 Crown Government Lands were annexed to Washington D.C. That goes back to the Bayonet Constitution where the foreigners took up arms against King Kalakaua and they applied the Northwest Ordinance of 1787 to this Kingdom, pretending like they got jurisdiction over the Kingdom, and had the military, the Navy with an illegal standing Army on board in Pearl Harbor. At the 1950 Constitutional Convention, Stainback stated that they applying the Northwest Ordinance to create the State of Hawai'i, like they did with the Territory of Hawai'i and the Provisional Government and the Republic of Hawai'i. Those are not true governments. The only true government is the Hawaiian Kingdom. And in that government, you can be naturalized to it. The other four, creatures of collusion, there is no laws of naturalization. Anybody can get off the boat anywhere and say I have a right to be here. But is there a valid treaty? There must be treaty relationships. On top of that the government has to have laws of naturalization. I was reading that one of the things required is to show ID. Are they asking for a passport? That is an actual ID, not the one that the fake State of Hawai'i is issuing. They want you to sign away your rights to life. They give you a Social Security number; that took away your right as a human being. So, I am going to end this by reserving the rights of this Kingdom under the Queen's protest of January 17, 1893 against U.S. Minister Stephens, Article III, Section 2, Clause 2. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. Our last testifier is Scott Stoddard.

SCOTT STODDARD

(At this time Scott Stoddard came forward to address members of the Commission.)

MR. STODDARD: So, I get the last word. My name is Scott Stoddard, and I am the co-author of one of the early versions of Plan\_40. Unfortunately, I can't support the current version of Plan\_40; the northern border of District 4, one of the Puna districts extends into South Hilo and Volcano, of course, is removed to District 6. Also, the support you heard at the public hearings in Pāhoā and Kea'au, the overwhelming support for that earlier Plan\_40, I don't think you can attribute that support, necessarily, to the current Plan\_40, and I would urge you not to. We have heard a lot from Waikōloa today, but we can't just assume that the entire island is on board, because the people of Pāhoā and Kea'au, the people of Puna spoke with just as loud a voice then, in favor of that earlier plan, and they are not necessarily being represented today. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Are you going to be staying for when we start working on the plans?

MR. STODDARD: Yes, I am going to be staying for the whole meeting.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Please do, because I have submitted a proposal for realigning Puna, and I don't care if it goes on to Plan\_A or Plan\_40, or whatever, but I would like your take on it when we come to work on it.

MR. STODDARD: That's a good point because all the plans are works in progress, as Richard Bidleman said, and I just want to throw my weight behind that statement as well. We do appreciate the work in progress that you guys are all taking on. Thank you very much; and I'll be around.

CHR. SIRACUSA: As far as I can see, we have come to the end of public testimony. I think we are hungry, it is 12:30 p.m. and we are going to take a lunch break and then we will come back at 1:00 p.m.

MR. MELROSE: I just want to say thank you all for showing up. This was a very constructive conversation; you guys drove a long way, so thank you very much for coming.

RECESS: At 12:30 p.m. the Chair called for a lunch recess.

RECONVENE: The meeting was reconvened at 1:25 p.m.

## APPROVAL OF MINUTES

CHR. SIRACUSA: I'm calling the Hawai'i County Redistricting Commission meeting back to order again. The next item that we have on our agenda is approval of minutes of October 21, 2011.

Mr. Melrose moved to approve the minutes of the October 21, 2011 meeting of the Hawai'i County Redistricting Commission. Seconded by Ms. Ugalde and carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiola'a, Kahui, Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth, Poindexter, Ugalde, and Chair Siracusa.

Noes: None.

Absent: None.

## COMMUNICATIONS

### **COMM. 47: COALITION OF PUNA SUBDIVISION ASSOCIATIONS**

From Commissioner Jeff Melrose, dated October 19, 2011 transmitting a current list of the Coalition of Puna Subdivision Associations, a 1992 Map of Puna Subdivisions by 'Āina Surveying and Mapping, and a listing of Subdivisions for Puna Makai and Puna Mauka; all of which were provided by Leilani Bronson-Crelly, Administrative Assistant for Hawaiian Paradise Park Owners Association.

CHR. SIRACUSA: This was something that we had some questions on.

MR. MELROSE: This was a recommendation at our Kea'au meeting that we go and try and figure out where the incorporated subdivisions were, and I think is something we should keep in mind as we go forward, but I don't want to spend any time on it now; I'll make a motion to close file on Communication 47.

Mr. Melrose moved to close file on COMM. 47. Seconded by Mr. Middlesworth and carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiola'a, Kahui, Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth, Poindexter, Ugalde, and Chair Siracusa.

Noes: None.

Absent: None.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We'll keep it for reference.

## **ORDER OF THE DAY**

### **COMM. 48: REVIEW AND DISCUSSION OF REDISTRICTING PLANS/MAPS**

From Commission Chair, René Siracusa, dated October 28, 2011, requesting the Commission's review and discussion of Redistricting Plans/Maps, and continue the process of creating the Commission's "Draft Plan."

**COMM. 48.1:** From Margaret Wille, dated October 25, 2011, transmitting a revised version of Plan\_40 10-24, submitted as public testimony.

**COMM. 48.2:** From Mike Middlesworth, dated October 25, 2011, transmitting revisions to Draft Plan\_A.

**COMM. 48.3:** From Brenda Ford, dated October 28, 2011, requesting Commissioner's review of BJJ Hybrid Plan, submitted as public testimony.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Do I have a motion to close file?

Ms. Ugalde moved to close file on  
COMM. 48 and all related communications.  
Seconded by Mr. Kanuha.

CHR. SIRACUSA: It's been moved and seconded to close file, all in favor?

MR. MELROSE: Wait a minute, wait, wait, wait, wait, we don't want to---We don't need to vote on this, we need have a conversation.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Right, but we have to close file before we can have the conversation.

MR. MELROSE: I thought we have a discussion before. We want to carry on the conversation on this action. We don't close, we close afterwards.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yeah, I'm sorry, I jumped the gun. Sorry about that. We do want to have a discussion.

MR. MELROSE: Can I make a suggestion just as a place to start? If we were to take--- Let's take Plan 40, in its current form, and take a look at that and maybe take a look at a couple of other ones, and then decide what we want to morph into a Plan B.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Sounds fine with me. Anybody else? Everybody agree with that? Okay let's do that. Shyla, can we see the November 1<sup>st</sup> version of Plan 40.

MR. MELROSE: And Shyla, can I suggest we just take a quick tour around; start up north and get a feel for it.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I just want to point out to Patrice McDonald, as she's looking at that map, you see on the far left there's that vertical thing with a plus and minus; that's where you zoom in. Every time you click on the plus it comes in a little closer and then you'll be able to see more and more what the lines are. And on the upper right, you see those little square boxes that say display lines, display locks, and also next to that, base map. Those are things that will show you when you click on them the different topographical features and where the houses are and that sort of thing. Okay?

MR. MELROSE: A little closer on the Waimea portion so we can see what Waimea looks like.

MS. POINDEXTER: I wanted to see where the boundaries; are we still on White Road on this one?

MR. MELROSE: That's a little bit of a movement in from the last time, is that right?

MS. POINDEXTER: Yeah, cause it takes Nani; was Nani Waimea there before? Okay yeah, right here.

MR. MELROSE: Was the prior district only one side of the road?

MR. KANUHA: Could you change it to the Hybrid. Go down, scroll down. Thank you.

MR. MELROSE: Anyone want to see more of that, keep moving around? Go down to the interface between District 1 and 2.

MR. KANUHA: I have a comment about this green, whatever this district this one is. What is it District 2? The green part, not with this boundary, but where the green part goes up and takes the mauka portion of the Hāmākua, I didn't understand that. No, I understand that, but, I don't know.

MR. MELROSE: This is a boundary with my district. Couple things, this comes up the river, gets on to Waiānuenuenu and stays on Waiānuenuenu up to Piihonua and then the Piihonua Camps that we talked about are actually partly split by this boundary because there are Piihonua Camps on both sides of the road before it goes over the river. So I think Camp 3 gets split. And one of the things I want just to point out to the Commission is that at the ocean side in what's Pueo, you know I would appreciate the walk-a-bility of community and connectivity of community. It's one of the most walkable communities in the state in terms of being able to walk across the bridge and get into the commercial area in town. So cutting it out is not a small cut, it's a big issue to me. It's a --Those folks have the ability to walk right across the bridge into their commercial area. So anyway, I just make that point. I'm not a fan of that, and also it does, you know, it comes across the river and makes me and my neighbor right across the street vote in different districts.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: This is one of the places where I'd want bring up the issue about the Hāmākua district. We show on the map, and we talk about it as being a Hāmākua

district, has 6,500 people from Hāmākua in it, 9,000 from South Hilo and 2,000 from North Hilo. So, it's hardly a Hāmākua district.

MR. MELROSE: That's a naming issue, and I mean more and more that's what people keep calling it, and it's inappropriate, and you know there's plenty of people that are going to keep raising that issue, but you're right. I mean I agree with you. We gotta call it a South Hilo or rural South Hilo, North Hilo/Hāmākua district. But that's what it is. It's much too simple, it's more of an inflammatory statement.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: We've had so many people that keep saying that Hāmākua should have its own district. It's impossible for Hāmākua to have a district. I understand that, but the people we had here today were Hāmākua people; they weren't north Hilo or South Hilo people.

CHR. SIRACUSA: But we did hear them at the Kamana Center.

MR. MELROSE: It is a term of use inappropriate, but lots of folks use it. So, pull back a little bit Shyla just to see where the rest of this. This district goes very narrow and thin and then it gets all the way down, the bulk of its population, yeah. We'll deal with it later. But then it gets down across to Keaukaha because I think you actually end up splitting.

CHR. SIRACUSA: That bottleneck bothers me because even though everything on the left of there is unpopulated, it still makes it look like the district is not compact.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Looks like a gerrymander.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I know that. But the compactness is something we have to look at. We could move that area elsewhere and not affect that district at all. It's just a question of looks; we have to make pretty.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: One of the issues here is that it splits Keaukaha and Pana'ewa and half of Pana'ewa is in the other---

CHR. SIRACUSA: And Patrick doesn't want to see that happen; so Pana'ewa is split.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: It goes down Railroad. Oh I see, okay. I thought that was--

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: It takes a big chunk out of it.

MR. MELROSE: The numbers here, could you pull down the district? See District 3 is right at the top end of the allowance, so it actually---

CHR. SIRACUSA: And District 7 is at the bottom.

MR. MELROSE: Yeah I know, and then the Kona districts are all like somehow their votes are different. But, yeah, we could in fact move that around a little bit to level out

those two pieces. They'll still be high but we can make that adjustment to pull in Pana'ewa. Alright.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Go over to the little area by the scale on the left side; the other side, up where the ---You don't have that piece.

MR. MELROSE: That's the one that gives the numbers?

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: The one that gives the numbers for each district. I know how to do it, but I don't know if I can explain to you how to get it.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Can we go down? Please do your talking into the mic, so it goes on the record, Mike.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Alright. You pay attention to what shows up when I reopen this thing. Alright, remember the part from our GIS over to the right. Okay, 'cause I'm gonna put this part in. What did it say?

MR. MELROSE: Rest backslash Services.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: I think this gets it. No. It isn't getting it. It's too bad because it shows all the numbers for every block.

CHR. SIRACUSA: That would be helpful. Let's keep walking around. Holoholo around the island. Okay, do you want to back up there as we move to Puna so we can see the whole configuration.

MS. POINDEXTER: Yeah, because I heard some of the Puna people say that they prefer Map A's lines in that area versus the 40.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yeah there are some problems with Puna here and I do have an alternate solution for the division of Puna, but we would have to look at the plan that says RS3 in order to see that, and then maybe we can tack it on to whatever map we like if you're all agreed.

MR. MELROSE: So just chat through just briefly what you think the problems are so we can all see that before we solve it.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Well, okay; Volcano belongs in Puna. The communities between Highway 11 and Stainback Highway are Puna communities; they do not belong in District 3 or District 6, they belong in Puna. What I would like to see is to go right down Highway 11 on both sides of the road towards Kea'au as far as the numbers would allow. In the meantime, the whole southern Puna here, we're not getting---You know, people who have testified for Puna Mauka/Puna Makai; and that's how Puna always thinks of itself. And um we're not getting that distinction here and that creates a lot of connectivity issues because

we have such poor road systems there and so many of the subdivisions don't hook up into each other.

MR. MELROSE: So could you focus on that connectivity issue; you talked right around Pāhoa.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yeah we would have to zero in really close, but also what this does is puts Kalapana all the way down on the coast in the same community as say Fern Forest, and it's totally very, very different. So, there you don't have roads. If you look, okay you see where it says Leilani Estates, and then look at a little to the left of it you see South Road. There's a whole community back there which is where I live, and we can't get out to any place else in our community unless we go into the district that's purple.

MR. MELROSE: Does that mean that there's a block right there above Pāhoa town that if it changed you could get access to the road behind Pāhoa to get out? You come out right in the middle of Pāhoa right? Doesn't Ka'ohē Road come out?

CHR. SIRACUSA: Ka'ohē Road comes out right by the High School, but it also can go, you know, there's another way to go around by the dump. And that comes out by Pāhoa Village Road, the other end of Pāhoa Village Road. And one way or the other we have to get out because otherwise we can't access. But the same thing happens down here if you look at Pāhoa/Kalapana Road. You see the little corner of Leilani Estates and Pāhoa/Kalapana Road comes right out there and there's people on both sides of it who have no access to the rest of their district. But mainly the thing that's wrong with this is that it ignores the whole Puna Mauka/Puna Makai configuration that most Puna people consider to be what their district is and that pretty much follows the ahupua'a lines and the watershed lines and the whole concept in the Puna Community Development Plan, which I worked on too, so I know what it is.

MR. MELROSE: So for the purpose of this conversation, can we keep moving around this one and come back to that fix in the Puna area, or you want to bring that back up as part of a specific solution?

CHR. SIRACUSA: I do want to bring it back at one point and ask the Commission to look at my suggestion for Puna.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: Madam Chair, I just need this one point of clarification. Ka'ohē Road and South Road are both County roads right?

CHR. SIRACUSA: They are county maintained, but they are not county. They are roads in limbo.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: Roads in limbo?

CHR. SIRACUSA: Nobody wants to agree that they own them. But the County has to maintain Ka'ohē Road because it dead-ends at the Puna Forest Reserve at the Waokele 'O Puna and they need an access. And OHA needs an access.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: That's where I was going. So those roads do not belong to the County.

CHR. SIRACUSA: No, but they are County maintained.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: Just like Hawaiian Homes, but I just needed that clarification. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Okay, so we're moving around?

MR. MELROSE: You know, in this boundary, Linda, in Volcano, it looks like it picks up 'Ōhi'a Estates on one side, aside from the fact that this is, you know, jettisoned to Ka'ū or to the southern district, it doesn't honor what you would call the Volcano community. What would you call the Volcano community? What would you call Volcano; is that Akatsuka kind of connectivity? Okay, so that's right about where the road turns, right where the end of that little point is?

CHR. SIRACUSA: So that community is split.

MR. MELROSE: So if you were going to try and save this plan, if you were gonna try and adjust this plan, assuming that we hadn't a plan in which Volcano went out, you would end up, you would want that move to go at least to Akatsuka so you have enough votes there to make a difference. I know this is hard for you.

MS. UGALDE: Anyway, number one, it splits Volcano community from Volcano community, as they're coming up the road. I guess it's right at 'Ōhi'a Estates, leaving Mauna Loa and 'Ōhi'a, that are adjacent to each other split, and then the greater Volcano Village area and Golf Course are still in Ka'ū. Splitting Volcano this way I think is even worse than the map we're operating under now.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Okay. Any other comments? Do we want to continue moving around the island? I know that the whole green strip hanging down along the coast that's all one census district. That's one of the problems that we have to face with some of these weird census districts that make us look like we're gerrymandering. But Shyla, could you move a little over towards inland a little bit, a little more, a little more, a little more, a little more, I just saw something; move into purple a little bit there. That narrow, that wasp waist, that looks like a gerrymander and it takes away that whole compactness thing. If there's nobody there then it should go into either green or yellow. What district is purple there?

MR. MELROSE: You said there were people there right Margaret? Right. And there is numbers in the census tract but I called the Mauna Loa Observatory and they say they have nobody living there. So there are no residents up there from their perspective. They spend

the night, and not very often when they're doing science. I know, we have the same, we recognize that.

CHR. SIRACUSA: And we understand that there's a lot of problems with the census. We know that; including grossly undercounting.

MR. MELROSE: As a detail I want to make sure we don't use the word gerrymander inappropriately. That's not a gerrymander, but that's a political call, this is a census thing. It's just that the word relates to politically drawing the line and so that's what the word means.

CHR. SIRACUSA: It doesn't have the compact.

MR. MELROSE: That's a better word.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Now, is that all one census block? Is that why it looks like that? It looks like it---

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: That looks like we could probably easily tweak that.

MR. MELROSE: That's easy. Can we go back to the coast? Let Dru teach us about this.

MR. KANUHA: Let's zoom into Kealahou. Not the bay, the town. Wherever that is. Yeah, by Haleki'i. That squiggly line, that's where Haleki'i Street is. So it's a good boundary. Um, that's actually the boundary between North and South Kona so it makes, well I mean Pu'u Ohau, the pu'u at the very bottom is the boundary. So it's a good break between there. Try to go a little up, north. Sorry. And I want to see where Kainaliu-- wait --no, sorry, go back down where the break is right there on the other side of the street. Yeah, zoom in, see the mauka side of the street, see Waiho. Zoom in towards the Waiho area. Yeah. That seems acceptable. Okay. You can zoom out and go towards town. I think this one goes up Hualalai Road, yeah, that's okay. It brings in all of Kailua, I mean most, a lot of Kailua. As far as this is concerned we can definitely work on it for sure. It seems acceptable right between District 7.

MR. MELROSE: It would seem to me that the industrial area, the new Lili'uokalani Industrial Area and the Lanihau area has no real population in it so you could include that and then keep the whole of the commercial. Somebody made the comment today about the Kona Business Improvement District, um that you might be able to include the whole business district in the Kailua seat.

MR. KANUHA: That's what I would want to do for sure.

MR. MELROSE: So you could go down Queen K and stop there somewhere around the end of the industrial area.

MR. KANUHA:

MR. KANUHA: Can we zoom in towards the Palani Road? Yeah, there's a little back side. There is a population I know inside there. Um, okay. Thank you. Sorry Bo, did you have any comments about that? Uh, seven and eight boundary?

MR. KAHUI: Uh, as far as the boundaries between seven and eight, you know, respectfully I think when we last spoke at the prior commission hearing you know, my sentiment was that we, you know there's that mauka/makai division along Māmalahoa and I suppose given what we see today am I to understand QLCC um, that whole subdivision is in your district. Is that correct?

MR. KANUHA: According to this map; can we go back down to Kailua.

MR. KAHUI: Focus in a little on that so we can see the detail. And I also want to comment I think we're in agreement on this side that we keep the business districts together because I understand that um here yeah, the Kailua Business Park and the whole Ali'i Parkway as well as Ali'i Drive is part of our Kailua Village Plan so keeping that together I think would be appropriate.

MR. KAHUI: Yeah I agree.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Can you see the map clearly from there Bo?

MR. KAHUI: Yeah, if we could just focus in/zoom in on uh the Palani Road heading up by the junction at QLCC.

MR. MELROSE: No. That doesn't include all of the QLCC like the Forest City in that area above Makalapua. Is that what you're talking about?

MR. KAHUI: No. I think Makalapua and those guys are within my district boundary I believe.

MR. MELROSE: And I think what they're saying here is that the industrial area QLCC industrial area, the new and the old, would become part of this. Does this picture pick up the---I don't see the Sports Authority. Isn't that over there on the corner? This picture is old is what I'm trying to say.

MR. KAHUI: So um – oh yeah okay.

MR. KANUHA: Go to the left a little bit. The other way.

MR. MELROSE: Your other left. Yeah see there's the golf course and that whole area is now part of the industrial area and part of that. So the picture is old.

MR. KANUHA: So that's all QLCC.

MR. MELROSE: So let's not make that mistake here.

MR. KAHUI: And just for clarification did that include the Makalapua um, Macy's and Kmart?

MR. KAHUI: No, because it would be on the other side of Queen Ka'ahumanu.

MR. MELROSE: And they are not part of the improvement district are they? Macy's and ---I don't think so.

MR. KAHUI: No they're not. Okay, I'm good.

MR. MELROSE: So numerically though, how much – do we have much flexibility in that district?

MR. KAHUI: In District 7 there was 4.99% I think.

MR. MELROSE: Yeah we got room. Okay, 4.99% low; yeah we can make it but it will send 8.

MR. KAHUI: Yeah that's why with this one you'd have to---You couldn't really get from either---

MR. MELROSE: You gotta kinda oosh your butt from the other side too right? You gotta oosh 'um from two sides.

MR. KAHUI: If I can just comment. Um looking at the map here, if we go along the coastline and zoom in, I'm assuming based on what I see on this side, is that Puakō is now in District 9 correct?

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yes.

MR. KAHUI: Okay. And that's the sentiment that was shared throughout the hearings and I support that. If we go now to the Waikōloa Road mauka and look at Waikōloa and as you know there's the villages are kinda split between that road.

MR. MELROSE: Yeah you need to add one more, two more census blocks right there along the road in order to get Jack Hall Housing into that; 200 people south, right there.

MR. KAHUI: Am I to understand now they've included that based on what I see here it's within District 9?

MR. MELROSE: No. It's in District 8. You need to hit that next census block to get those houses into the mix.

MR. KAHUI: I wanted to find out how much more if we move that back into District 9 what the numbers would look like and how can we compensate that between District 7 and 8; uh 7 and 6.

MR. MELROSE: It's not that many. It's a couple hundred isn't it?

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: 200 people.

MR. CARVALHO: 200 people. So but it doesn't make any sense to leave them hanging out there so if we got Waikōloa we have to, to me, include that piece.

MR. KAHUI: I would highly recommend that we do that. That would be my preference and recommendation.

MR. MELROSE: Yeah, cool. Is that from what you heard today a go?

MR. KAHUI: Yes.

MR. MELROSE: All the hearings anyway.

CHR. SIRACUSA: It's just common sense.

MR. KAHUI: Yeah. I just think as more and more we look at the testimony, the written testimony, um, I've done a matrix and overwhelmingly, with exception of one oral testimony today, all the written testimony was against Plan A and all the testimony was against Plan A. The fact that we're working on this plan I think now allows us to take a better look at those recommendations. So the Villages of Waikoloa, they want to be part of District 9, I think we should honor that. And then also, 200 people, if it skews the deviation, then again, I think we have to rely on the communities of interest and then um rely on our mandate. That's all.

MR. MELROSE: This is, I mean we've kind of went around the loop on this one now.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Wait a minute. Wait a minute, before we get away from that. I want to comment on that. Bo, one of the things I learned in my many years in the newspaper business is that it's very easy for people to mount letter-writing campaigns and to bring out groups of people who are opposed to something simply by making a few phone calls and so on. One of the reasons that many of these polls that you see on internet websites are no good is because people are organized to vote one way or another. They're not giving them sample polls. What we had today is not a sample of any of these communities.

MR. KAHUI: I appreciate that. I think the other consideration that was voiced by Pete Hoffman and some of the other constituents today was looking at how the various Community Development Plans are now trying to focus in on the various communities that they serve. Having said that, I think Waikōloa and the Waikōloa Villages, bringing them

together under District 9, fall within their district plan. So that if we're looking at, I'm not trying to---I would argue that I think if you look from that perspective, it will give these communities a fair share and voice in their community development plan.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: I agree, except that as Pete said, the Community Development Plan areas were based pretty much on the Council Districts that existed at the time that they were drawn. Now we're charged with drawing new Council Districts because the populations have shifted over ten years. And for us---I mean why are the Community Development Plans any more important than the school districts or some of the other ways that the island is divided.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I can answer that one. That it's a school district, they're a state, and the state already has its own---It has its legislative districts and we're looking at council districts which have nothing to do with the Department of Education.

MS. UGALDE: If I took everything that Bo just said and changed the names. It's gonna be Volcano. Our community of interest runs down the hill. I have never driven to Ka'ū for anything except to go to the beach. Uh, there's 25 miles between Volcano Golf Course, the nearest point, and Pāhala. It might be 23, I could be off a couple miles. And there's nothing in between. Our Community of Interest, the direction we go, is all north and we have been connected with Puna in the past. The comments made to me were it's been thirty years since we've been in our proper district. And Volcano is from Golf Course down the hill. Not from--Not splitting it along the highway and not cutting it off at the village and leaving the Golf Course hanging out there. I live in the Golf Course, I run the community center. We're all one large, rather tight-knit community and it's miles and miles between anything in Volcano and the nearest point in Ka'ū.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Having said that, do we want to do some more moving around the island?

MR. MELROSE: Can I suggest – what I'd like to do is I'd like to see Mrs. Ford's one again and look at it more closely as a comparison and see if there's anything we can learn from that and then I think we start with one and work at it.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We didn't finish going around. Did we want to look at that 1/9 boundary before we leave this map?

MR. MELROSE: That's where we started out.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Oh that's right. Okay.

MS. POINDEXTER: And if we can move in that same direction again. Start from the 1/9 and then go around.

MR. KAHUI: If I might, are we gonna address any amendments today?

MR. MELROSE: Yeah.

MR. KAHUI: Okay, so I would reserve both the comments and my position on the Waikōloa matter with respect to any amendments.

CHR. SIRACUSA: What I'd like to do Bo is give us a chance to look at all of these maps before we make you know, we start making motions, so that all the configurations are fresh in our minds.

MR. KAHUI: I'm not making a motion. My statement is that I would like to reserve my comments stated in keeping that Waikōloa Village is intact to District 9. I'm not sure how Joe feels, but just based on earlier testimony, various hearings, I totally hear the sentiments of that community. So with that said, I appreciate any courtesy given to my position at the time of any amendments to the plan. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you. And you're certainly as a commissioner, certainly free to speak up at anywhere along the process, as are all of us.

MR. MELROSE: Okay, so this one doesn't get in as far, it actually pulls back a little ways, Brenda's thing still takes Lakeland but what I presume then is all of the 3,000 plus votes that have to be added to the Hāmākua district are being added south, not north in this. It's about two blocks over. Then it gets down to the 1/2 boundary.

MR. CARVALHO: It's an okay compromise but I would like to see it further, but it's a workable compromise.

MR. MELROSE: Yeah, but it pushes back across the Hilo Bay real fast.

MS. POINDEXTER: Yes, because it moves over from---

MR. MELROSE: Yeah, you got a road connectivity issue here. Um move, yeah you got a road connectivity issue coming through that. Go on up again, some more. The other way, out to the---Slide it to the right some more. It's about the same place that the Plan 40 went across. The only difference is there needs to be a way up through Downtown Hilo. To make that one work you have to come up through Downtown Hilo on Waiānuenu and not on the river.

MR. CARVALHO: Piihonua. Is it in Hilo or?

MR. MELROSE: In this case it's in Hāmākua. But you see that issue Brenda? The connectivity issue on the edges of that? That you can't get up to Waiānuenu without a road coming up. Okay, thank you. Just trying to be communicative.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: You also had the Pueo---

MR. MELROSE: Well Pueo; one of the things that's um important to me is that Hāmākua, by its definition, you know, it needs 3,000 plus votes. It has to get more votes. You can't not grow it because it had 17 and it needs 20. So you have to either take it all out of Waimea or you gotta take it all out of Hilo, you gotta split it. And to me, splitting it, at a minimum, we should split it and then we could look at what's, you know, moving down a little bit farther into Waimea, what difference does that make; versus coming across the river and um changing a bigger community dynamic in urban Hilo. God forsake, we might put Hilo votes in anybody else's district based on testimony.

MS. POINDEXTER: I would say moving, you know, moving further into um Waimea. I know that my heart is out for the Waimea people because for ten years they have said they have struggled being in the Hāmākua district when their CDP also, their planning is with Waimea and for centuries they've been Waimea. And Waikoloa came in as a development after. But it grew, it's big. And I appreciate Pete Hoffman's statement when he said we gotta look at where you know the amount of people, where would be---Where we have to cut, where the impact would be and less impact. And I think I'm starting to lean towards taking more of Waimea instead of moving into Hilo and I think if we have more things in common out this way and our County Council people need to truly work together as a team, but um, I don't know Joe how people will feel about that but I'm saying that if we as leaders can promote that, there's a power. People have the power. You know, so we just---

MR. CARVALHO: You know Val, as this process is going along and we have a very loud community response from certain communities and we gotta take that into consideration. And there's others that are not going to speak up but you know, this is a democracy and uh, when we need the help, you know, to help themselves I mean. What I mean is that people gotta come and talk and you gotta speak your minds too.

MS. POINDEXTER: So what I'm getting is you're in agreement that we could move the lines from Hāmākua---

MR. CARVALHO: I would be really reluctant to do that, but you know, we go according to what we need to do. And that I think is an okay option.

POINDEXTER – I've talked to people in Lakeland, I've talked to people in Waimea and I've asked them to come out and you know, as you can see, today they had the opportunity to go to Waimea also. So we heard the testimony you know there. And like with Hāmākua we heard what Hāmākua said. And granted Hāmākua didn't come out on the first when we went out for public hearings however, Hāmākua never felt they were in trouble of being separated because what went out in the press and the papers was that Hāmākua needed to grow. That we didn't need to cut, so when the other map came up and they were blindsided then they reacted to that. So, I understand that. I didn't hear much from anybody in that Lakeland area. I heard a lot from---

CHR. SIRACUSA: They came out in Waimea. There were about four people I think it was that testified.

MS. POINDEXTER: Yeah, but I don't know how strong but---

MR. CARVALHO: Well I think that there were like two or three that testified and there were about seven people there. But, you know we gotta do the best we can. I mean we're hearing the community and we go according to what we think the communities want and to do the communities of interest and hit the numbers where we can.

MS. POINDEXTER: Yeah and I think our leaders will have a lot to do with building healthy communities. It's how positive we are to make it work. Pat you wanted to say something? I see you kinda like rolling your eyes and whatever. But that's my suggestion.

MR. MELROSE: I appreciate that and I think---I mean I look at the upper area of Hilo above downtown and I think you know there's so little connectivity north uh but I just - understand that when the county did the CDP or in doing the CDP for Hāmākua the boundary is not the river, it's Pukihai Stream which is the next stream over and the next stream north. So they assumed that Pueo is part of Hilo. So I mean I think it's a logical geographical boundary. I'd rather hold it then have us come across it. But there is population up there and once you get up there you gotta go get Piihonua and the small camps and that's another 70 votes, but I - you know we've already I think today the boundary is out somewhere around Honoli'i so we're back off a ways from this point and uh come back to the river. So, anyway that's for a future, when we start to amend it. What other pieces to this plan I guess? Thanks for that conversation, though, that was helpful.

MR. MELROSE: I think we can do a better job than this one in maxing---

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: Excuse me madam Chair, I can probably use the same argument also and argue for that. You know, if that's the language people want to use, the community of interest. I don't know what other community of interest has it, but then we all belong on Hawaiian Homes and we being split so uh that, this configuration splits Hawaiian Homes whether people believe it or not and we can tweak whatever we need to tweak to get it. I still need to look at the coast and see where we're at in the coast. Where we end, do we abut, do we go over, and so that would make---Is that the Puna boundary? But we've gotta take something from the back side of it and uh from Hilo so that's not going to be---I need to look and make sure that it's not only a community of interest it's the income this county has from lands they lease or is being leased by people out here, the general leasing of the property. So, I'd like to keep that in the control of---Sure, maybe you can go in right here where the green, the purple and the pink kind get in together and back down, come down a little, down, I'm sorry, pull it down. The left of the green, all the area left of the green where the straight line comes down, uh it's Hawaiian Homes. It needs to be connected to the green.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Keaukaha which is up along the coast is the other half of Hawaiian Homes.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: These here are our lands, the farm lots that these are our farm lots that come on the back side of the airport. We're on the ocean side of the airport; this is

on the other side of the airport. The airport used to belong to us too so that's the reason we're on either side of the airport.

CHR. SIRACUSA: They only pay a dollar a year right?

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: That's all. But with that said, no the airport, if you come down maybe you can show her the airport Shyla a little more so she gets a better understanding of where it's at. That's the airport there. So there's the highway and then there's everything below Puainako, everything below Kekūanā'o'a is Hawaiian Homes.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Essentially everything east of the highway.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: Yeah, up until the four-mile bridge in fact is Hawaiian Homes. That would be a consideration that I want this commission to do just based on what people are saying all over that they want to be a community of interest, don't split the community. I may need to remind people that the Keaukaha community and Pana'ewa community has been around since uh the act came in 1920, we were here before then. So I wouldn't want that community of interest to understand. I'm quite sure Hāmākua was here, Waimea was here, you know, Puna was here. But Puna the district was here so and I again I thought I came in on the end from a doctor's appointment where this could have been politically motivated.

I don't see anything that I'm doing here that's politically motivated except that we're trying to find a place for politicians to get in and get votes. So it is politically motivated eventually, who gets to be in those lines. It has nothing to do with Hawaiians, got nothing to do with anybody else, it's gonna be who your representatives are gonna be in those districts. So for anybody to believe that what's being done is not, there's no politicians here saying that this is what's gonna happen, but there's a representation out here that that's who we're trying to configure this thing for, the districts for. So let's not go around, beat around the bush. It's for that reason only; and that means votes and we need votes in a place where you're not gonna have your vote diluted. So that's all I need to do. We may not have heard a lot from the Hawaiians in all the public hearings all over the place but that's the same thing. It's a community of interest, it's who we're gonna vote for and who's gonna represent our interest. So that's one of the reasons that I would be adamant about having that part split off. Not only is that part split off but I guess the commercial area is in there too but it's in one and it's outside of the other. Thank you.

MR. KAHUI: You know, I support Pat and the understanding that again when we look at communities of interest like the way I had stated before like Waikōloa we look at those communities of interest with who their constituents are and then I totally agree with Pat about those political boundaries and that they need representation as a whole community not just part of a community. So I support Pat's position to ensure that the Homestead communities are within the same district boundary.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Are we ready to move south now? Okay, will you move up a little bit more. Right about there and zoom in a bit. I'm having trouble figuring this out here.

Where is Highway 130? Okay, so it sort of looks like Orchidland is divided here and move down a little bit. I mean up - sorry, sorry, the other way. Yeah okay, I wanna see where the---Okay so Orchidland appears to be divided and HPP is all together, but let's move down a bit. A little more, right about there, okay if you see where Pāhoa is and there's the bypass road where the hand is if you follow that around upwards Shyla and then keep going, now go down the other way, yeah that's the Bypass okay. Now move the whole map down a bit over here. A little more, little more; okay, now anybody you see off to the left North Ka'ohē Homestead Road. Those communities, you see how the road ends right there but it's not ending on a road. I mean it's ending on Cemetery Road, but Cemetery Road doesn't go anywhere. There's no way that those communities can get to Pāhoa and that's the only community that the Ka'ohē Homesteads can get to but Pāhoa is in a different district.

MR. MELROSE: Generally speaking there's also--I mean you have--this line has to follow along a main road so that you can travel from one district to the next. And the way it's designed you can't travel.

CHR. SIRACUSA: But if you move down a little more, Shyla move, let's see the south a little more. There's another area where it creates a problem as well.

MR. MELROSE: But if you can come in on the main road it works – come in on the Bypass.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Because when you look at the whole upper Puna does this curve around like the letter “C” and the upper Puna is hooked up with the coastal Puna and totally ignoring the mauka/makai distinction that Puna people make and how the Puna people identify themselves. And I think we can do better. We can do better.

MR. MELROSE: Maybe if we just get around this one once then we can go and look at yours and we can talk about how to solve it.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I would like to do that.

MR. MELROSE: Good. Okay let's just keep moving around. Volcano in this circumstance?

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: Madam Chair, as we move towards Volcano, I'd just like to say again something that you know I want to put it on the record for that. When you talk about connectivity I think Keaukaha – I'm not only speaking about the Hawaiians. I'm talking about people that live down in the condos along the coast that dead-ends at our properties around Leleiwi Point. They're surrounded really by our properties including Leleiwi Point, that in time of emergencies, we're the only community that has to egress outside and across the airport. We're the only ones that gotta do that. No other community in this whole island go anywhere else. They can run for the hills. We gotta run out through the airport because the bottleneck that's there from the harbors, the fuel depots, that confines us into Keaukaha also. As I mentioned once before we ain't going nowhere. We're not gonna go

anywhere. I just need that to be said for the record when people talk about connectivity; we can't get nowhere either. But we chose to make our homes there, we live there and in case of an emergency that's how we get out of the community, get out of harm's way is by having to go across the airport. We just had that exercise on the first of November when we took 650 kids across the airport. So I get a little bit confused when we gonna talk about connectivity somebody gotta drive somewhere, well that's one of the reasons we have cars and drive somewhere else because we choose to live in places where maybe the roads don't connect. Make it easier for us to do it. So I just want to state for the case that's connectivity – that I am speaking about the same thing that you are about connectivity.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I just want to clarify Patrick that in the case of Ka'ohē Homesteads, for example, all of Puna is a cul-de-sac and Ka'ohē Homesteads is a cul-de-sac within a cul-de-sac. Now we're at 1,200 feet, we don't have to evacuate if there's a tsunami, however, we're the closest to the volcano. When the volcano was coming down before, made a right hand turn down the hill towards Kalapana Gardens we were very close. My property was the very closest to that lava flow.

MR. MELROSE: Is this relevant to redistricting?

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: No, I just needed to talk about the connectivity part.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yeah.

MS. UGALDE: I have to leave. I rescheduled my flight and I think I've been heard and just remember it and I'll see you on the tenth.

MR. MELROSE: Linda, just before you walk away. That – this image here in the worst case scenario from your perspective um does that um hold what you think is the broader Volcano community together? I think it's Akatsuka.

MS. UGALDE: It actually goes a little below it; what we consider the greater Volcano area.

MR. MELROSE: Okay, thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: So you're gonna take off now?

MS. UGALDE: I can't afford to pay for another change for the airlines.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Okay, thank you. Fly safe. Okay, we're gonna move around, continue moving around.

MR. MELROSE: Yeah Shyla, interface between the next two districts. Oh it's stuck.

MR. KANUHA: Yeah that line is pretty close to Haleki'i.

MR. MELROSE: Isn't that a better line than Haleki'i? Because it doesn't split a town right down the street?

MR. KANUHA: Yeah, yeah.

MR. MELROSE: If we could aim for that line, wouldn't that be a better place to come down than Haleki'i itself?

MR. KANUHA: Yeah.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: What's gonna happen when that subdivision finally gets people?

MR. KANUHA: When that subdivision finally gets people?

MR. MELROSE: Do we have to go there?

MR. KANUHA: That will be the next census.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: You know, we're talking about doing this to have it stand over the next ten years.

MR. KANUHA: This subdivision has---The census blocks make it really difficult, especially for this subdivision to say that we need to include everything. So right now I think it's an appropriate division.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: This is one of the problems we have with the census blocks.

MR. MELROSE: But this boundary I like this better than Haleki'i if we could repeat that, it seems to me to be not a split down a road.

MR. KANUHA: Move a little bit up. I think that's the same split as we had last time, around there. Yeah. It's an appropriate division.

MR. MELROSE: This keeps Keauhou Bay Estates with Keauhou which was somebody's concern this morning.

MR. KANUHA: That was with Commission Plan A where the line went to Keauhou.

MR. MELROSE: Yeah, right.

MR. KANUHA: This one actually incorporates more of the industrial area of Kailua. This is the same line as the last plan. Appropriate split up Hualālai Road.

MR. MELROSE: Then it cuts back on Hienaloli? Is that what the other one did too?

MR. KANUHA: Yeah. I think so.

MR. MELROSE: Okay. So pull down a little bit Shyla. I think the industrial area is all yeah. I like that better. How far does it go? It gets the sewage treatment plant, it gets the park, it gets the – okay.

MR. KANUHA: I like this, incorporating the industrial into the Kailua Village, definitely. I'm good.

MR. MELROSE: This is the same Jack Hall Housing issue. Shyla can you turn on the district count; just so we see how much room we have between Districts 7 and 8? It's close. It's got plenty to add. So if you took a little bit out of 8 to take care of the Jack Hall Housing you wouldn't hurt anything. I like that configuration.

CHR. SIRACUSA: And is all of Puakō in?

MR. MELROSE: Oh you're right. Oh, okay, Puakō is outside of that.

MR. KANUHA: That was the option of having, of incorporating the downtown Kailua; I don't know.

MR. MELROSE: If you include it now in 9, what's the 9 count?

MR. KANUHA: Well you can't get rid of any more in 8.

MR. CARVALHO: 9 is pretty maxed out too.

MR. MELROSE: Well maybe we can pull some out of the upper portion of, above, between the 7 and 8 phase. That's tight.

MR. KANUHA: I think it's workable though.

MR. MELROSE: I really like that Puakō ends up in north. I understand the trade off here. Okay, so if we're gonna go, we've been up to the other side of that, do you want to take a quick look at yours René, and then let's go to work on a Plan B.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yes please.

MR. MELROSE: Yeah that was Brenda's. Now this is how you think we should split this Puna.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yes. And you know, disregard whatever it does to any of the other districts because as I---

MR. MELROSE: I wish we could do that!

CHR. SIRACUSA: No, wait a second – wait, wait, wait, let me finish my sentence; because I invite the commission to finesse those boundaries. I was working with the boundaries that I know best. Please, don't misunderstand me. Don't misunderstand me. But what I'm saying here is that this includes Volcano, it has the traditional Puna Makai and Puna Mauka boundaries configuration the way we think of ourselves, and that includes the communities north of Highway 11 which are definitely still in Puna.

MR. MELROSE: What are the numbers on this one; the district numbers?

CHR. SIRACUSA: So if you zoom in Shyla so that the commissioners can see where---

MR. CARVALHO: What do you do with Waikōloa on this one?

CHR. SIRACUSA: I'm not dealing with that. I'm letting the Waimea people deal with that boundary. I try to do it a little bit but I have to admit that I don't know the fine tuning on these boundaries and that's why my communication to you said, please look at what I did for Puna and then each one of you work on your own, finessing your own boundaries on this to make it you know.

MR. MELROSE: Does this split HPP?

CHR. SIRACUSA: Okay, no I did not split HPP. Basically, that little purple part up there is both sides of the highway which is Hawaiian Homes. I did not split Hawaiian Homes, whereas the other maps do. Which is Maku'u Hawaiian Homes in Puna?

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: What's the population?

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: If I was to use the analogy that I heard from Paradise Park, we don't have 4,000 lots to be built upon, but we got about 1,200. 1,200 lots that's ready to be built, except that it's on a water source that the whole county may need one day.

MR. MELROSE: So in this case, I mean, I just don't know that we have the luxury of looking at only a portion of the puzzle, and so what this does when you take the edge and keep Volcano in it and you include the whole of Puna inside the Puna district with the excess going into Hilo is, without a doubt, you include Waikoloa and you push Waimea into Hāmākua. That's what we heard clearly wasn't what we wanted to do; you can't have your cake and eat it too.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Well let's take a look. Let's go around the island and take a look and see how it you know. I felt that we're better off if we have the overflow so I maxed out the two Puna populations, two Puna district populations so that we had the minimum number of Puna people going into any other district.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Shyla, click on the "display names" so we can see the populations.

CHR. SIRACUSA: So let's move up towards Hilo.

MS. POINDEXTER: Well, let's start from the 1; how we go around the island again. Is that okay?

CHR. SIRACUSA: But I was working us around counterclockwise. So, I would like to see us move in that direction. Then I'm asking the commission to tweak boundaries as we move along. Patrick, I did attempt to keep Pana'ewa and Keaukaha in the same district. Now this whole line here between 1 and 2 is---I'm not attached to because I admit that it's not my area of expertise so I would hope that those commissioners would work on those adjustments.

MR. MELROSE: We're working off of Plan A here. We just made some adjustments within Plan A is what you did here, right?

CHR. SIRACUSA: Exactly. I started with Plan A, I adjusted for Puna and then I tried to move things around counterclockwise taking into consideration what people wanted. But I don't know those areas personally the way the rest of you do so I wanted to leave that up to the rest of you. I tried to take into consideration the line between Downtown and Hāmākua and but I must admit that the rest of the Council 1/2 boundary I'm not very familiar with that area.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Well this 1/2 boundary works. This one works as far as the roads are concerned between 1 and 2, but---

CHR. SIRACUSA: That's what I was trying for.

MS. POINDEXTER: It's just the roads that work only, right?

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: No, well, and the numbers work.

MS. POINDEXTER: I mean roads and numbers, but what about communities?

CHR. SIRACUSA: That's why I'm asking the commissioners help. We're supposed to work together to make a plan.

MS. POINDEXTER: Yes, so can we go look all the way up by Hāmākua.

MR. MELROSE: Did the Planning Commission just get over? Did it just get over?

CHR. SIRACUSA: I know I got Honoka'a in Hāmākua and a little bit north of that but I think because the numbers will allow a little more incursion of Hāmākua into 9 if you want it. Because Hāmākua could come up a little and 9 could come down a little which would then allow Waikoloa to stay whole and maybe Puakō to come in.

MS. POINDEXTER: Yeah but then that puts Āhualoa right? Into 9, yeah.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yeah but there's room to add that to one.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: You also have to bring Waipi'o Valley back into---

MS. POINDEXTER: Yeah, because Waipi'o Valley and Kukuihaele---

CHR. SIRACUSA: Okay so where is Waipi'o?

MR. KANUHA: You wanna zoom out.

MS. POINDEXTER: Right there. Kapolena, Waipi'o. There's that big area there.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Ah, I see that. Okay.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: But there aren't many people there so that's not that big a deal.

MR. KANUHA: Does that go all the way to North Kohala? Okay, okay.

MS. POINDEXTER: Yeah. That wouldn't work though. Because then you cutting off Kapolena, Waipi'o, Kukuihaele.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: You could get Waipi'o into this without any problem.

MS. POINDEXTER: Think so?

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Sure.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yeah see because you could – Council 1 could get some more numbers and Council 9 could shed so that line can be moved.

MS. POINDEXTER: But then what happens on this one is we're moving more into Hilo versus moving more into Waimea which I think we have more in common with the –

CHR. SIRACUSA: Are we really? I thought I had my line above the Wailuku River.

MR. KANUHA: No. You're way down into Hilo.

MS. POINDEXTER: Cause you're by Kaūmana, coming up Kaūmana and all on that side yeah.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Well that was not my intent.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: This is where you get into the problem of if you take from here then you – and it's virtually impossible.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Oh yeah, I know, I know that. It has to give somewhere.

MS. POINDEXTER: It's not easy right, Margaret? It's like almost impossible. It's real difficult.

MR. CARVALHO: Rene, we'll need to move Waipi'o over; Waipi'o in Honoka'a. That goes back into district 1. And then you gotta move back on the other side.

MS. POINDEXTER: Yeah, but what we're saying we gotta pull out of Hilo.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I have no problem with pulling out of Hilo.

MR. KANUHA: This one includes Waikloloa? Into 9?

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yes, but I couldn't get Puakō in and that's why I was hoping that if we could move Council 1 north a little bit more that we could then you know taking some of the numbers from 9, then we might be able to get Puakō.

MS. POINDEXTER: Yeah but that's why I think when the Map 40 was closer to what; this section was closer to what we wanted but---

CHR. SIRACUSA: It was just that it wasn't what Puna really needs. And that was my big concern is to show you guys what a configuration for Puna should look like and no matter what map we end up working with to choose, I would like to see as much as possible that Puna Mauka, Puna Makai including Volcano configuration. Well I think Volcano, it's more important to put Volcano in Puna than it is to have Kea'au in Puna and I'll tell you why. And you've heard it already and that is because Volcano traditionally has been in Puna. Volcano took part, a very active role in the Puna Community Development Plan which was passed as an ordinance in 2008, in August of 2008 and therefore you know they've been working on those issues including the Biosphere Reserve issue actively – the action plan – Volcano people have nothing in common to do at all with the nearest Ka'ū community which is Pāhala. They tend to gravitate more towards Kea'au. Kea'au on the other hand is much closer, mileage wise, to Hilo than Volcano is to Pāhala and they tend to sort of gear in that direction anyway for everything that they need, whether it's entertainment, going to the movies or most or a lot of their shopping and all of that stuff. So I felt if we had to take from somewhere, it's better to move a little bit of Kea'au into South Hilo, rather than move Volcano into Ka'ū. But also, in my trying to max out the numbers for the two Puna districts, my thought was that we would then have the least number of Puna people put into a Hilo district and the least number of people being inconvenienced or harmed. So that was my thinking about it and whatever you decide to do, whatever map you decide to make, Linda and I would both very much like to see that general Puna configuration included.

MS. POINDEXTER: And the difficulty here is like what we said. Somebody's gonna get cut and I mean somebody is going to have to split. And where it would be the most less impact, I mean you know like Waimea wants to stay together like how Volcano wants to

stay together. You know, so those are the hard choices.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Well look at it this way. When Patrice McDonald was testifying and she was saying that we didn't have any hearings in her district. She lives in Fern Forest. Her district right now is Ka'ū. But she doesn't go all the way down to Nā'ālehu, you know. She came to the Kea'au meeting. She came to the Pāhoa meeting.

MS. POINDEXTER: It's just like Waimea when they have meetings for their CDP, the Waimea area, you know Nani Waimea, they don't come down to Honoka'a to meet. They go to their Waimea Community Center but yet they are still in the Hāmākua district. So I understand where Volcano is coming to and I feel for Volcano.

CHR. SIRACUSA: It's a large, numerically it's a large community. We would be harming a very large community by putting it in Ka'ū. Kea'au doesn't have that many numbers.

MS. POINDEXTER: Yeah. I feel for Waimea and Volcano. And then at some point we just gotta start coming to some agreement on where we gotta do the split. Cause if not we can keep going around, trying to make a map and everybody going to try keep figuring. But we gotta come to some type of agreement at some point on where is going to have the less impact.

MR. MELROSE: Let me just put a thought to this. I think we're creating an alternative and we're not creating our map. The first map we got is a map that keeps all of Puna in Puna and all of the 4,500 votes in excess of the two seats are retained in Puna. When you do that you end up that District 6 has to expand north, Waikōloa has to be part of North Kona, Honoka'a has to be part of the Waimea District period. So that's what we have as Plan B. We need to create a plan. That's Plan A. We need to create Plan B. Plan B is going to, without doubt, cut Waimea, cut Volcano and try to do the best we can with the rest of em. That's not a decision Rene, that's an alternative.

MS. POINDEXTER: So is now the time to make a motion to accept Plan 40 and turn it into Plan B?

MR. CARVALHO: Okay, hold on, hold on. I should have said this sooner. But there is one last revision that came in for Plan 40 and there's a lot of compromises on it that I think we should take a look at. Is that okay with the commission? Shyla, that's the one we just got.

CHR. SIRACUSA: No, what we started looking at was the 11, November 1<sup>st</sup> addition. Oh, one came in this morning. Oh, nobody told me that. Okay, let's look at that then.

MR. CARVALHO: Since this is a brand new one, I would like to have Margaret take a look at it because there's a lot of compromises being made on few districts.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Okay, let's look at this morning's version then.

MR. CARVALHO: Margaret could you quickly go through it I mean.

MS. WILLE: Basically, everybody would hate this but um let me just say---

MR. MELROSE: Oh perfect.

MS. WILLE: The points that Patrick brought up those adjustments, and René brought up in terms of configuring Hawaiian Homelands I think can be added into this. However, right now, Plan 40 does cut a portion of Waimea. It does cut east Waimea but it's included it's like um in the CDP it's considered part of the community. But the bulk of Waimea is in 9 and so Waimea has a very – that's its presence. What I tried to do was cut everybody but give a block of each of the communities that are at issue in the district that they want to be but they are not entirely there. So if you take, and she can run through it, Brenda's gonna tell you starting with Puakō I took off part of Puakō that's attached to Mauna Lani that takes out 400, but it's still the big Wailua Bay all along the ocean beach of Puakō. Moving to along, and it keeps Waikōloa, it takes out a corner of that. Happens to be where Pete Hoffman lives, but the bulk is in 9. So that's where they're gonna have their presence. So people, just cuz their community room and Kula Street are off, they're gonna may have to go vote, but they're basically 9. That you know, maybe one corner. Then going over to east end Waimea it included all of the residential streets on the Kohala side. It does not take in Lakeland. Lakeland is where the line splits. Again, we've been living this for twenty years. The shuttle bus starts in Lakeland. Everything is, they're part of that community. I tried to get people to come in and talk.

MR. MELROSE: Could you zoom in to Lakeland Shyla? It would be a lot easier to have this conversation with the map than conceptually.

MS. WILLE: So, let me just say Hāmākua could shift a little bit more into Waimea or little more into Hilo on this one. And it's just trying to keep the minimal Hāmākua numbers so that Nani Waimea and all of those streets going up to the Mud Lane area would all be in Waimea but that little square where, right when you get to Mud Lane and turn into Lakeland that whole district would stay in with Hāmākua. Again, go all the way down to 1 and 2 split, yeah 1 and 2, keep going – the Wailuku River Hilo. And okay, and again I would say probably Valerie and Jeff could look at this and sort of look and Joe, I took out one more, it still does cross the river and as far as I'm concerned.

MR. MELROSE: Go mauka please. It split Ainako subdivision.

MS. POINDEXTER: Like I said I would rather still move towards more Waimea.

MS. WILLE: I think Waimea, you could do that. I'm just saying I tried to be as---I think east Waimea you can do that. So if you just keep going down um so Jeff I think you can add those back in take a little more of east Waimea, deal with Joe. Okay and then I think that you can change this here to what Patrick was saying and deal with those numbers.

MR. MELROSE: Can you turn up the numbers on this Shyla just so we can see as you go around.

MS. WILLE: Let me say this is---I used Brenda's base and I adjusted it to the concerns from the people I heard around and what you all have been saying and um listen to Joe. Okay, so just keep going down to the next 3 and 4. 3 and 4, some of the District 4 people wanted this line up here at Keauhou Road and others want it down towards um closer to Hawaiian Paradise Park. I think that could be switched, you'd have to add a little bit.

MR. MELROSE: That line can look better because there's really no population in there.

MS. WILLE: There's no population, that's where those orchards are so I thought it was okay and came down into Keauhou, so if you keep going down to 5 and 6. Let me just say on that connectivity I went by what the plan, the program says. If it said there's connectivity I say there's connectivity. So there's legal connectivity. You may go the dump road or the over this and everybody may drive through Pāhoa but there's legal, everything on this map is legally connected.

MR. MELROSE: Not right here. You can't get through.

MS. WILLE: No, I'm not saying you can, but you go on the Plan and it says. We can change where René lives and I think her plan is much better in terms of those Puna roads and how she did the Hawaiian Homelands so I think you can do that. Then go to Volcano, go down to 5 and 6. Let me just explain. This sort of reverses what Scott was the main person I worked on a lot of these and this like reverses what he has. And you can do I understand where I didn't go up as high into Volcano. But what this does is it takes the whole rural Volcano area, puts it with 5 you know the golf course community the northern community, but it takes Volcano, the concentrated block vote and puts it with the National Park, where it is, where it's been. Where it is on the map shows Ka'ū when you look on the plan. So I'm saying it is a compromise. Everybody is hurt going around. I think you can the one thing probably the harder problem well if you kept going around is how to deal with 7. Um if you keep going so um it is sort of saying Volcano you straddle two interests. Maybe your social life is here but your topographical life is shared interest. You have different communities of interest. Um okay and again I use basically Brenda's but I adjusted it in order to get Puakō in I had to knock 8 a little bit south and 7 and little bit south. I know Dru you said that wasn't quite as good but it was okay but not your preferred. And maybe what Jeff said where you could adjust the more mauka areas and leave the, but down here on okay so here um I think one could possibly play with the industrial area pull more of that and more of that towards the upper road and pull that in somewhat but basically and then go up to Puakō if you go to Puakō and people in Puakō aren't gonna like this either but um it's where Robbie is where so, if you get even closer on that, can you pull it in closer? You see that strip right along, that right there. Okay that otherwise that's a whole census block. I think---

MR. CARVALHO: But it splits Puakō mauka/makai.

MS. WILLE: Yes it does. And the people I know that I know, if you said the bulk of Puakō is in 9, yes you're gonna have to go vote there, this works for the island. The people I know would be okay. So I'm just saying you're putting the bulk of Puakō see where it says Puakō Bay all of that along there, Puakō takes a hit yes and Waikoloa I know Pete was frowning when I showed him this, but he didn't say anything. But I sort of put - the whole idea on this one is okay I mean if Linda said I'm okay, give up Volcano we can move and everything else can go adjust 40 but um otherwise, this is you know not the---Nobody wins on this one.

MR. KANUHA: In all the places we have major concerns over, everybody is giving up something.

MS. WILLE: But the bulk of their community is in the district that they wanted to be in. That's - and Volcano. Well and maybe you could adjust. You could adjust more of that. But it basically is taking a cut on each one.

MR. MELROSE: You know the theory about that though is that you know the way for instance Volcano's cut, there's so few votes in Volcano that it really doesn't have any clout. To me if you're gonna cut Volcano you cut it in it's large; you know so whoever represents it, you know whether it's got a representative out of Ka'ū or if it's got a representative out of Puna, it's big enough to have, you know, you gotta come up here and talk to us. But you know a little also ran, nah, they don't even go. So um I see the effort to try and gore everybody's socks but I'm, my tendency is to try and find something that takes a couple of good gores and we live with it.

MS. WILLE: Anyway that's if you look at that, that's what the intent there.

MR. MELROSE: Thank you Margaret.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Did we do um Mike's revisions to Draft Plan A?

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: It didn't do much.

MS. POINDEXTER: He said it didn't do much so it's no big deal.

MR. MELROSE: Remember we're building, we gotta build B.

MS. POINDEXTER: Yeah, so can I make a motion to accept 40 as our Plan B so that we can work on that?

MR. KANUHA: Which 40?

MS. POINDEXTER: Oh, the most recent 40, what is it? The one that we were just - was it this -

MR. MELROSE: Not this one.

MS. POINDEXTER: Not this one, the one prior to this one. The one before this one. What is that 40?

MR. CARVALHO: It was 11.1

MS. POINDEXTER: 11.1. The 40 before this. So 40 – 11.1, is that what?

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yeah. November 1.

Ms. Poindexter moved to save Plan 40, revised on November 1, 2011, as Commission's working Plan B. Seconded by Mr. Kanuha.

MR. MELROSE: And then I just want to make sure that the commission feels that 40 was closer than the BJJ one we looked at earlier. Because my sense was one was going to take more work than the other. Anybody got any recollection on that?

CHR. SIRACUSA: That was my feeling as well. And we did have a tremendous amount of testimony on 40.

MS. POINDEXTER: And just making sure that we keep in mind the testimony about what like Puna and Volcano liked about Plan A. So keeping in mind those things while we work.

MR. MELROSE: Well we haven't gotten rid of Plan A.

CHR. SIRACUSA: If we accept 40 as our working Plan B, then I certainly would, you know,

MS. POINDEXTER: Keep saying Forty Eleven One.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I would consider voting for it only if the commission would consider incorporating you know, the mauka/makai format for Puna into that.

MR. MELROSE: I would not make that conditional to my vote. I would make it as part of a conversation but I don't think it's fair to put that as a condition on this vote at this moment in time.

MR. CARVALHO: René, I would say the same thing.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I wouldn't be able to support it otherwise.

MS. POINDEXTER: Okay, so we can vote on that so there's a motion for Forty Eleven One to be our Plan B and we had discussion so can we, is it proper to do the vote?

MR. KAHUI: Call for the question.

CHR. SIRACUSA: If we're pau with discussion we can vote.

The motion to save Plan\_40, revised on November 1, 2011, as Commission's working Plan\_B was carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiola'a, Kahui, Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth, and Poindexter.

Noes: Chair Siracusa.

Absent: Commissioner Ugalde.

*Review and Discuss Commission Draft Plan\_B*

CHR. SIRACUSA: Do we want to start working on it now? Okay. Let's start with District One.

MS. POINDEXTER: So let's start at that 1 and 9. Waimea, between Waimea and---Zoom into that. And I think we had to take a little bit more further down than White Road yeah?

MR. MELROSE: What's the number. The numbers. So percentage wise, yeah. Nine is about as big as it can get so 9 has to come down and I think one of the big issues is gonna be between how Waimea, between the Waimea and Hilo interface and um I don't know how far you have to go into Waimea but I think you could figure it out by looking at a fair treatment of the Hilo side and see if um that doesn't tell us something.

MS. POINDEXTER: So why don't we---Do you want to work on the Hilo side first to take out Hilo?

MR. MELROSE: Let's look at the Hilo side and just see where that goes. And we can go back and forth, but all the way down. It's locked. Yeah I think you could get back to the river at least through Wailuku Drive and Piihonua. It's not that you gonna end up with maybe Reed's Island or something else.

MS. POINDEXTER: Can you take that out? Give it back, just take it out and let's give it back to District 2 and then we'll go from there and see how it---

MR. MELROSE: Yeah that's right. Now you have to get Piihonua so, just take a chunk out of there, we don't have to work it out in detail. We can figure it out later but as long as you get the bulk of Piihonua camp. Yeah, just take the one piece right above it where it says Piihonua, no no, get that, some more, some more, some more. Yeah that's the one. That's it. That gets it all and it's just the Piihonua people. We can fix it bom-by. Okay, so now let's go back, go down to the coastline again. We come up, there's just a small fix

right there on the river, on the road but, now what does that do for coming back into Waimea?

MS. POINDEXTER: Yeah because you want to give that small little road part back into Hilo too. Okay.

MR. MELROSE: Actually up to the river is a section there. That's the homeless sleep over there.

MS. POINDEXTER: So you can have that back in East Hawai'i. So Waimea now. If we pull, how much more we gotta pull into? Where's the deviations? Whoa. Okay so we gotta pull; look at the deviation.

MR. MELROSE: We can fix 2 bom-by.

MS. POINDEXTER: You can fix 2 'cause you gotta give 2, some of 2. That's now this Waimea community being split but we're, Joe, I think we can work with that, correct?

MR. CARVALHO: Well we're just making an alternative here. Does it make sense at this point to look at what you need to do in Puakō. I mean are you comfortable with splitting the road down the middle of Puakō? Oh, it's the old one. I'm sorry, this one has Puakō in it.

MR. MELROSE: Margaret, Margaret, I'm gonna suggest this is a commission's plan now and you should sit back. Please.

MS. POINDEXTER: If you can zoom into there and see what we have to take there to get--Zoom in where White Road is and where we gotta pull in more.

MR. CARVALHO: Yeah, take from White Road east.

MS. POINDEXTER: Yeah, I know, yeah we gotta go up here but I'm wondering what is across the road. Like I don't know, Joe you know this portion a little bit more?

MR. CARVALHO: Yeah. Take an area under it and you'll be better off.

MS. POINDEXTER: There. Yeah where your hand is we gotta take all that portion, that blocks those two -- yeah all of that, take all of that. How far are we off on the deviations?

MR. CARVALHO: District one, okay go back in.

MR. MELROSE: Still gotta go a little more.

MS. POINDEXTER: We need little bit more people. So we gotta move uh Mānā Road, yeah.

MR. MELROSE: You take the mauka road; if you turn to Puanani you get plenty votes quick.

MS. POINDEXTER: Mānā Road area. Cause you have a lot of houses in there too eh by Mānā Road?

MR. KANUHA: Not that many.

MS. POINDEXTER: One of that back road?

MR. MELROSE: Nah, not that much. Hardly.

MR. CARVALHO: Okay go back up above, yeah – is that Puanani right there? On the mauka side of the road, 19. The other side right?

MR. MELROSE: Okay we're trying to get you to get on the other side, the mauka side of Māmalahoa Highway.

MR. CARVALHO: Above 19. Yeah. That's the one.

MS. POINDEXTER: That is Puanani. Is that Puanani?

MR. MELROSE: And that road, the tricky one about that is that road splits down the middle and you have people on either side but there is a gulch right there through Puanani that doesn't you know if you just take the next two census tracts what does that do for us?

MR. CARVALHO: Actually we went a little further than Puanani didn't we?

MR. MELROSE: Well no, that's Puanani, that's increment three. So take the next two census blocks right there because then there's a gulch in between them and not a roadway. Right. Exactly.

MR. CARVALHO: Yeah. Perfect. Nice.

MR. MELROSE: And one more. So that splits Puanani but how close are we?

MR. CARVALHO: You know that triangle spot there. I don't think there's any people in there, is there? I think we can just make it look better if we can – no up, up, up. Yeah that one.

MS. POINDEXTER: But that one was okay too, if we're okay with that other little triangle too. Yeah you can do both.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: Just to make 'em look aesthetically better.

MS. POINDEXTER: You can do both because when you did the other one, it just gone up seventy something more. So that one and the one she just did.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA‘A: She going try.

MR. MELROSE: Went up ten.

MS. POINDEXTER: Okay, then take that triangle down there, right there yeah. I think you add seventy – ohh. There, there, awesome.

MR. CARVALHO: That looks better. Alright; excellent. Okay I think it looks okay now on that side, the east side.

MR. MELROSE: We need to fix the piece at Waikoloa where we pick up that Hall housing. Waiki‘i ends up in 9 then still yeah? You sure? Waiki‘i is split, it’s kinda split up.

MR. CARVALHO: We can pick it up eh?

MR. MELROSE: Yeah I think you should pick it up.

MR. CARVALHO: Pick up Waiki‘i, the middle part.

MR. MELROSE: Actually that puts all of Waiki‘i in the other district.

MR. CARVALHO: Waiki‘i we can fix bum by I think, don’t you think so? Yeah I think just depending on how it is, cause right now you can get up to it and it’s part of 8. Can we just take the center part right now then we can tweak it some more.

MR. MELROSE: Okay, up to you.

MR. CARVALHO: Please. Waiki‘i. Go back to Waiki‘i, zoom in and then we’ll take that Waiki‘i and put it in district 9.

MR. MELROSE: Waiki‘i belongs in District 9. There’s no question. It’s kind of out there.

MR. CARVALHO: It looks okay now. Can we go to Waikōloa. That housing area, there are two, two or three blocks.

MR. MELROSE: So that’s the one needs to –

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Two big blocks and a little round one; one looks like a (inaudible).

MR. CARVALHO: You’re building uh 9 right?

MR. KANUHA: And how many people you said were in that? 200?

MR. MELROSE: Yeah that's okay, now get the one below it. Might as well. There's no people in it. Okay, there's nobody there either, but go down. Yeah, right there. That area. Both blocks, there you go.

MR. KANUHA: Can you display the districts, the block. Okay thanks. All I know is district 8 is gonna have to take from district 7 and in this one for me, district 7 I wanted to have a lot of the industrial area included. And right now district 7 is already at a negative 4.99, district 8 is negative 6 point something. So district 8 is digging into district 7, district 7 is gonna move over more district 6 which screws up a lot of the lines that I felt were a lot more appropriate towards district 7 and district 8 and district 6.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Pull Waikii back into district 8.

MR. KANUHA: How many people does Waikii have in there? A couple hundred?

MR. CARVALHO: Are you okay? You need a break? Okay good. We're looking at the clock over here making sure that we didn't take you overtime cause it's a long weekend and all.

MR. MELROSE: So could you put Waikii back. Put it in 8. Would that be better put Waikii back in 8?

MR. KANUHA: I don't know how much it's going to do but, yeah.

MR. MELROSE: Oops. One little ding-a-ling. Yeah, just that little hanging on thing. Yea

MR. KANUHA: Okay, that's alright we can clean it up. Um.

CHR. SIRACUSA: There's one little dot there.

MR. MELROSE: That's alright.

MR. CARVALHO: That's 28 people.

MR. MELROSE: We'll figure it out.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: There's a hundred and fifty two guys there.

MR. MELROSE: Standing on top of one another. Okay so now we'll need to come down and that interface right, you wanted to add more to the industrial area.

MR. KANUHA: District 8 is already negative beyond its deviation.

MR. MELROSE: Is it?

MR. KANUHA: Yeah.

MR. MELROSE: Ugh. Well, what if you um give 8 more on the mauka side.

MR. KANUHA: Yeah. Let's go back into Kailua, zoom into. I want to just automatically take the industrial.

MR. MELROSE: Yeah. I think we should. There's not many people in it right? There's a little on the coastline.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: That's your problem right there. We're a hundred under on 8, we're even on 7 and we're a hundred over on 6.

MR. KANUHA: That's how this plan already started.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Yeah.

MR. KANUHA: So when we move, we keep on moving from the other districts back into Kona it already, there's not much room to move anyway.

MR. MELROSE: Well, let's get your industrial area back and get over to the full side of uh what is –

MR. KANUHA: Yeah Shyla, take everything underneath Queen Ka'ahumanu Highway right there. Yeah. And towards Kona Airport.

MR. MELROSE: Yeah. The next two over. Yep. Right there. You left the park in yeah, the Old A.

MR. KANUHA: Well you left the whole subdivision, Kona – what is it? Kona Bay? Yeah.

MR. MELROSE: Do you need it – do you want it?

MR. KANUHA: Um.

MR. CARVALHO: It's commercial anyway. There's nothing there eh?

MR. KANUHA: No there's a lot of homes.

MR. CARVALHO: Lot of homes in there? Oh okay, I see it. Oh that's right.

MR. MELROSE: Big houses on the water.

MR. CARVALHO: I forgot about the public access thing there.

MR. KANUHA: Just try to take it. Um, yeah. Just see how many. Oh, not that many.

MR. MELROSE: Nobody at the pool that day huh? Now we gotta come back to –

MR. KANUHA: Now let's set the mauka portion. Bo did you have any –

MR. KAHUI: Yeah I appreciate that Dru now if we can just kinda narrow you know that last revision so I can see where the boundary would lie. Would that be on Māmalahoa Highway dividing –

MR. KANUHA: It's Queen Ka'ahumanu, it goes down QLCC, yeah down Old Māmalahoa Trail it says and that's the road to Pawai, the camping spots down QLCC.

MR. KAHUI: And that's okay I think that we agreed that QLCC is part of the industrial area anyway. Did that boundary go further north into the sewage treatment plant area?

MR. KANUHA: No.

MR. KAHUI: And okay. And then I'm good with that.

MR. MELROSE: So we gotta put back into 8 right? Now 8 from 7. Cause we can pick up – 7 can grow from 6.

MR. CARVALHO: We're gonna have to take from the southern part.

MR. MELROSE: Well then we gotta go back into Volcano. It's alright. So uh –

MR. KANUHA: Okay let's see – zoom in a little bit.

MR. KAHUI: For the purpose of this discussion and the way we're addressing these maps if we continue this course we're gonna end up with map so I do appreciate now we're working counter clockwise.

MR. MELROSE: Good. Okay. So you gotta add some more to 8 right.

MR. KANUHA: Pull (inaudible) – personally for me I want to keep the whole mountain or mauka/makai connection and by doing this it keeps on pulling more south and loses that mauka/makai connection between this urban Kailua Village zone and I mean a lot of these are Kailua. This is all Kailua.

MR. MELROSE: You can do that by splitting the town but that's your option right? So if you hold the town tight then that's kinda what happens right?

MR. KANUHA: Yeah.

MR. MELROSE: What's that configuration look like now if you pull back, just go backward, um pull out – zoom out a little bit. One more time.

MR. KANUHA: Okay.

CHR. SIRACUSA: You don't think that 9 could give some bodies to 8 here?

MR. KANUHA: Okay can we zoom in. I guess we gotta take more of 7. Um, I'm gonna see what an appropriate boundary would be. It's easy with this because that's Hualālai Road. Just try to put or take that whole, you're gonna have to take that whole subdivision, Pualani Estates. No, well more of district 8 needs to go into district 7. I mean 7 gotta go into district 8. This is gonna be splitting neighborhoods. Personally for me I can't see going any farther south from this line.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Do you want to see if you can, if district 9 can shed some into 8?

MR. KAHUI: This is Bo again out in Kona. You know I think if um district 7 has to give 8 maybe that southern boundary might be, might work. To move that boundary north and maybe we might accomplish in looking at the previous boundary, Waiaha Stream I believe it was, uh was the district boundary from uh, between 7 and 8. But all I'm suggesting is that we're gonna break up Kona, if we're gonna do that maybe it will have a lesser impact if we move that southern boundary further north.

MR. KANUHA: I totally agree with you. With this plan we can't move this boundary between 7 and 8 any more north because 8 needs to go south and I can't, for me personally I can't see that boundary going any more south than what is it right now.

MR. MELROSE: Because of the configuration.

MR. KANUHA: Because of all the configurations and all the census tracts. There's a lot of neighborhoods inside here. We are splitting, I mean in any, in every map that we are looking at Kona is being cut up in every map so I just, I don't know where to go from here.

CHR. SIRACUSA: By the way Shyla, please tell us when you feel like you're burned out and you can't do anymore okay?

MR. MELROSE: Came up just at Hienaloli Road, just see what this looks like. There is one right in here that comes up Hienaloli and then back to Māmalahoa, just as a thought.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Is that Hualālai Road?

MR. MELROSE: No Hienaloli. No, you're right. Up Hualālai.

MR. KANUHA: Yeah Shyla, you see Hualālai Road in district 7, see that whole triangle. Um district 7, the marker for district 7. Yeah, see that triangle between Hualālai Road and the two main roads? Yeah, just to see, just pull it in district 8. See the triangle. Yeah. I don't like to do this because I mean yeah it makes sense but it does split up Hōlualoa, mauka/makai. It completely splits up that whole community and Hōlualoa is a unique community in itself. So yeah I definitely would undo that. I just wanted to see. Sorry.

MR. MELROSE: But you know, if you look at this I mean the idea of holding town together as one place I mean I understand the concept there but I just share from Downtown Hilo's perspective that we've had really good fortune by having two people representing Downtown. We have two guys working with us in that circumstance, they both come because these are both industrial areas and they are important. So the business district if you split it, I think you actually get a benefit for Downtown and you can move back into some of the residential area there as well and take some votes. In other words build 8 by going back on the coast, picking up some of those residents makai. Pull down a little bit.

MR. KANUHA: Shyla, let's see. Below Queen Ka'ahumanu Highway and see um go down to the right a little bit where Hualālai Road is, maybe try to take some of 7 and put it in 8. Yeah. Just – maybe take the next census block up.

MR. MELROSE: That's not Hamburger Hill?

MR. KANUHA: Zoom in towards what we just did. Is that Aloha Kona? No that's not Hamburger Hill. That's Aloha Kona Subdivision. Uh uh – Hamburger Hill is more over here. McDonalds is, where is it. Somewhere over here. This is Hamburger Hill.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Is that all one subdivision?

MR. KANUHA: Yeah.

MR. KAHUI: I see, that's the one by the Mormon Tabernacle/Temple.

MR. KANUHA: Okay that brings the deviation close for district 8? Okay.

MR. MELROSE: Seven is still low but we can pick up some.

MR. KANUHA: Okay, I don't like it too much but it's okay for this discussion.

MR. KAHUI: This is good for this discussion and then hopefully at the next meeting we can revisit those boundary lines, but unfortunately I have to leave.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you so much for your time and energy and input Bo. And um for the record that's twenty to four.

MR. MELROSE: Bo, when you uh, for the next time, I think between you, if you and Dru can pull whatever we save up as B and take a look at that so at our next meeting we're not kinda stumbling around, we know where we're gonna go. Because you guys got a bigger feel for it. I'm glad to take whatever that you think is the right answer.

MR. KAHUI: With the exception of the Sunshine Law, I think both of us could be sitting somewhere making, working this out. But uh.

MR. MELROSE: You can do it. Two guys can.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Two guys can.

MR. KAHUI: Well under that note then maybe we'll get together, Dru and I before –

MR. MELROSE: Have a proposal on the table.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yeah, don't come to any agreements. Just have your proposal.

MR. MELROSE: Have a proposal you both agree to.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Or even more than one proposal or alternatives are okay too.

MR. KAHUI: I appreciate that. We'll keep in touch. Dru and I will keep in touch. And then we'll look at this final version after today as I guess Plan 40 dash one dash one, one. Eleven dash one.

CHR. SIRACUSA: No, Commission Plan B.

MR. KAHUI: Okay, then I'll be looking forward to that. Thank you.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Thank you.

MR. MELROSE: Thank you very much Bo.

MR. KANUHA: Okay Shyla let's look towards 7 and 6.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We're looking at the 6 and 7 boundary, yeah.

MR. KANUHA: Let's zoom in towards, above Haleki'i. Yeah the boundary by the road. Yeah. See that's a huge census block too. Zoom out one. Just try to – let's see if you – cause I don't know if you take that whole block it will cut Konawaena right in half. Yeah. Konawaena School Road.

MR. MELROSE: I was thinking about the makai side. Remember how we liked this line here and that – because Haleki'i splits Haleki'i.

MR. KANUHA: I know but, when you do that it takes away from 7 and then you want to take in 6 yeah.

MR. MELROSE: Are you trying to build 7?

MR. KANUHA: Yeah. We're trying to build 7.

MR. MELROSE: Konawaena is not a bad road to split though.

MR. KANUHA: What, split Konawaena School right in half?

MR. MELROSE: Well it doesn't make a difference. I mean they're not – that's ...

CHR. SIRACUSA: It was pointed out in testimony that Konawaena School serves two areas, people in two different areas.

MR. KANUHA: Shyla, try take below, south of Haleki'i, that big block right there. All that. Just the one straight across. Yeah. And maybe the census block below that too. Yeah. And the one below that.

MR. MELROSE: Is that Greenwell Farms? Is that good? 6 gotta grow?

CHR. SIRACUSA: 6 gotta grow and I can see what's gonna happen. You're gonna take it from Volcano.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: We all move Ka'u.

MR. KANUHA: I know exactly what you're saying. I don't like it either.

MR. MELROSE: What's that?

MR. KANUHA: The Volcano.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: We back to that again.

MR. MELROSE: Well I don't think that this alternative can avoid that. I'm sorry, I don't like it but I don't think we can avoid it. As an alternative conversation we keep it in then we got the Waikoloa/Hāmākua (inaudible). If we're gonna take it in this we take the whole of Volcano, not just a small manini piece.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: You mean take the whole of Volcano out.

MR. MELROSE: Yeah. Put it back into 6.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: It's already in 6.

MR. MELROSE: We take the whole district. We don't take a little piece of it.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Shyla, go over to Volcano.

MR. KANUHA: It is in 6.

MR. MELROSE: Remember this one? It's the one we wanted to get-- that they--she would have come down to Akatsuka. So if you go in a little farther, not all of Volcano is in District 6.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Go over to that – Akatsuka.

MR. MELROSE: All the way to the link over to where it comes down from the other side. That's Royal Hawaiian Subdivision. Yeah take this subdivision. Yeah. Now you're close enough. Shyla pull back just a second. Look at 6 as it goes over the top of Puna, what does it do? Okay, it just goes up. Alright.

MR. MELROSE: Can we take uh – isn't 3 too big? No, yeah. Three's too big. Huh?

CHR. SIRACUSA: Well 4 could yield – oh no, oh no.

MR. MELROSE: 5 could pick up some back of the Puna vote. We got sworn at by somebody saying "nobody in Puna wants to be a part of a Hilo vote!" You can move that South Road up to uh the boundary back in 5. 5 is low and you could pull down 3 a little bit. And I think you know that we gotta, as we get close to the end of this we gotta sit down and look at the Hilo line closely. What goes to Hilo.

MR. CARVALHO: But if you know the boundaries though we can fix the lines in between em. Yeah?

CHR. SIRACUSA: How are you holding up Shyla?

MS. POINDEXTER: How is Volcano doing?

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: Volcano? You mean in Ka'u?

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yeah that's what they did. Um, are you okay?

MR. MELROSE: What time do you usually pau work, 4:00 or 4:30? We'll be done before then.

MR. KAHAWAIOLA'A: But she still going take a break.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Okay, I'm gonna call a break for everybody here.

RECESS: At 3:50 p.m. the Chair called for a recess.

RECONVENE: The meeting was reconvened at 4:05 p.m.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We are back into session again, and now we are getting ready to look at Puna. Shyla, move your hand just a little bit to the right, to your right. No, too much. Right in there, that is the Pāhoa Bypass area. I would like you to zoom in on that area. At the very least, I would like to see that section, where your hand is, go into District 5. I just want to see what happens if you put that into District 5. Then, my community can at least can get to Pāhoa. That is Cemetery Road there, and that is Kaohe Homesteads. We have got the numbers there right now. If I had to accept a configuration that was east/west, using Highway 130 as a boundary; that would work for my community, as far as being internal roads. It is still not what I prefer in terms of the mauka/makai configuration.

MR. KANUHA: René, is it even possible to make a mauka/makai?

CHR. SIRACUSA: I think it is, I think it is. Can we zoom back and take a look at this? What I would really like to see is everything---I am going to come down to the table.

MR. KANUHA: Sorry, René, I don't know if I wanted to bring that up right now, to actually draw the mauka/makai.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I think I can do that fairly quickly. I am trying to lay my plan into here but obviously it is going to take too long to do during the course of this meeting. So, I would like to just put that aside for now; I will work on it at home and then come back next time. It's been a long day for all of us, so I'm going to get back up there.

MR. MELROSE: Yes, come up here and let's get back to business. What you did there; how different is it than what was there? Oh, the ocean is purple, that's big.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Don't worry about the ocean, because nobody lives there.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Save this.

MR. MELROSE: Do you want to save it that way?

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Save it this way.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Save it this way and then we can work on it some more.

MR. MELROSE: This is going to look really bad on the web site. Go backwards a ways.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Oh yeah, okay, let's go back to where it was originally and I'll work on it later, independently. If you saw the configuration that I had done in the RS3 Plan, and I would like as close as possible, without maybe changing the other boundaries, just reconfiguring District 5 and 4 to make it fit that mauka/makai configuration.

MR. MELROSE: Just for consistency sake, can we take that little triangle out there, the summit of Mauna Loa, and put it into District 6, or District 7.

CHR. SIRACUSA: It doesn't matter, nobody is there. So just undo what I did there.

MR. MELROSE: She did.

CHR. SIRACUSA: It is now 4:15 p.m. and how does the Commission feel about calling it a day?

MR. MELROSE: I think a couple of things, Madam Chair. I think we need a motion to close file on Communication 48 and all related Communications.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yes, not a motion to close file, we had that motion; we need to vote on it.

MR. MELROSE: Okay, right, call for the question. Then we can come back to Unfinished Business.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I didn't want to call for that vote until I asked how everybody felt about it.

The motion to close file on COMM. 48 and all related Communications was carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiola'a,  
—Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth,  
Poindexter, and Chair Siracusa.

Noes: None.

Absent: Commissioners Kahui and Ugalde.

### **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

CHR. SIRACUSA: We have no unfinished business.

MR. MELROSE: Where do we want to go from here; would this be the place to have that conversation?

CHR. SIRACUSA: Probably, sure.

MR. MELROSE: Okay, then I think in Unfinished Business, what we need to say is that we now have Commission Plan A and Commission Plan B, and that the next step is for us to continue to work on some of the details. The Kona guys are going to work on a good boundary in the Kona district. I think probably Commissioners for District 2 and 3 need to work on the alignment in the Hilo area, and then the Puna one needs to find a way. So we should come to the next meeting solutions on those topics, so that we are not fumbling on it, we know kind of where we would like it to go. So we should save this a B and post it so we can pick it up.

CHR. SIRACUSA: And that has been done already. Has it been saved as Commission Plan B? Okay.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Those of us who work on plans, can post them. We can send them to Karen and she can post them, and everybody else can look at them and do modifications if they want to, as long as you re-number them so that everybody knows what they are.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Karen.

MS. EOFF: If Shyla can email Commission's Plan A and Commission's Plan B to me today, I will go into my office tomorrow and post them on the web site in a folder that says Commission's Draft Plans. Then you can get them out of there and do your changes.

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Terrific.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Very good. Okay, is there any other Unfinished Business?

## **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

### **COMM. 49: DATES AND TIMES FOR REDISTRICTING COMMISSION MEETINGS AND PUBLIC HEARINGS**

From Commission Chair René Siracusa, dated October 28, 2011, to discuss the date, time, and location of upcoming regular meetings and public hearings.

Ms. Poindexter moved to close file on  
COMM. 49. Seconded by Mr. Melrose.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Is there any discussion?

MR. MELROSE: So what I understand that to be is that we have one on the 10<sup>th</sup>. What are the dates currently?

CHR. SIRACUSA: November 10, 2011 is our next meeting, at 10:00 a.m. here in the Hilo Council Chambers.

MR. MELROSE: That is next Thursday. And then we have two public hearings. Our goal is that we will make a decision on our Draft Plan at our next meeting. Do we have the dates set for the public hearings?

CHR. SIRACUSA: Yes.

MR. MELROSE: Alright.

MR. CARVALHO: Our Final Plan is due to be completed on November 30, 2011, is that it?

MR. MELROSE: That is when we decide on the Plan, but when the Final Plan is completed by Elections, do we not have to approve the Final Report?

MR. MIDDLESWORTH: Somebody has got to write it.

CHR. SIRACUSA: We have go to write the Final Report.

MR. MELROSE: Well, who is "we?"

CHR. SIRACUSA: Where is Michael? Am I the one who writes it?

MR. UDOVIC: I'll be working on that in conjunction with René.

CHR. SIRACUSA: I have some things that I definitely want to put on record in there.

MR. MELROSE: Yes, I think we should put some things in, including maybe some suggestions on the Bill.

CHR. SIRACUSA: And some suggestions about contacting the Census Department about doing a better job of it in the future.

MS. NAKAMOTO: I just wanted some clarification. The Draft Plan will be approved on November 10, 2011?

MR. MELROSE: The Plan that we are going to take to the two public hearings.

MS. NAKAMOTO: Okay, that will be decided on November 10, 2011. Then, on November 30, 2011, the Final Plan will be---

CHR. SIRACUSA: After the two public hearings, we may want to do a little bit more tweaking to that Draft Plan to make it into the Final Plan.

MS. NAKAMOTO: And you are going to vote on your Final Plan on---

CHR. SIRACUSA: On November 30, 2011. And then you can start your job.

MR. MELROSE: I don't think we will have the report done by November 30, 2011. The report will follow?

MR. UDOVIC: The report will be done and filed by December 30, 2011.

MR. MELROSE: Do we need to approve that Final Report as a Commission? Do we have to meet to do that?

MR. UDOVIC: We should probably have a meeting scheduled sometime in December; we can do that at our next meeting

CHR. SIRACUSA: Mike and I will work on the Plan and we will distribute a first draft to the other Commissioners for comment; we might have left something out that we want to mention. We want to make sure that all our bases are covered and that we have thoroughly given our reasoning for every decision that we made.

MS. NAKAMOTO: I just wanted to be sure that the maps will be ready for the public hearings.

MR. MELROSE: How long does that take? Will we do another similar display like we did for the public hearings; or will you make a bigger set of maps for the final public hearings, with details of each of the interfaces?

MS. NAKAMOTO: We are going to do the same for both public hearings.

MR. MELROSE: But like the last one, where there was just a little booklet for each one, or are you going to throw large maps on the wall?

MS. NAKAMOTO: Yes, we are going to put the large maps on the wall.

MR. MELROSE: With individual areas showing the boundaries.

MS. NAKAMOTO: What we are planning on doing is having an island view map and nine of the council districts, having their own maps, separate maps, individual maps for the nine council districts and an island view. So, ten maps.

CHR. SIRACUSA: So those individual maps for each district would have as much detail as possible.

MS. NAKAMOTO: That is correct.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Are there any other comments, Commissioners? In that case, let's vote on closing file on Communication 49.

The motion to close file on COMM. 49 was carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiola'a, Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth, Poindexter and Chair Siracusa.

Noes: None.

Absent: Commissioners Kahui and Ugalde.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, at 4:40 p.m., Ms. Poindexter moved to adjourn the meeting. Seconded by Mr. Melrose and carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Carvalho, Kahawaiola'a, Kanuha, Melrose, Middlesworth, Poindexter and Chair Siracusa.

Noes: None.

Absent: Commissioners Kahui and Ugalde.

CHR. SIRACUSA: Motion carries. Thank you very much Commissioners

Respectfully Submitted,

Karen Eoff, Secretary

Approved on November 10, 2011:

Ms. René Siracusa, Chair  
Hawai'i County Redistricting Commission